

**MONTEREY BAY NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY
ADVISORY COUNCIL**

Final Meeting Minutes

April 19, 2019

Monterey Bay Aquarium Research Institute, Moss Landing, CA

VOTING MEMBERS

Agriculture: Sarah Lopez
AMBAG: Steve McShane
At Large: Dan Haifley
At Large: Gary Hoffmann
At Large: PJ Webb
Business & Industry: Tom Rowley
CA Coastal Commission: Tami Grove
CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife: Paul Reilly
CA EPA: Karen Mogus
CA Resources Agency: absent

CA State Parks: absent
Commercial Fishing: Kathy Fosmark
Conservation: Katherine O’Dea
Diving: Brian Nelson
Education: absent
Harbors: John Haynes
Recreation: Bart Selby
Recreational Fishing: Rich Hughett
Research: John Hunt
Tourism: Mike Bekker

NON-VOTING MEMBERS

Channel Islands NMS: absent
College: Jacob Winnikoff
Cordell Banks NMS: absent
Elkhorn Slough NERR: Dan Brumbaugh
Greater Farallones NMS: absent
Monterey Bay NMS: Paul Michel
National Marine Fisheries Service: Dr. Steve Lindley
U.S. Coast Guard: LT Darrina Willis

Alternates present in audience:

Carol Maehr – At-Large
Deb Wilson Vandenberg – CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife
Julia Dyer – CA EPA
Keith Rootsart – Diving
Jose Montes – Recreational Fishing
Steve Haddock – Research

I. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND MEETING MINUTES

Chair Brian Nelson called the meeting to order and Vice Chair PJ Webb attended to roll call.

Dr. Chris Scholin, Monterey Bay Aquarium Research Institute (MBARI) President and CEO, welcomed the MBNMS Advisory Council to MBARI. He mentioned the great opportunities the AC, MBARI and staff have to work together. He encouraged everyone to look for those opportunities to collaborate. He also mentioned MBARI’s newest Annual Report, which highlights the importance of partnership and collaboration.

New council members Steve McShane (AMBAG primary), Karen Mogus (CA Environmental Protection Agency primary) and Julia Dyer (CA Environmental Protection Agency alternate) were sworn in to the AC.

Nichole Rodriguez announced recruitment will be open April 22 through May 31

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

Approval of February 16, 2019 DRAFT Meeting Minutes

The advisory council approved the February DRAFT Meeting Minutes.

Dan Haifley introduced a motion to approve the February meeting minutes.

MOTION: Passed

Seconded by Bart Selby.

(Vote: 12 in favor, 0 opposed, 3 abstentions)

II. STANDING ITEM: Superintendent Report

Paul Michel mentioned he had the honor to speak at Dan Haifley's retirement party.

In October, MBNMS was a part of a research cruise on RV *Nautilus* just south of the Davidson Seamount zone. Using a ROV, a large octopus garden was discovered. MBNMS was invited to go back in March in Woods Hole Oceanographic Institute's Human Occupied Vehicle (HOV) *Alvin*. They wanted to get an idea of how big the area was. They believe the warm seeps (7-9 degrees Celsius above ambient temperature) in that area have attracted the octopi to brood there. MBNMS staff is committed to submit a draft of the Management Plan to ONMS Headquarters by June.

With the increased interest in cruise ships in Monterey Bay, MBNMS has met with various groups to discuss the policies regarding cruise ships and what MBNMS, City of Monterey, US Coast Guard and other agencies are doing to address cruise ships. MBNMS will be working with City of Monterey to coordinate a public forum to communicate the rules and regulations around cruise ships in Monterey Bay and the sanctuary.

ONMS' National Education/Communication meeting is coming up as well as the system wide leadership meeting. Paul will report the outcomes of these meetings at the next AC meeting.

Get Into Your Sanctuary is coming up August 2 through 4. This will be the 6th year of the event.

Paul encouraged any businesses interested in having event materials to contact Lisa Uttal.

