

**MONTEREY BAY NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY  
ADVISORY COUNCIL**

**Final Meeting Minutes  
October 19, 2018  
Agriculture Commissioner’s Office, Salinas, CA**

**VOTING MEMBERS**

Agriculture: Sarah Lopez  
AMBAG: Stephany Aguilar  
At Large: Dan Haifley  
At Large: Gary Hoffmann  
At Large: PJ Webb  
Business & Industry: Tom Rowley  
CA Coastal Commission: absent  
CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife: Paul Reilly  
CA EPA: absent  
CA Resources Agency: absent

CA State Parks: Eric Abma  
Commercial Fishing: Kathy Fosmark  
Conservation: Katherine O’Dea  
Diving: Brian Nelson  
Education: Jon Hill  
Harbors: John Haynes  
Recreation: Gary Pezzi  
Recreational Fishing: Rich Hughett  
Research: Dr. John Hunt  
Tourism: Mike Bekker

**NON-VOTING MEMBERS**

Channel Islands NMS: absent  
College: Jacob Winnikoff  
Cordell Banks NMS: absent  
Elkhorn Slough NERR: Dave Feliz  
Greater Farallones NMS: Max Delaney  
Monterey Bay NMS: Paul Michel  
National Marine Fisheries Service: absent  
U.S. Coast Guard: LT Darrina Willis

Alternates present in audience:

Carol Maehr – At-Large  
Captain Jim Moser – Commercial Fishing  
Keith Rootsart – Diving  
Bart Selby – Recreation  
Jose Montes – Recreational Fishing  
Dr. Steve Haddock – Research  
Dr. Dan Brumbaugh – Elkhorn Slough NERR  
Dawn Hayes – MBNMS

**I. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND MEETING MINUTES**

Chair Brian Nelson called the meeting to order and Secretary Gary Pezzi attended to roll call.

Two new advisory council members were sworn in by Superintendent Paul Michel. New AC members include Jacob Winnikoff (College primary) and John Haynes (Harbors – Monterey). Both new members briefly introduced themselves.

Stephany Aguilar introduced a motion to change the College seat term from eighteen months to two years. Seconded by Gary Pezzi.

**MOTION: Passed**

(Vote: 15 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions)

#### **APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES**

Approval of August 17, 2018 DRAFT Meeting Minutes

Dan Haifley introduced a motion to approve the August meeting minutes. Seconded by PJ Webb.

**MOTION: Passed**

(Vote: 13 in favor, 0 opposed, 2 abstentions)

Nichole Rodriguez mentioned recruitment will open Monday, October 22<sup>nd</sup> for the College alternate and Education primary. Recruitment will close on Friday, November 30<sup>th</sup>.

## **II. STANDING ITEM: Superintendent Report**

Monterey Bay NMS

Elkhorn Slough National Estuarine Research Reserve (ESNERR) was recently recognized as a wetland of international importance by the Ramsar Convention on Wetlands. A ceremony was held at Hester Marsh to celebrate. Congressman Jimmy Panetta, NOAA's NOS Acting Assistant Administrator Nicole LeBeouf and state elected officials were present.

The Final Environmental Impact Review certified on the CalAM desalination project. Agencies are currently in permit review mode. Currently waiting on State of CA action to authorize. MBNMS will then be authorizing Coastal Commission development permit and regional waterboard permit for discharge. Anticipate this being a four to six month timeframe.

It was asked if City of Marina filed a lawsuit regarding this project. Paul said he has not seen anything yet.

Management Plan Review is moving along. Dawn is working with leads to finalize draft action plans. The regulations package is being pulled together. Dawn is also working on drafting the Environmental Assessment. The goal is to have the draft management plan, regulations package and Environmental Assessment to ONMS Headquarters by the end of this calendar year.

MBNMS' Research team is very busy right now. Some of MBNMS' staff will be involved in a research cruise aboard Ocean Exploration Trust's *EV Nautilus* in the southern region of MBNMS. An estimated thousand classrooms signed up to participate in the Nautilus Live Ship-to-Shore broadcast.

