

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

April 15, 2022

Meeting Minutes

VOTING MEMBERS

| | |
|--|-------------------------------------|
| Agriculture: Sarah Lopez | CA State Parks: Eric Abma |
| AMBAG: Jenny McAdams | Commercial Fishing: Kathy Fosmark |
| At-Large: Dan Haifley | Conservation: Rachel Kippen |
| At-Large: Gary Hoffmann | Diving: Brian Nelson |
| At-Large: PJ Webb | Education: Pamela Neeb Wade |
| Business & Industry: Tom Rowley (A) | Harbors: absent |
| CA Coastal Commission: Tammi Grove | Recreation: Gary Pezzi |
| CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife: Paul Reilly | Recreational Fishing: Adam Helm (A) |
| CA EPA: Peter Von Langen | Research: John Hunt |
| CA Resources Agency: Elyse Goyen | Tourism: Mike Bekker |

NON-VOTING MEMBERS

| | |
|---|---|
| Channel Islands NMS: absent | Monterey Bay NMS: Lisa Wooninck |
| College: absent | Elkhorn Slough NERR: Dan Brumbaugh (A) |
| Greater Farallones and Cordell Bank NMS: Brian Johnson | National Marine Fisheries Service: absent |
| U.S. Coast Guard: absent | |

ALTERNATES PRESENT

| | |
|-------------------------------|-------------------------|
| Cynthia Matthews – At-Large | Bart Selby – Recreation |
| Felicia Van Stolk – Education | Dawn Hayes – MBNMS |
| Keith Rootsart – Diving | |

I. CALL TO ORDER

Peter Von Langen was welcomed as CA EPA's new representative to the advisory council.

Approval of April Meeting Minutes: with editorial suggestions by Paul Reilly

Motion by Dan Haifley, seconded by PJ Webb

Yes: 13 No: 0 Abstain: 1

Motion passes

Superintendents' Report

Lisa Wooninck – Superintendent, shared a Superintendent's Report for MBNMS. Highlights included:

1. Hot Topic: Netflix launch of [Our Great National Parks](#), Narrated by President Barack Obama. Episode 4 is dedicated to MBNMS
2. Operations
 - a. MBNMS is hosting a COAST Intern to for Indigenous Community engagement
 - b. [2021 MBNMS Accomplishments Report](#) is now online
 - c. Dept of COmmerce issues a Return to work notice 4/25 for a slow reintegration

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

April 15, 2022

Meeting Minutes

- d. MBNMS Affiliate recruitment – 3 positions
 - i. [Advisory Council Coordinator Position](#)
 - ii. [Volunteer Coordinator / Education Specialist](#)
 - iii. Operations and Maintenance Specialist (coming soon)
 - e. Increasing emergency preparedness through staff training in basic life support
 - f. Vessel incident subcommittee met – Gary Hoffman identified as chair
3. Research
- a. Tanker Reef survey initiated early April, but weathered out, and rescheduled
 - b. CenCOOS and Marine Biodiversity Network collaborative publication being reviewed by staff
 - c. Hydrophone being deployed in southern SESA to fill soundscape gaps
 - d. MBARI/MBNMS Expedition continued work in octopus garden, deployed instrumentation
4. Education
- a. Whalefest Event a success, participated in science symposium and hosted a booth
 - b. Visitor Center reopening planning way, building back staff, getting center systems and exhibits prepped
 - c. Upcoming Events:
 - i. 20th Annual Snapshot Day May 2 – training is next week.
 - ii. Saturday July 9: Shared Adventures, Cowell Beach
 - iii. Friday August 5: USPS Day of Issuance for ONMS stamp series
 - iv. Sunday, September 18 Sanctuary Fest on the Santa Cruz Wharf
 - d. Sound exhibit installed at Coastal Discovery Center in partnership with MBARI
5. Resource Protection
- a. Emergency Response work with vessels continues
 - b. Spike in whale entanglements
 - c. Recreational Salmon season, special emphasis enforcement patrols conducted in Santa Cruz, Moss Landing and Pillar Point, emphasis on ESA protected species.

Brian Johnson – Deputy Superintendent for Greater Farallones and Cordell Bank NMSs shared their report. Highlights included:

- 1. Conservation Science
 - a. Contributed to Coast Deep Sea Coral Guide
 - b. Condition Reports for both sanctuaries are underway (CB in peer review; GF initiated process)
- 2. Education
 - a. Updated Bear Valley VCtr exhibits (CA MPAs, Whale Shipstrikes, Wildlife viewing)
 - b. 50 programs in 50 states – ONMS grant to reach one school in all 50 states

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

April 15, 2022

Meeting Minutes

- c. Virtual and in person teaching continues at visitor center (soft opening for classes, public to follow)
3. Resource Protection
 - a. Whale ship strikes – regional effort to slow traffic is being proposed to extend through November
 - b. GFA received a \$2M kelp restoration grant
 - c. *American Challenger* salvage operations planning for summer

NOAA building in PG (resolution)

Discussion of what could be done now that the sale went through. Decided to move forward with resolution to go on the record being against the sale based on a number of factors outlined in the resolution.

Motion by: PJ Web Seconded by: Dan Haifley

Yes: 11 No: 1 Abstain: 2

Resolution passed.

