

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

June 17, 2022

Final Meeting Minutes

VOTING MEMBERS

Agriculture: Absent	CA State Parks: Eric Abma
AMBAG: Jenny McAdams	Commercial Fishing: Absent
At-Large: Dan Haifley	Conservation: Rachel Kippen
At-Large: Gary Hoffmann	Diving: Brian Nelson
At-Large: PJ Webb	Education: Absent
Business & Industry: Tom Rowley (A)	Harbors: John Haynes
CA Coastal Commission: Absent	Recreation: Bart Selby (A)
CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife: Paul Reilly	Recreational Fishing: Jose Montes
CA EPA: Karen Mogus	Research: John Hunt
CA Resources Agency: Elyse Goyen	Tourism: Mike Bekker

NON-VOTING MEMBERS

Channel Islands NMS: Absent	Monterey Bay NMS: Lisa Wooninck
College: Jacob Winnikoff	Elkhorn Slough NERR: Absent
Greater Farallones and Cordell Bank NMS: Maria Brown	National Marine Fisheries Service: Steven Lindley
U.S. Coast Guard: absent	

ALTERNATES PRESENT

Cynthia Matthews – At-Large	Steve Haddock – Research
Gwen Kellas – At-Large	Chelsea Protasio – CA Dept of Fish & Wildlife
Keith Rootsart – Diving	Dawn Hayes – MBNMS

I. CALL TO ORDER

Approval of April Meeting Minutes: with editorial suggestions by Paul Reilly

Motion by Mike Bekker, seconded by Jose Montes

Yes: 13 No: 0 Abstain: 2

Motion passes

II. SUPERINTENDENTS' REPORTS

Superintendent Lisa Wooninck shared MBNMS highlights:

1. Fluctuating COVID community levels are the reason we are again meeting virtually. We will have the capacity to do hybrid meetings moving forward with new technologies.
2. Netflix Series is receiving great exposure for the sanctuary
3. Visitor centers in San Simeon and Santa Cruz have reopened
4. President's \$87M budget request recognizes ONMS needs (\$26M increase)
5. MBNMS 2022 Volunteer of the Year – Brian Nelson, congratulations for all of your work on the council and public engagement over the years.
6. Core Operations
 - a. Staffing changes (7 backfills underway)
 - b. Record intern engagement this summer

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

June 17, 2022

Final Meeting Minutes

- c. Initiating Greenhouse Gas Emission Inventory
 - d. Advisory Council Vessel incident subcommittee met and will again soon
 - e. Advisory Council Executive Committee election in August, be prepared with nominations
 - f. Advisory Council recruitment will commence in August for 2 At-Large primary seats, both Recreation seats and the primary Research seat. Your help will be needed for recruitment dissemination and subcommittee.
7. Research
- a. White shark research shows juvenile numbers increasing with increased ocean temps.
 - b. Endangered Black Abalone monitoring continues, as debris continues to spread from the initial flow impacting more abalone.
8. Education
- a. Visitor Centers reopen: CDC May 27, SEC June 16 with limited hours/days
 - b. 5 new staff for visitor centers hired
 - c. CDPR Outdoor Equity Program Grant Received, \$310K over 4 years, in partnership with National Marine Sanctuary Foundation
 - d. Upcoming Events
 - Saturday July 9: Get Into Your Sanctuary event with Shared Adventures at Cowell Beach, adding recreational fishing component off of the wharf, with Jose Montes and Adam Helm (10am-4pm)
 - Friday, August 5: USPS Day of Issuance: NMSS Anniversary Stamp Sheet (10am-11am)
 - Sunday, September 18: Sanctuary Fest at Cowell Beach (9am-3pm)
9. Resource Protection
- a. ACCESS cruise completed 7.5 transects from Monterey Bay to Pillar Point over 5 days.
 - b. 2022 Whale Entanglements
 - 11 confirmed in within MBNMS through April
 - CA Commercial Dungeness Crab fishery closed early April
 - Alternative gear testing continues
 - c. CWG requested balloon ban for graduations and Pajaro Valley Unified implemented
 - d. 2022 Harbor Seal season disturbances during pupping were resolved by swift communication and coordination by MBNMS, City of PG, kayak shops and Bay Net volunteers.