Paul recently went to Sacramento to meet with CA Resources Agency. Deborah Halberstadt (CA Resources Agency primary on the AC) said they are in the process of hiring three new people with one of those becoming a MBNMS AC rep. He also met with CA Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) and CA State Water Resources Control Board. The control board is currently looking to fill Mariela's position on the AC.

Paul introduced Office of Law Enforcement Special Agent Don Tanner. Don mentioned a new enforcement officer, Sam Smith, was sworn in recently and will be training for the next 3 to 6 months. They are also putting out offers for new special agents in California. One of those agents will be in Monterey.

Paul mentioned a letter of agreement to Pebble Beach Company was drafted and will be sent soon regarding the agreement to clean up golf balls in the sanctuary (shoreline and subtidal). MBNMS will continue to conduct fieldwork to monitor the golf balls. The goal is to eventually work with other golf courses on golf ball cleanup efforts.

It was suggested to send a thank you letter to the high school students that discovered the golf balls in the sanctuary.

There was a question about the potential reservation system at Point Lobos. Eric Abma responded CA State Parks is looking into a reservation system. Finishing a general plan for the park. Having trouble with parking and controlling the number of visitors in the natural reserve. Assessments have determined the reserve is overused. It was asked if the new reservation system would effect divers who already have to make reservations at Point Lobos. There shouldn't be much change there since divers are already limited.

#### Greater Farallones NMS

Conservation science staff from Greater Farallones sanctuary, Point Blue Conservation Science, and Greater Farallones Association completed the 53rd research cruise as part of Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies (ACCESS). Scientists collected seabird and marine mammal data, oceanographic measurements, and sampled for prey availability along predetermined transect lines from Sonoma through San Mateo Counties and offshore to nearly 80 km from San Francisco. Summer upwelling conditions made for rough seas but good ocean productivity indicated by abundant plankton and whales. Most notable were humpback, blue and fin whales foraging over the continental shelf as well as within the shipping lanes, making them more vulnerable to being struck and killed by ships. Updates were posted daily about the research mission at [www.facebook.com/ACCESS.Partnership](http://www.facebook.com/ACCESS.Partnership), as well as blog posts from our Teacher at Sea.

Sanctuary scientists and partners completed mapping and visual surveys of deep-sea habitat in Cordell Bank, Greater Farallones, and Monterey Bay national marine sanctuaries July 30-August 10, 2018. The work took place from Bodega Bay to Año Nuevo, CA on board the NOAA ship *Bell M. Shimada*. Project partners included scientists from NOAA National Centers for Coastal Ocean Science, NOAA Office of Coast Survey, Marine Applied Research and Exploration (MARE), US Geological Survey, California Academy of Sciences, Greater Farallones Association, and Marine Conservation Institute. Approximately 300 km<sup>2</sup> of mapping data and 47 hours of seafloor video were collected. Highlights included the most northern specimens of stony cup corals and a gorgonian coral (likely *Eugorgia* sp.). Many of the surveys were in Essential Fish Habitat and Rockfish Conservation Areas, some of which are proposed to be newly opened or closed to bottom contact fishing in 2019. The Office of National Marine Sanctuaries, NOAA Deep Sea Coral Research and Technology Program, and Marine Applied Research and Exploration provided funding.

The Sanctuary, in partnership with the Greater Farallones Association, has received funds from the California Ocean Protection Council to develop a Coastal Resilience Sediment Action Plan, which establishes and prioritizes projects/actions and recommended implementation strategies for these

projects/actions along the Pacific coastlines of four counties: Sonoma, Marin, SF, and San Mateo. The CRSAP will build on the work of the four Coastal Regional Sediment Management Plans (CRSMPs) that were completed through the CSMW process in recent years: the Sonoma-Marín Coastal Regional Sediment Management Report (CRSMR), the San Francisco CRSMPs (Central Bay and Outer Coast), and the Santa Cruz Littoral Cell CRSMP. The CRSAP will integrate the regional recommendations and site-specific recommendations from each of the four plans. One of the common priorities raised by each of these four CRSMPs is the need to develop an effective process for implementing the specific recommendations contained in each plan, including establishing a governance structure where resource management agencies have defined roles and responsibilities. On October 1<sup>st</sup>, GFNMS hosted the first governance technical advisory committee meeting at the GFNMS office and it was well attended by federal, state, local agencies; there was strong interest in this topic and all agencies present pledged their intent to continue with the process. The next Sediment in the Sanctuaries Technical Advisory Committee meeting will be held in mid-November at the GFNMS office.

