MBNMS Research Activity Panel
Meeting Summary
September 13, 2013

Host: Aimee David – Marine Policy (Monterey Bay Aquarium)

Location: Ocean View Conference Room
Monterey Bay Aquarium
886 Cannery Row
Monterey, CA 93940

Date: Friday, September 13th, 2013; 9:00 am to 12:00 pm

Members:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discipline</th>
<th>Primary/Alternate</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X Research Coordinator</td>
<td>DeVogelaere, Andrew</td>
<td>Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biological Oceanography</td>
<td>primary</td>
<td>Kudela, Raphael</td>
<td>University of California, Santa Cruz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biological Oceanography</td>
<td>alternate</td>
<td>Chavez, Francisco</td>
<td>Monterey Bay Aquarium Research Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X Deep-Sea Ecology</td>
<td>primary</td>
<td>Cailliet, Greg</td>
<td>Moss Landing Marine Laboratories (retired)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X Deep-Sea Ecology</td>
<td>alternate</td>
<td>Haddock, Steve</td>
<td>Monterey Bay Aquarium Research Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X Estuarine Ecology</td>
<td>primary</td>
<td>Lindley, Steve</td>
<td>NOAA Fisheries Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estuarine Ecology</td>
<td>alternate</td>
<td>Wasson, Kerstin</td>
<td>Elkhorn Slough NERR and Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fisheries</td>
<td>primary</td>
<td>Grimes, Churchill</td>
<td>NOAA Fisheries Service (retired)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fisheries</td>
<td>alternate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marine &amp; Coastal Geology</td>
<td>primary</td>
<td>Storlazzi, Curt</td>
<td>United States Geological Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marine &amp; Coastal Geology</td>
<td>alternate</td>
<td>Paull, Charles</td>
<td>Monterey Bay Aquarium Research Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marine Conservation Biology</td>
<td>primary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marine Conservation Biology</td>
<td>alternate</td>
<td>Micheli, Fiorenza</td>
<td>Hopkins Marine Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marine Policy</td>
<td>primary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X Marine Policy</td>
<td>alternate</td>
<td>David, Aimee</td>
<td>Monterey Bay Aquarium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X Nearshore Ecology</td>
<td>primary</td>
<td>Lindholm, James†</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nearshore Ecology</td>
<td>alternate</td>
<td>Carr, Mark</td>
<td>University of California, Santa Cruz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Oceanography</td>
<td>primary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X Physical Oceanography</td>
<td>alternate</td>
<td>Ramp, Steve</td>
<td>Soliton Ocean Services, Inc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X Shelf &amp; Slope Ecology</td>
<td>primary</td>
<td>Sogard, Susan</td>
<td>NOAA Fisheries Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shelf &amp; Slope Ecology</td>
<td>alternate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Sciences</td>
<td>primary</td>
<td>Pomeroy, Caroline</td>
<td>California Sea Grant Extension Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X Social Sciences</td>
<td>alternate</td>
<td>Scorse, Jason</td>
<td>Monterey Institute of International Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X Water Quality</td>
<td>primary</td>
<td>Hunt, John†</td>
<td>University of California, Davis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water Quality</td>
<td>alternate</td>
<td>Epel, David</td>
<td>Hopkins Marine Station</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Sanctuary Advisory Council Member: Research (Primary)
†Sanctuary Advisory Council Member: Research (Alternate)

RAP Coordinator:

X Burton, Erica | Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary
GUESTS:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aiken, Emily</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Albers, Kelsey</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bradley, Erin</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C., Justin</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carlson, Robyn</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Devilla, Sarah</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elliot, Rebecca</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fredle, Molly</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grimmer, Karen</td>
<td>Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hoffmann, Gary</td>
<td>MBNMS Advisory Council (At-Large)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hoover, Bridget</td>
<td>Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hopkins, Kate</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jew, Matthew</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leary, Marilyn</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifland, David</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malinis, Lauren</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melgoza, Jorge</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moye, Flower</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perales, Brynn</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rodriguez, Nichole</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rosevelt, Carolyn</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Santos, Charles</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schmidt, Marty</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shafer, Ashleigh</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spring, Margaret</td>
<td>Monterey Bay Aquarium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Takata, Mitchell</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thunholm, Breanna</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tobosa, Lauren</td>
<td>California State University Monterey Bay</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CONSENT ITEMS

Introductions/Modifications to the Agenda (Lindholm)

HOST PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION

Monterey Bay Aquarium Conservation and Science Update (Margaret Spring/MBA)

- Spring provided brief history of aquarium
  - Opened 1984; 450 employees; >1200 volunteers
- Discussed Aquarium’s role in ocean conservation
- New organizational structure in 2013
  - Past: Center for Future of Oceans; different visions, separate programs
  - Now: ”Conservation and Science Division”; Brings together policy, Seafood Watch, conservation research
- Aquarium’s major program areas
  - Conservation and Science
  - Exhibits
  - Husbandry
  - Education and Visitor Experience
- Will continue to take stock and shift focus
- Current policy activities
- Ocean wildlife
  - Shark fin trade ban
  - Sea otter recover plan
  - Ocean plastics
- Ocean governance and funding
  - National Ocean Policy & West Coast Governors Agreement
- Marine Protected Areas (Marine Life Protection Act)
- Conservation Research: Looking Ahead
  - Focus on species (and ecosystem)
    - Bluefin Tuna, White Shark, Sea otter
  - Recruit Leadership
  - Review Strategy and Collaborations
  - Improve Science Communications, Outreach