Superintendent Maria Brown shared Greater Farallones/ Cordell Bank highlights:

1. Conservation Science
 - a. Beach Watch 2021 surveys compiled
 - b. 2022 ACCESS season underway
 - c. GFNMS Condition Report workshops underway
 - d. \$2M appropriated for kelp restoration within GFNMS
2. Education and Outreach

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

June 17, 2022

Final Meeting Minutes

- a. Virtual programming (50 Programs in 50 states) is underway with 51 programs completed, reaching 1,231 students in 21 states to date.
 - b. Pt. Reyes Birding and Nature Festival participation
 - c. [Sea Your Future video series](#) launched, goal to highlight scientists of color to inspire students (former MBNMS staff member Brijonnay Madrigal is featured!)
3. Resource Protection
- a. Vessel Speed Reduction 2021 results in, with success
 - b. American Challenger salvage operation underway
 - c. Vessel Incidents Subcommittee
 - Seeking to develop recommendations to GFNMS in the form of regulatory changes, funding vessel removal, improving coordination with partner agencies and affected communities
 - 3 meetings completed and 3-4 meetings anticipated
 - d. CB/GFNMS Anniversary Events
 - July 9, Enjoy Spectacular! Crab Fishing Family Workshop
 - Sept 24, Sharktoberfest
 - Oct 22, 50th anniversary at Crissy Field

III. NMSF ANNIVERSARY EVENTS – Dan Haifley

1. July 4 – Sept 19 Series of Monday columns on the history of MBNMS at SC Sentinel, Monterey Herald and montereybayfoundation.org
2. Sept 17: Anniversary Gala (new film, book and music developed for the event)
3. Sept 18: Community Celebration on SC Wharf
4. Oct (date TBD): VIP Reception in Monterey

IV. OCEAN ACIDIFICATION IN SANCTUARIES - Katie Wrubel

OCNMS's Vulnerability assessment will be extensive looking at 50 species, the 6 habitats in the condition report and maritime resources, all of which will feed into the management plan review process later this year. OCNMS Oceanographic mooring program is starting its 23rd year, with 10 sites spanning 120 miles and range from 15-42 meters in depth. They monitor for temperature, oxygen, salinity and depth and are deployed during the upwelling season May-Sept. Data products and models are developed from the assessment and feed into the Condition Report and Climate Vulnerability Assessment in addition to partner research, publication and funding requirements. An Ocean Acidification Resource Collection has been developed for educators with lesson plans and activities for varied grade levels. This collection includes webinars and videos, plankton monitoring exercises, virtual reality and many other resources.

OCNMS was designated as an Ocean Acidification Sentinel Site (OASes) in 2019 but underwent a 10-year process with the staff, Intergovernmental Policy Council, advisory council, and state partners to develop seven priority recommendations for climate-related activities. Sentinel sites are geographic areas focused on specific topics where coordinated observations and applied science by federal, tribal, state, academic, and community members enable early detection of ecosystem change in response to human or natural disturbance. Some of the 2021 highlights include: A finalized prioritized work plan, several relevant funding proposals submitted, draft tiered budget and hosted first Symposium. Next steps include integrating symposium takeaways

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

June 17, 2022

Final Meeting Minutes

in the work plan, completing OASeS Website, enhancing community outreach and engagement, hosting quarterly virtual meetings and biannual symposiums.

Resources from presentation:

[NOAA Ocean Acidification Program Regional Vulnerability Assessment](#)

[OCNMS Sentinel Site for Ocean Acidification](#)

[The Olympic Coast as a Sentinel - Tribal Communities at the Forefront of Ocean Change](#)

[West Coast Ocean Acidification and Hypoxia Monitoring Network](#)

[CA Ocean Acidification and Hypoxia Science Task Force](#)

[CA Ocean Acidification Action Plan](#)

[Teacher OA Resources](#)

[NOAA CO2 Study](#)

Q: Are there actions for non-climate stressors?

A: The vulnerability assessment is analyzing some of this and allows us to hone in and understand where the stress is coming from. Carbon emission reductions are the key.

Q: Are you aware of any studies of larval Dungeness crab?