The Farallones sanctuary's iconic white sharks were the stars of SharktoberFest 2018, as a record-breaking 1,500+ people descended on sanctuary headquarters and Visitor Center in the San Francisco Presidio Saturday, September 29<sup>th</sup> for SharktoberFest 2018. This annual celebration of the white sharks' return to their fall feeding grounds, co-sponsored with the Greater Farallones Association, and Shark Stewards, featured shark experts, a Science Station, shark photography and films, and live sharks. Hands-on activities like Sharkitecture 101 ("Build a Shark") demonstrated physiology and adaptations. "Tag the Shark" facilitated discussion of telemetric tracking to better conserve this unique white shark breeding population. Exhibitors included NOAA Fisheries, California Academy of Sciences, California State University's Pacific Shark Research Center, and others who brought their special focuses to the event. All ages found opportunities to learn about and enjoy our shark and ray families.

GFNMS has issued the Authorization for the 2018-2019 Mavericks Contest. It will be run by the same entity as last year, the World Surf League. Even though the contest was not held last year due to a lack of swell and weather conditions, GFNMS was able to coordinate with the organizers so they know what is required in the authorization in terms of wildlife observers, MWPC protocols, and noticing. The contest window will be the same as the last few years, with the window opening on November 1<sup>st</sup> and closing on March 31<sup>st</sup>.

GFNMS will host a Salmon Soiree on Saturday, November 10, 2018 from 7-9:30 pm at the Randall Museum, 199 Museum Way, San Francisco, CA 94114. There will be a reception from 7-8 pm followed by a talk at 8pm. Come learn about the latest in salmon research from NOAA Fisheries Research Biologist, Dr. Thomas Williams. This will be followed by an "Ocean to Plate" Q&A session, in which Dr. Sarah Mesnick will moderate a panel discussion with 25 Lusk's Executive Chef Matthew Dolan, Fisherman Mike Hudson, Artist Ray Troll, Dr. Kevin Rider and Executive Director of Institute for Fisheries Resources Noah Oppenheim. Tickets are \$20 and include two complimentary beverages. Contact [sheintzelman@farallones.org](mailto:sheintzelman@farallones.org) to reserve your spot! Space is limited. Public transit or ridesharing encouraged.

Current GFNMS Advisory Council openings include: Commercial Fishing Primary, Commercial Fishing Alternate, Maritime Activities Commercial Primary, Maritime Activities Commercial Alternate

### III. PUBLIC COMMENT FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

No public comment

### IV. Information Item: WCR Priorities discussion

Paul Michel gave a presentation on the ONMS West Coast Region priorities for Fiscal Year 2019. Priorities include reduce whale ship strikes, deep-sea coral initiative, characterization of sound/soundscape, climate change, advancing ocean acidification strategies, vessel incidents, improved enforcement outcomes, recreation and tourism, US Forest Service partnership, signage plan and veteran engagement. For more information:

<https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2018/181019/181019regional-priorities-ppt.pdf>

#### Advisory Council Member Discussion:

There were questions and discussion about the insurance requirements for vessel incidents/groundings as well as funding for salvage. It was mentioned some vessels are not insurable and some marinas do not require vessels to be insured. It was also suggested for MBNMS to partner with harbors to fund salvage efforts. Santa Cruz Harbor recently mandated all vessels in the harbor be insured by January 2019. Some of those vessels will not be insurable.

More information was requested on the partnership with US Forest Service. Both ONMS and US Forest Service are focused on outreach opportunities to expand awareness of sanctuaries and national forests as well as watershed connections.