PRESENTATION REQUESTED BY RAP

MBNMS-related Desalination Activities (Bridget Hoover/MBNMS)
- Hoover provided brief history of MBNMS interest, guidelines, and involvement including:
  - Desalination Action Plan
  - Desalination Feasibility Study for Monterey Bay Region
  - Desalination Guidelines
- Desalination concerns
  - Impingement and entrainment of marine organisms
  - Discharge of saline brine and other by-products
  - Alteration of seafloor (on or beneath) by construction
- MBNMS involvement includes:
  - Tracking projects within Monterey Bay
    - Santa Cruz – Soquel Creek; [www.scwd2desal.org](http://www.scwd2desal.org)
  - Coordinating regulatory discussions with other local, state and federal agencies
  - Tracking research efforts
  - Tracking SWRCB Ocean Plan amendment
- Research needs include:
  - Long-term chronic effects of brine discharges, specifically effects on the benthic communities
  - Mixing hypersaline concentrations with effluent from publicly owned treatment works (POTW) and power plants to better understand real world conditions and if there might be any synergistic effects from the effluent
- For more info see: [http://montereybay.noaa.gov/resourcepro/resmanissues/desalination.html](http://montereybay.noaa.gov/resourcepro/resmanissues/desalination.html)

STAFF REQUEST TO RAP

Discussion of System-wide Monitoring (Lindholm)
- Lindholm provided background on issue related to NMS Condition Reports
- CINMS SAC sent letter to ONMS Science Coordinator (Gittings)
Essentially, expert opinion should not be used in lieu of monitoring

• Discussion: How does MBNMS RAP want to respond
• General agreement: expert opinion should not replace monitoring
• Options:
  o Provide feedback to Bob Warner (CINMS SAC)
  o MBNMS SAC could elevate issue
  o When red color, insert shape within to indicate opinion or data-based
• Lindholm: Would RAP be comfortable providing letter to MBNMS SAC? Yes
• **ACTION:**
  o RAP will send points made today to Lindholm
  o Lindholm drafts letter for RAP review (via email), to include agreement w/CINMS statements; and suggestions on how to improve reports
  o Lindholm presents at future SAC meeting

**MBNMS UPDATE**

**Essential Fish Habitat (EFH) Proposal (Karen Grimmer/MBNMS)**

• Grimmer provided brief overview related to groundfish EFH 5-yr review
• West coast sanctuaries (Monterey Bay, Gulf of the Farallones, Olympic Coast) engaging in comment process (separate proposals); Channel Islands and Cordell Bank requesting no changes
• Goals of MBNMS proposal
  o Use new data to identify and add sensitive habitats to EFH Conservation Areas
  o Restore historically fished trawling grounds
  o Build trust and produce working relationship between MBNMS, fishermen, conservation organizations
• Proposal stakeholder group included fishermen, NGOs, MBNMS
• Collaborative proposal submitted to EFH review committee in August
  o Spatial modifications (add and remove)
  o Voluntary management areas (pilot project)
  o Changes to enforcement
  o Research and monitoring to collect baseline visual data in modified areas (future plan with research community)
• Next steps
  o EFH review committee provides comments to Pacific Fisheries Management Council
  o Council decides if move forward w/ Fishery Management Plan amendment (November meeting)
  o MBNMS continues to work within Council process
  o MBNMS EFH stakeholder group continues to meet to discuss voluntary areas

**SANCTUARY ADVISORY COUNCIL UPDATE**

Summary of August 21st SAC Meeting at Half Moon Bay (Lindholm)

• Lindholm provided brief summary
• Joint meeting with GFNMS, items of interest included:
  o Shark attraction permits (science and ecotourism)
EFH proposal
Condition Reports
Ship strikes and whales

- SAC minutes available at: [http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/sac_min.html](http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/sac_min.html)

**RAP MEMBERSHIP UPDATE**

Membership Update (DeVogelaere)
- New Member: Susan Sogard (Shelf and Slope Ecology)
- Lindley (primary) and Wasson (alternate) swapped Estuarine Ecology seats
- Open seats
  - Fisheries (alternate)
  - Marine Conservation Biology (primary)
  - Marine Policy (primary)
  - Physical Oceanography (alternate)
  - Shelf & Slope (alternate)
- **ACTION**: If RAP has ideas how to fill open seats, let DeVogelaere know

**SUGGESTED FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

- DeVogelaere interested in existing item: Oil spills and long-term monitoring programs
- Update list of NRDA collaborators
- Lindholm: ask Steve Gittings (HQ) to provide info on leadership changes at Big NOAA, and how affects little NOAA

*******************************************************************************

Future Agenda Items (running list):
- MBNMS Updates:
  - Sanctuary Ecologically Significant Areas (SESAs)
  - Integrated Ecosystem Assessment (IEA)
- Results of sand mining plant study (Scorse)
- Results of Pleasure Point Surf property value (Scorse)
- WQ monitoring web portals: Ocean Health for CA (per Hunt)
- Sept/Nov 2013 meeting: regional water board on assessment of monitoring data for 12 years at coastal confluences (30 streams/rivers); report written July 2013; (per Hunt)
- Leadership changes at Big NOAA, and how affects little NOAA (MBNMS)
- Oil spills and long-term monitoring programs
  - Update list of NRDA collaborators

*******************************************************************************