A robust golf ball clean up mitigation plan was developed for Pebble Beach Company to implement. A commitment was also signed for future cleanups and education/outreach. Paul just received Pebble Beach Company's first report. This will be a five-year program. The goal is to get to the point where only new golf balls are being removed from the sanctuary because all older ones have already been removed.

III. PUBLIC COMMENT FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Carrie Larsen, community against cruise ships – we urgently need updated regulations and enforcement on cruise ships in the sanctuary.

Tyler Fox, Santa Cruz Waves – what's being done about cruise ships?

Brent Allen, Brent Allen Outside – potential for disaster, cruise ships being allowed in anchor area in inclement weather.

IV. STANDING ITEM: Member Announcements

Paul Reilly, CA Department of Fish & Wildlife primary: The Marine Region has released its 25-page, 2018 Year in Review, highlighting our major accomplishments. Here is the link:

<https://nrm.dfg.ca.gov/FileHandler.ashx?DocumentID=165778&inline>

We also have a Blog Post with frequent updates, through which the Year in Review may also be accessed:

<https://cdfwmarine.wordpress.com/2019/03/08/marine-regions-2018-year-in-review-now-available/>

April 6-7 was opening weekend for recreational salmon fishing in our area. Weather cooperated, and anglers were successful. Our California Recreational Fisheries Survey biologists interviewed 301 anglers; at Moss Landing, they averaged 1.1 salmon per person, and at Monterey they averaged 0.8 salmon per person. In the San Francisco and Monterey management areas, the minimum size limit is 24 inches total length. Continued concerns over the overfished status of Sacramento and Klamath River fall Chinook, as well as protections for threatened and endangered stocks, are expected to limit salmon seasons in certain times and areas this year. However, we believe that California's 2019 ocean salmon fishing season should be slightly better than last year's.

Earlier this week, Pacific Fishery Management Council adopted draft salmon management measures. Our sport season would end on August 28; minimum size 24 inches. Commercial season May 1-31, June 4-30, July 11-31; minimum size 27 inches.

Rockfish and lingcod season opened April 1 and anglers had little trouble finding fish.

On April 2, CDFW Director Charlton Bonham announced that the 2018-19 commercial Dungeness crab season would close statewide on April 15. Recreational Dungeness crab and other trap fisheries were not affected. A settlement agreement was recently announced in *Center for Biological Diversity v Bonham*. The agreement includes several interim management measures for the Dungeness crab fishery prior to formal implementation of the Risk Assessment Mitigation Program and issuance of an Incidental Take Permit from NMFS.

The Department is continuing to work on implementing a formal lost and abandoned commercial Dungeness crab trap gear retrieval program, which will augment existing derelict gear recovery efforts. The Working Group is soliciting new members, including a commercial Dungeness crab fishing representative from Santa Cruz. Contact info@cawhalegroup.com for more information. Additional updates regarding the Department's various Whale Safe Fishery efforts are available on a new dedicated webpage: www.wildlife.ca.gov/Conservation/Marine/Whale-Safe-Fisheries.

Coastal pelagic species landings in the Monterey area have been sparse due to bad weather. All effort in the area has been concentrated on Northern Anchovy with only a handful of vessels remaining in the area. As of April 15, 10% of the statewide quota has been landed. The 2018/19 directed sardine fishery year is closed but vessels are allowed to land 40% sardine in their CPS loads or minor directed landings for sardine (<1 mt) until total incidental landings reach 2,500 mt.

Deb Wilson-Vandenberg, CA Department of Fish & Wildlife alternate: announced this was her last AC meeting. She is retiring very soon. CDFW managers will be meeting next week to discuss her replacement.

Kathy Fosmark, Commercial Fishing primary: Dungeness crab fishery was closed April 15 as a result of litigation by *Center of Biological Diversity*. The suit was due to an incidental take permit not applied for. Fishermen intervened and the fishery was closed early. The salmon fishery is experiencing an uptick on the amount of days fishermen can fish due to an increase in salmon stocks.