### V. INFORMATION ITEM: MBNMS/Coast Guard cruise ship inspections

Keith Rootsart gave a brief presentation on the tour MBNMS staff and Advisory Council members took part in on the M/V *Ruby Princess* of Princess Cruise Lines. He gave an overview of the ship and the operations including desalination, reverse osmosis and processing grey water. For more information: <https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2018/181019/181019cruise-inspections1-ppt.pdf>

US Coast Guard (USCG) Lieutenant Commander (LCDR) Frank Strom gave a presentation on USCG involvement in joint cruise ship inspections with MBNMS. LCDR Strom specifically talked about USCG foreign passenger vessel examinations. There are two types of Certificate of Compliance Examinations: annual exams and periodic exams. During inspections USCG reviews items including: ship's documents, bridge safety and navigation equipment, security systems, environmental procedures and machinery systems. LCDR discussed how USCG verified a vessel is operating per its waste management procedures (oil pollution prevention, grey/black water discharge, hazardous waste handling and garbage management) and the way in which they address deficiencies and enforcement. Lastly, LCDR Strom mentioned the USCG Maritime Information Exchange, a searchable online database available to the public of open and closed cases for foreign vessels in US waters. For more information: <https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2018/181019/181019cruise-inspections2-ppt.pdf>

MBNMS Regulatory Coordinator Scott Kathey gave a presentation on MBNMS' involvement in joint cruise inspections. He started with an overview of the history of cruise ships in MBNMS. He discussed what is involved in the unscheduled, random inspections occurring several times per year.

Vessels are inspected by a USCG port inspection team with support from MBNMS staff. The inspection team looks for unauthorized discharge of liquids and solids, ship log discrepancies and physical signs of bypass activity. Scott presented examples of federal penalties for illegal discharges as well as state and municipal authorities cruise ships must abide by including CA Clean Coast Act, Oil Spill Contingency Plan Requirements for Non-Tank Vessels, US Clean Water Act Regulations, City of Monterey contract requirements and Lempert-Keene-Seastrand Oil Spill Prevention and Response Act. He discussed key contract provisions between cruise ships and the City of Monterey including what a ship must do if discharge occurs within MBNMS. Scott ended with the findings of cruise ships inspections in MBNMS over the past 13 years. There has been only one violation within MBNMS during that time. For more information:

<https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2018/181019/181019cruise-inspections3-ppt.pdf>

Public comment: none

#### Advisory Council Member Discussion:

Q: do they dispose of their solids after the 3-mile?

A: ships dispose of many solids at the pier such as recyclables. Waste such as food waste and treated black water can be discharged outside of state waters

Q: how is it proved discharge occurs outside of sanctuary boundary?

A: there are sensors and systems that automatically capture that information when valves are opened. No way to cheat it. Tamper proof equipment. Environmental officer inspects over 800 of these tamper proof tags twice a week. Written logs are also key. Weights and amounts of substances from location to location have to match up.

Q: are physical samples taken of discharged waste?

A: ships have certified equipment to ensure they function properly. There are also onboard analyzers of the equipment.

Comment: cruise ship regulations started with the AC. The AC advised the superintendent, regulations were made and are clearly being enforced.

Q: is air pollution a concern? Mentioned in Channel Islands ships are burning high sulfur fuel oils. Is it different coming into MBNMS?

A: that's a larger discussion. The ships carry clean diesel and bulk oil. They use clean diesel when they can't run their scrubbers.

Q: treatment systems are pre-certified to meet certain standards. Are the systems monitored to make sure they achieve those standards?

A: there's a sensor in the system to monitor that before it gets to overboard side. Class agencies inspect and monitor the equipment as well.

Q: is desalination and reverse osmosis used on ocean water to be used as drinking water? What are the drinking water standards?

A: US Public Health Code standards.

Comment: discharging outside the sanctuary doesn't mean it doesn't enter the sanctuary.

Q: are reports prepared after ship inspections?

A: MBNMS prepare a report only if there is a violation. No systematic record if no violations. US Coast Guard does keep a record though. Records are only available if there is a violation, but all records can be accessed under the Freedom of Information Act.