Diversity and Inclusion

Irma Cuevas (CBNMS AC Vice Chair/City of Santa Rosa)

Cultural Bridges: Cultivating Equity in the Outdoors

Irma Cuevas, shared her personal experiences growing up bi-culturally in the US and Mexico, her professional background and her work as Wraparound Coordinator for the City of Santa Rosa. She outlined her thesis research: Heritage in the Outdoors, Creating a Cultural Bridge between the Latino Community and Parks, which pointed to the different ways we all view nature, how we engage with it and conservation. She noted, “We have to provide spaces for experiences,” and concluded with the importance of identifying our priority audience, who serves them, who our partners are for engagement and determining how best to collaborate and be symbiotic.

It is not Inclusion if you invite people to a space you are unwilling to change – Muna Abdi

Rachel Kippen (MBNMS AC Conservation Primary)

From Theory to Practice: Diversity, Equity, Inclusion and Justice Principles in Action in MBNMS

Rachel shared her background growing up native Hawaiian and her professional background. She led an icebreaker where we were asked to give one word to describe an ideal sanctuary experience and one to describe a person you admire. Then shared the answers of people from different cultures, highlighting how differently we view nature, sanctuary and admirable qualities. She emphasized the focus on equity is not a new trend and its relevance to science as well as the need to acknowledge where we are with our ideas and perceptions. Rachel gave the example of a Fresno family coming to the beach and their paradigm, which differed significantly from a coastal family.

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

April 15, 2022

Meeting Minutes

We need to be very aware of harmful and inaccurate stereotypes, recognizing our own privilege. The Advisory Council's shared privilege is having the ability to influence the sanctuary's decision making. Who's NOT at the council table at this time? Indigenous communities and more members of the Latino community. Considerations for sanctuary management include the need for a budget to do this, the creation of an Ad-Hoc working group and a clear work plan.

Lisa Wooninck recommended the council make diversity and inclusion an agenda item next meeting and put together an ad hoc working group to address some of the ways we can create more diversity and inclusion on our council.

Comment: We need to find better ways to reach these communities and sources of new members. It is critical for each of the AC members to reach out to others to share about the council. We are all hoping for this goal.

Comment: There are a lot of white women and men in marine biology. This has to do with equity movements that are specific to whites. We need to make women and women of color feel safe in bringing their ideas to the table and be accepted.

Ad hoc Indigineous Communities Working Group

ONMS recently completed its Roadmap to Engaging Indigenous Communities. Sanctuary superintendents who are not already engaged have been counseled to approach our local indigenous communities in a very measured manner. MBNMS needs to do some planning first and create a strategy for engagement. There will be AC involvement and we will engage the AC at the right time. PJ has contacts who are interested in helping us with this process.

Comment: we all care about the ocean and look forward to bringing new voices to the council to inform us. The indigenous perspective is critical to better stewardship.

Comment: In addition to equity for human beings, we need to advocate for better funding for protected ocean spaces (\$0.19/acre for oceans vs, \$30/acre for land based parks).

Marine debris

Jazmine Mejia-Munoz - MBNMS/California Marine Sanctuary Foundation

In partnership with the California Marine Sanctuary Foundation (and others) tools are being developed to implement the marine debris action plan. Jazmine Mejia-Munoz shared the latest successes the Agricultural Water Quality Program has had with Ag plastics. An assessment of marine debris confirmed a lot of agricultural plastic was in the watershed. Partners conducted stakeholder meetings to ID solutions and communicate with the growers and Ag community,

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council

April 15, 2022

Meeting Minutes

working with everyone from the manufacturers to end users about drip tape. This pilot has achieved 100% recycling of separated drip tape arriving at MRWMD!!!

Plastic mulch, while beneficial to farmers, is problematic for disposal. One potential solution is Soil-Biodegradable Mulch, which can be tilled into the soil at season end; eliminating plastic waste and disposal challenges. Currently looking at how it behaves in marine systems. Trials are promising and growers are satisfied with the results. High turnover crops pose a problem to full degradation. Seeking funding to support this work.

Question: Is there an incentive for recycling agricultural plastic?

Answer: Not at the moment, but when this program expands, the cost will go from \$90/ton to \$45/ton, resulting in cost savings.

Plastic pollution in Monterey Bay: from Water to Whales

Matthew Savoca (Naval Postgraduate School) and Lauren Kashiwabara (Ph.D student)

Lauren described her surface water study with microplastics concentrations where nearshore locations were higher than offshore. Matt then expanded down through the water column, referring to MBARI's report on vertical distribution of marine microplastics across the water column. Matt shared a map outlining the potential risk for plastic ingestion by different whales (Blue , Fin, Humpback(Fish) and Humpback (krill) based on depth of feeding events and the depth of plastics identified by MBARI. While it looks like whales are feeding in the highest pollution areas, it is hypothesized they are getting more plastic through ingestion of their prey.

Lauren's current studies look at plastic ingestion in elephant seals, showing much higher concentrations of ingested plastic than in the environment. Moving forward, she wants to see if there is a way to create a quantitative risk assessment for E-seals. Good luck to Lauren as she pursues her Ph.D.

1:57 meeting adjourned