Tom Rowley, Business/Industry alternate: attended a recent City of Monterey council meeting. There were a few comments from the public concerning cruise ships. Tom was able to debunk their comments. Tom mentioned his concern about the violation in 2017 mentioned during public comment today by Carrie Larssen since the AC had not heard of this violation prior to today. Tom expressed a public forum is a great idea.

Tom is a voluntary chair of a networking group in Monterey County consisting mostly of businesses Paul Michel is the guest speaker next Wednesday. Thanked Paul for carrying out his own challenge (the SAC Challenge) to promote MBNMS.

Tom mentioned permits for proposed water supply project for Monterey Peninsula. These permits are crucial to jobs, future housing and the economy. The Environmental Impact Report approved last September is being challenged by City of Marina and Marina Coast Water District all the way up to the Supreme Court. Lawsuits are pending. There is a deadline on the Monterey Peninsula to have a water project under construction by September or we will face 1,000 acre feet per year reduction in water supply. Another project, Pure Water Monterey, will recycle sewer water and starts this summer. The possible desalination plant at the old CEMEX space is facing permitting and litigation.

Dan Haifley, At-Large (northern region) primary: on April 25, comments are due to the US Department of Commerce on a proposal to weaken rules that currently provide for the ability of states to comment on plans to develop federal waters, generally 3 to 200 miles offshore, including proposals for offshore oil and gas development.

According to the Federal Register Notice of the proposed rule change, "Federal consistency is the provision of the Coastal Zone Management Act (CZMA) that federal actions (inside or outside a state's coastal zone) that have reasonably foreseeable effects on any land or water use or natural resource of the affected state's coastal zone must be consistent with the enforceable policies of the affected state's federally approved CZMA program." If you are interested in submitting comments, let Dan know.

Sarah Lopez, Agriculture alternate: Dane Harden's Sea Clean Program just received funding from Central Coast Water Board to resume work at Pajaro and Salinas River mouths. It is a long-term dataset important for evaluating legacy and current use of pesticides.

Have been seeing large acreages of vineyards removed and land fallowed. This is a disease issue but it is not certain if it is cyclical or a problematic disease. This can lead to soil erosion issues.

The Ag order renewal, dealing with agriculture impacts to water quality, expires March 2020. The water board has held two staff meetings to review the Ag order. Two more meetings are scheduled for May. The industry, now more than ever, is looking at expanding cooperative monitoring effort and targeted outreach.

Dan Brumbaugh, ESNERR alternate: noted Elkhorn Slough staff has planted 17,000 marsh plants as part of their marsh restoration project. This may be the largest marsh restoration experiment ever conducted.

Jacob Winnikoff, College primary: at a student and post-doc marine themed art event in March, Jacob surveyed student artists' interest in contributing to MBNMS outreach materials and content design.

He received input on how students prefer to be engaged, mainly in teams.

He was asked by the Student Post-Doc Marine Network to facilitate a sanctuary session, *Oceans Colloquium*, on May 11. It will be a 45-minute conversation as a panel to discuss how students and

post docs can contribute to sanctuary research, what sanctuary resources are available to students, etc. Jacob invited MBNMS staff Dr. Steve Lonhart, Dr. Andrew DeVogelaere and Dr. Jenn Brown.

Karen Mogus CA Environmental Protection Agency primary: staff is reviewing the California Ocean Plan. It was last reviewed in 2011. They will look for input on what needs to be changed, clarified, removed, etc. The plan prioritizes what the staff should be working on. The last plan tackled desalination, trash policies and Areas of Special Biological Significance (ASBS). The next plan they plan to revise the desalination plan and review ASBS exceptions. Lower priorities will include monitoring constituents of emerging concern, climate change, ocean acidification and harmful algal blooms.

Steve McShane, AMBAG primary: Earth Day will be celebrated in Seaside on April 28. There will be fifteen electric vehicles available to test drive

UC Master Gardeners event touring home gardens in Salinas on May 18.

Monterey Bay Community Power and Monterey Bay Air Resources District have teamed up for a Monterey Bay Electric Vehicle incentive program. You can receive up to a \$4,500 rebate on top of state and federal tax credits for purchasing an electric vehicle.