Q: why are most cruise ships registered in Bermuda?

A: flag of convenience - tax or financial purposes.

Q: what does it mean to “scrub” inspection data before it is published?

A: some information must be removed so as not to impact the safety of the vessel.

Q: are speeds/knots monitored?

A: entire trip is recorded, that info can be given at given time

Comment: imaginary sanctuary boundary does not obstruct discharge to enter MBNMS. Dilution should take care of that but worry about live organisms in ballast water. Also, if we’re putting out trains of food discharge, is that making sharks expend extra energy? But feels dilution probably takes care of this kind of issue. Also, protocols are not clear and it seems there is not enough communication between hospitality staff and environmental staff about using pest control and disinfection products.

Comment: understand ballast water that can carry invasive species is generally treated. But it seems to be a problem that water in the hull, where invasive species can reside, are removed only when dry docked.

Response: hulls are coated with anti-fouling paint to prevent growth and invasive species. If there is excessive build up, they will contract divers to clean. Ships do not want build up on their hull. It creates drag and costs money.

Q: What is the temperature of water that is being discharged?

A: the water is about probably 140 degrees F as its being processed but it is in a closed-loop systems so it cools as it travels before discharged.

Q: are the ship inspections actually done by MBNMS?

A: US Coast Guard does full inspections twice a year. US Coast Guard inspections in Monterey are joint inspections with MBNMS.

Comment: there are no records kept by MBNMS if there is no violation. Thinks there should be a record for ALL inspections.

Response: these vessels are heavily regulated. These inspections are on top of that.

Comment: according to MBNMS’ Cruise Ship Action Plan, there are standard reporting requirements and documents for all vessels entering MBNMS.

Response: we are looking at what the vessel is reporting. Keeping detailed records of inspections where nothing is found is like asking a police officer to report when every car goes through the light when the light was green. It is a work management issue as well. MBNMS has lost a third of its staff since 2002.

## **VI. Information Item: Ag water quality update**

MBNMS Agriculture Water Quality Coordinator Pam Krone gave a presentation on MBNMS’ Agriculture Water Quality Program and increasing agriculture sustainability while improving water quality entering the sanctuary. Pam discussed the importance, value and benefits of agriculture in the Monterey region. She gave an overview of the Agriculture Water Quality Program and the core objectives including improving water quality, collaborating and partnering with various stakeholders and increasing sustainability of agriculture. Pam discussed the ways in which the program is working to improve water quality through addressing nutrient threats, carbon farming and pesticide threats as well as preventing plastics from entering MBNMS. For more information:

<https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2018/181019/181019agwater-ppt.pdf>

### Advisory Council Member Discussion:

There were questions regarding cover cropping. Pam discussed several ways cover cropping can happen and explained there are incentives for farmers to do cover cropping.

There were questions regarding plastics used in agriculture as well as any alternatives to using plastics. Pam explained there has been a large effort behind developing biodegradable plastics but it is difficult to design them to breakdown at the proper time.

Pam also addressed questions about hydroponic farming and saltwater intrusion. The agriculture industry has made progress in handling saltwater intrusion.

#### **VII. INFORMATION ITEM: MPWC proposed zone change**

GFNMS Permit Coordinator Max Delaney gave a presentation on the proposed change to MBNMS' regulations for motorized personal watercraft (MPWC) Zone 1 in MBNMS' northern management area. He gave an overview of the regulations and the purpose of the zones. The regulatory change would eliminate Zone 1 based on the lack of MPWC use as well as the difficulty and cost to maintain the buoys in Zone 1. Eliminating the zone would improve enforceability of Zone 5. For more information: <https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2018/181019/181019mpwc-ppt.pdf>

#### Advisory Council Member Discussion:

There was concern there has not been enough public input from the community. There were questions around eliminating a zone that can be used for training as well as basing the zone elimination recommendation on the Beach Watch monitoring data. It was decided to agendize this topic again for the December AC meeting.