A: Yes, the University of Connecticut is doing this, it is a huge focus. They are already seeing scarring on larvae.

Comment: Timeline for becoming a sentinel site looked to be 10 years – thank you for the commitment to this process and the work the team is doing.

V. PUBLIC COMMENT

There should be more participation by the Coastal Commission at MBNMS Advisory Council meetings and advisory council attendance should be reported annually.

VI. DIVERSIFICATION OF THE MBNMS ADVISORY COUNCIL – Lisa Wooninck

Lisa requested the council form a subcommittee to review recommendations already developed by several sources in order to put together a list of relevant recommendations for MBNMS Advisory Council Recruitment. This will be an action item at the August meeting.

Mike Bekker, Keith Rootseart, Jenny McAdams, Rachel Kippen, Jose Montes and PJ Webb will form the committee, Dawn Hayes will be staff support.

Comment: many times we barely have the applications we need with the current process.

Comment: the recruitment will only reflect the advertisement we do

Response: we will need the help of the advisory council to get the word out

Q: Will this diversity committee be for more than recruitment, as we need to do more to ensure we maintain the needs throughout their tenure?

A: This committee will focus on the immediate needs of recruitment but overall diversity, equity and inclusion will be important to follow through with our operations.

Comment: Some of our seats do not lend themselves to diverse representation. (Noted)

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

June 17, 2022

Final Meeting Minutes

Motion to form a Diversity and Inclusion Subcommittee was made by Jose Montes and seconded by PJ Webb.

Yes: 16 No:0 Abstain: 0

Motion Passes

VII CLIMATE AND MARITIME RESOURCES - Madeline Roth

Maritime resources are both intangible and tangible and all sanctuaries have heritage resources. How is climate affecting these important resources? Not sure, so a gap analysis was conducted by literature search, is in review and will be published in the next year. Five elements examined: Ocean Acidification, Ocean Warming/Changing Biological Communities, Rising Seas/Changing Water Levels, Intensifies Storm Events, and Potentially Polluting Resources.

Some early results were shared and “silver linings” include: Threatened heritage and ‘forgotten heritage’ develops value because of its future loss, opportunities to actively engage stakeholder communities to make a difference, if prioritized, we broaden our understanding of heritage resources and associated communities, in recognizing loss, preservation is redefined & creates real opportunities to ‘dig in,’ and the irony of coastal loss is that targeted resources are those that contain a material record of human resilience and adaptation.

When we undertake climate research, we need to be able to make informed decisions. We need to make decisions based on what these resources mean to the community – sometimes we need to figure out how to let something go gracefully and focus on the intangible side of it. Future plans include the need to develop new climate change focused modeling, monitoring, support partner research and to develop community-based monitoring programs. The future started yesterday and we are already late.

Discussion included how to identify and protect maritime resources (do not remove – even if the goal is to preserve). Underwater is best until the disposition can be determined and to please notify sanctuary staff about anything you discover.

Comment: there were a lot of artifacts related to Ft Ord that have been cleaned up, but there are still likely items out there, so be sure to report anything.

VIII. GFNMS CLIMATE VULNERABILITY ASSESSMENT – Sara Hutto

Sara Hutto is with Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary (GFNMS) but works with sites across the system on climate issues. GFNMS did an initial vulnerability assessment 8 years ago and is in the process of updating it. Sara defined the terms climate vulnerability and vulnerability assessments and outlined what they can help us with and what they cannot. She broke out the components of vulnerability: exposure, sensitivity and adaptive capacity in marine resources and how they conducted their assessment and how it will feed into the development of a new management plan, as an assessment looks at the future condition of resources using current condition plus projected climate change impacts.

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

June 17, 2022

Final Meeting Minutes

Coastal resources were ranked as more sensitive than offshore resources, so they are focusing climate planning efforts on those things. Kelp was not identified in 2013/14, and everything changed recently, spurring the update of the assessment.

They aim to decrease exposure and sensitivity and increase adaptive capacity to hopefully decrease the resource's vulnerability.

Sara.hutto@noaa.gov

Q: Would the seaweed *Desmarestia* (acid weed) affect ocean acidification?

A: Interesting question but she doesn't know if there is a correlation and will have to look into that.

1:10 adjournment