Monterey Bay Air Resources district is accepting nominations through May 1 for their annual Clean Air Leaders Award.

Tami Grove, California Coastal Commission (CCC) alternate: the commission continues to work on local hearings, local meetings, coastal development permits, etc.

Tami mentioned the CCC implements the Federal Consistency Provisions. It is important for managing coastal resources. It is how the CCC stopped limestone mining at Pico Blanco and a toll bridge in San Mateo. It is the only authority that allows the state to look at oil and gas development outside state waters.

PJ Webb, At-Large (southern region) primary: this has been a volatile season for northern elephant seals in San Simeon. It took many volunteers to keep people safe. They recently lost a valuable on-site naturalist position. PJ is going to Capitol Hill Oceans Week. She encouraged council members to let her know if they have any issues of interest to bring to the event. She will be attending with tribal members of Chumash.

Brian Nelson, Diving primary: diving is great in the bay right now. The SFO Dive Show is coming up on April 26th and 27th at the Santa Clara Convention Center. The Scuba Show is coming up on May 4th and 5th in Long Beach. He recently met with some people for a small photo contest. The 2.2 million gallon raw sewage spill from last year came up. Brian wanted to know who the investigating group was and what the status was of the investigation.

Karen Mogus mentioned the Regional Water Control Board and CA Office of Enforcement (part of the State Water Resources Control Board) working together. Julia Dyer offered to look more into the status of the investigation.

Gary Hoffmann, At-Large (central region) primary: harbor seal pupping season has started. BayNet has been educating the public at Hopkins Marine Station. A week ago a gray whale came into Moss Landing Harbor. He mentioned there is currently a pod of resident orcas from Canada in the area. He also mentioned there have been articles out recently discussing the under reporting of whale/boat

strikes. Many whales are being observed in San Francisco Bay. They are not continuing their migration and appear to be underweight.

The Monterey Bay Drones Automation and Robotic Technologies Symposium is being held at the Monterey Hyatt on June 21.

Katherine O'Dea, Conservation primary: five beach cleanups are happening Saturday, April 20. Save Our Shores will have a booth that day at the Earth Day event in San Lorenzo Park. Dr. Michael Graham will be presenting on restorative aquaculture at Moss Landing Marine Laboratories on May 1. There will be two marches on Oceans Day, June 8. One will be through Santa Cruz and one will be on the water on paddleboards.

Save Our Shores is recruiting for an education associate, an entry level position.

A snap app has been developed to take and submit pictures of sighted cigarette butts. This is part of a research project for Santa Cruz County.

Rich Hughett, Recreational Fishing primary: mentioned 4Ocean.com. The purchase of a \$20 bracelet made out of recycled plastic beads removes one pound of trash from the ocean and coastlines. He also requested an update on the Fishermen in the Classroom program. It has not been very active since Tucker Hirsch resigned from the AC.

Mike Bekker, Tourism primary: CalTrans is facing large fines if they don't start cleaning the roadways of trash.

He mentioned the council's oath to serve, protect and enhance. He feels we need to work on the enhancement. He suggested buying ad space possibly with Monterey-Salinas Transit buses.

There was a recent luncheon at Spanish Bay. MBNMS staff was missed.

The Good Old Days is coming up April 6-7 in Pacific Group. 10,000+ people pass through there. It may be an opportunity for MBNMS to table the event.

Lastly, he shared the US produces 250 million metric tons of trash each year which is the same as China. However, the US population is 330 million people while China's population is 1.4 billion.

John Hunt, Research primary: including announcements in the Research Activity Panel report

John Haynes, Harbors - Monterey: San Mateo County Harbor District is still moving forward with the Surfer's Beach nourishment pilot project and the hope to have permits to begin in the Spring of 2020. Pillar Point is also underway to create another beach nourishment project along the west trail in the Outer Harbor which would include natural erosion control and a living shoreline. Santa Cruz Harbor is busy dredging at the end of their seasonal window. The harbor mouth received a lot of sand sediment that came in with the winter storms. Moss Landing Harbor will be out to bid on a North Harbor dredging project soon. Monterey Harbor is getting busy with sailing activities and a busy start to the recreational salmon season. Monterey will be conducting a survey to aid in the next round of dredging planning and permitting.