#### **VIII. Information Item: Update on ESNERR activities**

Elkhorn Slough National Estuarine Research Reserve (ESNERR) Reserve Manager Dave Feliz gave a presentation on recent activities at ESNERR. Dave gave an overview of the reserve and the vision and mission of ESNERR. He discussed ESNERR long-term and short-term monitoring research activities including water quality monitoring and marine mammal and seabird counts. He talked about various stewardship programs including invasive plant control, grazing programs, creating freshwater ponds, eucalyptus tree removal and creating biochar. Dave also talked about various marsh restoration projects. He gave an overview of facilities maintenance and improvements at ESNERR. Dave discussed several education programs including Estuary Explorers Club, Monterey Bay Aquarium WATCH program and Environment for the Americas. He ended by mentioning the recent designation of ESNERR as a Ramsar "wetland of international important." For more information: <https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2018/181019/181019esnerr-ppt.pdf>

Dan Brumbaugh, Coastal Training Program Coordinator, talked briefly about the Coastal Training Program.

#### Advisory Council Member Discussion:

There were clarifying questions regarding eucalyptus removal. Eucalyptus is removed because it is a non-native species. Native oaks are beginning to thrive where eucalyptus was removed. Removal was not done at the seal rookery at Seal Bend.

There were questions about the dirt used from old agriculture sites in the restoration projects. Some pesticide hot spots were found through soil testing and were avoided.

It was asked if MBNMS was part of the Ramsar site recognition. The designation includes Elkhorn Slough but not MBNMS.

**IX. Standing Item: AC Member Announcements**

Stephany Aguilar, AMBAG primary: no new announcements

Dan Haifley, At-Large primary: no new announcements

Paul Reilly, CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife primary: Regarding coastal pelagic species, the majority of landings into Moss Landing and Monterey has been anchovy with a minimal amount of squid. As of October 16, 2018, a total of 16,155 metric tons (mt) (59.5%) out of the 25,000 mt Annual Catch Limit for 2018 in California has been landed statewide. Squid is starting to make an appearance in the Ventura area so boats may start leaving the Monterey area to head down there. Please see below for updated landings information for coastal pelagic species:

<https://www.wildlife.ca.gov/Conservation/Marine/CPS-HMS/Landings>.

California Halibut continued their impressive showing throughout Monterey Bay until the end of September. The Department's California Recreational Fisheries Survey samplers observed more Halibut each month from June through September than they have in each of the previous seven years. Many fish were at or near the minimum legal size of 22 inches, indicating good recruitment, but there was also a wide size range, up to 45 inches. A high ratio of released (sublegal-sized) to kept fish also indicated good fishing opportunities are likely next season.

Striped bass fishing from shore was also productive. We received a report of one angler catching and releasing 77 stripers off New Brighton Beach.

The Department collaborated with staff from the Monterey Peninsula Water Management District to document predation of Steelhead by Striped Bass in the Carmel River Lagoon: 62 Striped Bass were collected, sacrificed, and stomachs examined: no Steelhead remains were detected. Stomach contents consisted primarily of invertebrates, i.e., Gammarid amphipods, and some fish—a few sculpins, mudsuckers, and sticklebacks.

Reilly participated in one day of research catch-and-release fishing inside and outside of Point Lobos State Marine Reserve as part of the California Collaborative Fisheries Research Program's 12<sup>th</sup> year of Marine Protected Area monitoring. Nine volunteer anglers caught 711 fish on 12 15-minute drifts, for an average catch rate of 26.3 fish per angler hour.

Rich Hughett, Recreational Fishing primary: Rich and Jose Montes met with Paul Michel, Dawn Hayes and Nichole Rodriguez to discuss reaching the recreational fishing community. The focus will be to continue sending out the recreational fishing newsletter, obtain more "Fishing Happens Here" postcards from ONMS, partner with other organizations at future fishing events and research funding for recreational fishing swag (keychains, pins, etc.) Rich also requested a future presentation from Jenn Chiu on the California Collaborative Fisheries Research Program.