Bart Selby, Recreation alternate: there was no Mavericks Challenge Surf Contest this year. The ocean is "coming back to life" with many babies. There were four recent pinniped births on the docks in Pillar Point. Dead gray whale washed up in Pacifica recently. Necropsy results have not determined death yet.

Steve Lindley, NMFS primary: The Pacific Fishery Management Council formed an ad-hoc working group on southern resident orcas, fish eating specialist whales mainly in Puget Sound. The working group will look at the current salmon fishery management plan to determine if it is protective of these whales. Can fisheries management be adjusted to provide more prey for these whales? There will be a series of meetings over the next few months. It will be announced in the Federal Register.

LT Darrina Willis, US Coast Guard alternate: conducting surge operations in support of the recreational salmon fishing season. There will be surge operations next month for the commercial salmon fishing season opener. LT Willis announced this is her last meeting. CDR Brand is also leaving.

Carol Maehr, At-Large (central region) alternate: effective April 22, the City of Monterey will implement their City Ordinance that requires food purveyors to stop using plastics that cannot be recycled. Recyclable plastics are numbered 1 or 2. Straws, stirrers, lids, take-out utensils and take-out containers must be made of compostable or recyclable plastics (1 or 2).

Surfrider, Monterey Bay Aquarium, Save the Whales and Sustainable Monterey put together information packets for all food purveyors, which volunteers distributed. Carol was one of those volunteers and was pleased to learn all eighteen restaurants she visited were already aware and using recyclable or compostable products.

On March 21, Carol started distributing MBNMS brochures. She has visited 26 establishments thus far. Within a week, Monterey Visitors Center on Lake El Estero called for more brochures after tourists took the 25 available. Carol restocked them with 75 brochures. Sixteen of the establishments would like a sanctuary poster for display and ten establishments requested to be added to the Recreation and Tourism newsletter. Carol noted when she visited Monterey Peninsula College's (MPC) Student Center; she learned MBNMS declined to participate in Monterey Peninsula College's Earth Day celebration. She also noted the Monterey Visitors Center requested to collaborate with MBNMS on their next "Responsible Tourism" display.

As a follow up to her February announcement regarding deteriorating plastic sandbags, she reported most of the easily accessible sandbags have been removed following a letter from the California Coastal Commission (CCC) to Greggs Marine. However, many sandbags are left and deteriorating. Carol is hoping to hear from CCC what more is being done to clean up the site. Lastly, Carol noted she observed plastic sandbags on the Pacific Grove rec trail in March.

Steve Haddock, Research alternate: mentioned a recent online article questioning if there was a new type of deep-sea jellyfish. It is actually a deep-sea tunicate (named after Jim Barry). The take home of this article demonstrates gaps in the knowledge of the deep-sea but also gaps in communication. Steve announced Jellywatch.org, a citizen science website, is back up and running.

Keith Rootsart, Diving alternate: he spoke at the Fish and Game Commission meeting in Santa Monica on April 17, regarding proposed Emergency Regulatory Language to increase recreational limits on purple urchins at Tanker's Reef. The petition was denied, but no reason was given for the recommended denial from CDFW.

Attended Pacific Grove's Good Old Days April 6. It was well attended and had many ocean related vendors.

Found plastic sand bags April 6 along a trail in Pacific Grove and brought it to the attention of Dawn Hayes and Karen Grimmer.

On April 13 whale watching boat passed close by the breakwater jetty in Monterey to look at seals and then passing over the meridium fields. Very dangerous to divers below.

Kahuna from Moss Landing was fishing for 20 minutes at Big Sur on April 1 when a passenger suffered a heart attack. Responders did CPR for 70 minutes while the boat went full speed around to Monterey. Why can't the wharf at Stillwater be available for emergencies? AEDs are not required equipment on commercial vessels. But can the Coast Guard provide local guidance on recommended AED equipment and emergency response ports? How can this be implemented?

Jose Montes, Recreational Fishing alternate: noted there is a lot of salmon in the bay today.

V. INFORMATION ITEM: Regional soundscape monitoring program

Dr. Lindsey Peavey Reeves, Channel Islands NMS Research Specialist, gave a presentation on characterizing sanctuary soundscapes through the regional soundscape monitoring program. She discussed what a soundscape is and instrumentation used including three types of hydrophones. She talked about the types of issues each hydrophone can address such as correlation between seal bombs and harbor porpoise detections, characterizing vessel traffic and sound level exposure for SCUBA divers. Dr. Peavey Reeves also mentioned current soundscape outreach opportunities through exhibits at sanctuary visitor centers. For more information:

<https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2019/190419/190419peavey-soundscape-ppt.pdf>

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

It was asked if the instruments can be used to identify and quantify marine mammal species through triangulation. Abundance and directionality is outside the scope of this monitoring program. A propagation model can be used to estimate distance of animals.

It was asked why seal bomb usage was integrated into the regional soundscape monitoring program. It is an issue of concern within multiple sanctuaries.

VI. INFORMATION ITEM: Acoustic monitoring in MBNMS

Dr. John Ryan, Senior Research Specialist at MBARI, gave a presentation on acoustic monitoring at the Monterey Accelerated Research System (MARS) cable. He gave updates on sound recording infrastructure, whale behavioral ecology, education and outreach and anthropogenic noise. These updates addressed the adopted recommendations from the MBNMS Advisory Council Ocean Noise Working Group.

Lisa Uttal, MBNMS Education Specialist, talked about the education and outreach being done at MBNMS' Sanctuary Exploration Center through a soundscape exhibit. It will be installed amongst existing exhibits.

For more information: <https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2019/190419/190419ryan-soundscape-ppt.pdf>

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

There were clarifying questions regarding seal bomb noise counts compared to fish landings data as well as analysis among varying songs among whale species.

Public Comment:

Brent Allen, Brent Allen Outside – the escalation of cruise ships to the Monterey Bay, underwater noise pollution, danger of incident.

VII. INFORMATION ITEM: Report from MBNMS adjacent harbors

John Haynes, City of Monterey Harbormaster, gave a presentation on harbor sediment projects and beneficial uses of sediment. John discussed one of the main reasons dredging in harbors needs to occur which is to allow vessels to safely exit and enter the harbor. The dredged sediment is used for building beaches back up after erosion. Monterey has two main disposal sites. One of those helps to protect housing and cypress trees. John briefly reviewed chemical analytical data from Monterey Harbor sediment samples. He also briefly spoke about the draft State Public Trust Lands Sea Level Rise Assessment prepared for the City of Monterey which contains information about opportunistic beach nourishment as a short-term strategy for coastal erosion. For more information:

<https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2019/190419/190419beachnourishmnet-ppt.pdf>

Paul Michel thanked John for the presentation. For years, MBNMS was characterized as not allowing harbor dredging. Sanctuaries do allow dredging and this presentation was evident of that. Harbors have found creative ways to use dredge material. He also mentioned a proposed rule in MBNMS' Management Plan Review which amends the definition of dredged material so as to allow beach nourishment using clean sand.

VIII. STANDING ITEM: SAC Challenge

The At-Large (northern region), CA Department of Fish and Wildlife, Diving, Harbors and Research all presented the ways in which they communicate to their constituents as well as the ways in which they communicate with fellow AC members and MBNMS staff.

At-Large (northern region)

Dan Haifley (primary) received input on MBNMS issues and informed individuals of meetings and events in his now former role as Executive Director of O'Neill Sea Odyssey. He often informed others of MBNMS issues and projects in his regular newspaper column, Our Ocean Backyard, which has subsequently been taken over by current OSO Executive Director Rachel Kippen. He continues his liaison role as Board member for Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Foundation, Save Our Shores and Catamaran Literary Reader, and through his personal network, attendance at events and via social media. For example, in meetings in March, and during the Hour Local Radio Show on KSCO AM on April 3, the issue of cruise ships was discussed.

Cynthia Mathews' (alternate) community and City Council service includes promoting MBNMS and Sanctuary Exploration Center efforts. She publicizes SEC and MBNMS events and projects at City Council meetings televised on Community TV. As a member of the Conference and Visitors Council Board she promotes MBNMS and efforts to communicate with visitors.

CA Department of Fish and Wildlife

Paul Reilly (primary) discussed how he and Deb (alternate) communicate with CDFW staff as well as how he communicates back to the Advisory Council and MBNMS staff regarding CDFW information. Paul/Deb alerts the Marine Region managers of relevant AC agenda items and requests their guidance on any AC action items. Information is distributed to managers and other scientists as needed. Consultations are also done with managers and scientists (subject matter experts) as needed. Paul mentioned presentations he has given to the AC as well as presentations by other Marine Region staff he helped coordinate. For more information:

<https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2019/190419/190419sacchallenge-cdfw02-ppt.pdf>

Deb Wilson Vandenberg (alternate) discussed the ways in which she and Paul communicate with constituents outside the Marine Region which includes other state government agencies, federal government agencies, tribes and tribal communities, academic communities and various stakeholders. Communication is performed through a Marine Management News Blog, a listserv, program webpages, annual reports, stakeholder working groups and meetings and extensive direct communication. For more information:

<https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2019/190419/190419sacchallenge-cdfw01-ppt.pdf>

Diving

Brian Nelson (primary) and Keith Rootsart (alternate) communicate with diving constituents through a bi-monthly newsletter, a yearly diver poll (which helps measure the Diving seats efforts), dive store handouts, multiple speaking events, direct discussions with divers, engaging with other sanctuary seats and advising MBNMS leadership. The bi-monthly newsletter helps Brian and Keith reach over 3,000 divers. Speaking events include presentations to dive clubs, public forums, governmental authorities and diving non-government organizations. For more information:

<https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2019/190419/190419sacchallenge-diving-ppt.pdf>

Harbors

John Haynes, City of Monterey Harbormaster, communicates with the other three harbors represented in this seat: San Mateo County Harbor District, Santa Cruz Port District and Moss Landing Harbor District. All four harbors face different issues. Each harbor district has a board of commissioners. However, Monterey Harbor is under city government. Harbors are gateway to sanctuary. Many constituents visit harbors: recreational boaters, commercial boaters, general harbor visitors, etc. Communicating with harbor users requires collaboration with other seats due to the overlap in user communication.

Research

Dr. John Hunt (primary) and Dr. Steve Haddock (alternate) communicate with their constituents through lectures, past and potential future symposiums, through the Research Activity Panel (RAP) and through general requests for information to report to the AC. They also regularly communicate with MBNMS staff and AC members to discuss special topics, memos and give recommendations. For more information:

<https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2019/190419/190419sacchallenge-research-ppt.pdf>

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

There were clarifying questions regarding the Research seat's communication with the RAP as well as how each seat receives information from their constituencies.

Paul Michel thanked the presenters. This was exactly what he envisioned for the SAC Challenge.

IX. INFORMATION ITEM: Monterey Bay Fisheries Trust overview

Sherry Flumerfelt, Executive Director of Monterey Bay Fisheries Trust (MBFT), gave an overview of MBFT and the challenges MBFT faces. Sherry also discussed how they are working with partners to help create a sustainable fishing economy. MBFT is focused on the west coast groundfish fishery which provides year round landings unlike coastal pelagic species or Dungeness crab. MBFT has

worked to buy fishing rights, quotes and permits and hold them in trust for the local fishing community. In three years, MBFT secured \$2.5 million for fishing rights. For more information:

<https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2019/190419/190419fisheritrust-ppt.pdf>

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

It was asked how MBFT and their constituents view MBNMS. Sherry felt MBFT is a partner with MBNMS and therefore has a great view. She could not speak for the fishermen.

It was asked where MBFT acquires their funding. MBFT acquires money from several sources including Monterey Peninsula Foundation, Fish and Wildlife Foundation, City of Monterey and Monterey County. It is not a membership-based organization.

X. INFORMATION ITEM: Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Foundation update

Ginaia Kelly, Executive Director of Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Foundation (MBNMSF), gave an update on the foundation's outreach, priorities and funding. The foundation's current focus is to support Bay Net, Team Ocean and whale rescue. MBNMSF has received funding through various foundation and corporate grants, individual donors and corporate donors. The foundation will be involved in many events this year including their signature annual event "Sanctuary Stars Brunch" on September 22, smaller "salon" events and Whalefest. Ginaia encouraged the AC to spread the word about the foundation. For more information:

<https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2019/190419/190419mbnmsf-ppt.pdf>

XI. STANDING ITEM: Working Group Updates

Conservation Working Group (CWG): The CWG met on April 5. As a working group, they are still discussing a specific project for 2019, yet we unanimously agree that plastic pollution is a major threat to the environment generally, the marine ecosystems and human health. One of the ideas that emerged was to request the Advisory Council consider passing an anti-plastic pollution resolution. Katherine crafted a first draft of a possible resolution for the AC to review.

Research Activity Panel (RAP): The March 8th RAP meeting was held at the Long Marine Lab at UCSC and was well attended with 14 RAP members and 9 guests. SAC diving representative Keith Rootsart presented plans for sea urchin removal projects, which generated a good discussion. Jason Scorse presented a white paper on the use of seal bombs, which also generated a good discussion. Actually all of the topics presented at RAP meetings generate a lot of discussion, which makes for interactive and informative meetings. Carrie Pomeroy presented a Sea Grant update including a report entitled Socioeconomic Guidance for Implementing the Marine Life Management Act, and Mara Orescanin presented Naval Postgraduate School research on the hydrodynamics of breaching at the Carmel River mouth. The next RAP meeting will be held May 10th at Elkhorn Slough.

We're pleased to announce that Henry Ruhl, Director of the Central and Northern California Ocean Observing System (CeNCOOS) has joined the RAP as alternate member for Biological Oceanography. CeNCOOS provides a wealth of oceanographic data and online analytical tools that are extremely useful for long-term monitoring of sanctuary condition.

MBNMS scientist Steve Lonhart coauthored a paper published in Proceedings of the Royal Society, entitled "Human-induced reductions in fish predator boldness decrease their predation rates in kelp forests." It shows that Individual fishes in older no-take marine protected areas (existing for at least

40 years) consumed prey at nearly twice the rate of fishes of the same species and size at new protected areas (established for approx. 8 years). Please contact Steve for a copy.

A number of current or retired RAP members serve on the Board of the Myers Trust, which this year will distribute about \$40,000 in research grants to graduate students around Monterey Bay.

Elkhorn Slough Reserve staff, together with a crew from the California Conservation Corps, planted 17,000 marsh plants at the Hester Marsh restoration site. Every plant was part of a series of experiments designed to further knowledge of estuarine ecosystem restoration.

Elkhorn Slough staff and volunteer researchers compiled the latest "State of the Estuary" report, which can be found on the Slough website or at the link that will be in Nichole's summary of this meeting: <https://www.elkhornslough.org/state-of-the-estuary-report-2019/>

The California Ocean Protection Council, working through Sea Grant, has funded programs by local scientists to conduct ecosystem-focused long-term monitoring of the State's Marine Protected Areas, including sanctuary rocky intertidal, kelp forest, and deep rocky reef habitats.

It is worth noting that among NOAA cuts in the president's budget for next year, it proposes to eliminate three environmental programs at NOAA, including Sea Grant, the National Coastal Zone Management grants, and the Pacific Coastal Salmon Recovery Fund.

Sanctuary Tourism and Recreation Working Group (STAR): the STAR met on April 12. They had a guest presenter, Maggie Ivey who created a video about a female surfer from Santa Cruz. The video includes information about the sanctuary.

They discussed the Get Into Your Sanctuary event coming up August 2-4.

Snapshot Day is coming up on May 4.

Meeting adjourned at 4:27 PM.