Dr. John Hunt, Research primary: In September the USGS surveyed the nearshore bathymetry of southern Monterey Bay around the CEMEX plant. They used single-beam echo-sounders with higher resolution survey lines centered on the CEMEX plant and Salinas River delta. They intend to couple the bathymetry survey with fine scale topographic contours collected with an ATV and aerial imagery. This information will be critical for understanding coastal hazards, CEMEX impacts, and impacts of climate change.

This Sunday, Sanctuary Research Coordinator Andrew DeVogelaere will be giving a public lecture at the Seymour Discovery Center in Santa Cruz. The presentation is titled "Mysteries of Davidson Seamount and Sur Ridge Revealed: Exploring ancient, deep-sea coral communities." You have seen a bit of this and I am sure there will be fascinating photographs and good stories.

Eric Abma, CA State Parks alternate: information gained at a past AC meeting, recently helped State Parks permit for drone aerial research at Pt Lobos. Making sure to avoid nesting birds. Also, king tides occurring in January. State Parks will be doing small public events at Asilomar.

Gary Pezzi, Recreation primary: no new announcements

Paul Michel, MBNMS primary: announced Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Foundation hired Ginaia Kelly as the chapter director. Paul also recognized Dan Haifley named as “Man of the Year” by Aptos Chamber of Commerce.

Brian Nelson, Diving primary: the Diving newsletter is out. Continue to have good click throughs. Keith and Brian will be meeting with Paul Michel to review the dive survey. Keith and Brian continue to present monthly at various dive groups’ meetings.

PJ Webb, At-Large primary: Bureau of Ocean Energy Management announced today a one hundred day public comment period regarding offshore wind projects to determine if there is competitive interest on offshore wind in three locations (Diablo Canyon, Piedras Blancas, Humboldt). PJ will send additional info to the AC by email.

Mike Bekker, Tourism primary: noted there are a lack of trashcans at Del Monte Beach. Asked if there is any opportunity to learn more about how trash from Hurricane Michael is being addressed. Suggested MBNMS look into having a banner across the road during the Big Sur International Marathon. Commented the deck boards at Bubba Gump’s have shrunk since construction and crayons are falling through the cracks into the bay.

Tom Rowley, Business/Industry alternate: deadline was last week for lawsuits against the Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) for the Monterey Peninsula Water Supply Project. These are special lawsuits and appeals have to go to CA Supreme Court. This Environmental Impact Report(EIR)/EIS took six years. The claim is the EIR/EIS is inadequate with an incomplete analysis by CEQA. Critical issue for Monterey Peninsula and its economy.

Jacob Winnikoff, Education primary: no new announcements

Gary Hoffmann, At-Large primary: mentioned a recent entangled whale off Cypress Point on October 12<sup>th</sup>. Baby whale was immobilized by fishing gear. During survey, owner of fishing gear showed up decided to disentangle the whale on their own despite being asked to keep their distance. It is unclear if the whale was fully disentangled. November 5th Sea Otter Savvy will be hosting the 4<sup>th</sup> Annual Central California Coastal Wildlife Disturbance Symposium at Monterey Bay Aquarium.

Carol Maehr, At-Large alternate (announcement read by Gary Hoffmann): her only comment is regarding cruise ship inspections. Moving forward she requests that all future inspections follow the MBNMS management plan Strategy CS-2 “Develop Enforcement and Monitoring Programs”, specifically Activity 2.2 which reads: “Standard reporting requirements will include standard documents for all cruise ships visiting MBNMS (vessel logs, printouts from holding tanks, etc.)” These reports should be available for review. Please note that this strategy says all cruise ships visiting MBNMS. Reports of all inspections should be kept and available for review.

John Haynes, Harbors - Monterey: San Mateo County Harbor District - Surfer's Beach re-nourishment project is moving forward and hopes to be started in the Spring of 2019. Steve McGrath, General Manager expresses that the project would not have come this far without the help of Sanctuary Staff.

Steve McGrath has announced that he will be retiring in December.

Santa Cruz Harbor District - will be holding a "Haunted Harbor" event with decorated candy stations, and free water taxi boat rides. The lighted boat parade and Walton Lighthouse Christmas decoration lighting will be on the first Saturday of December. This year Stand-Up Paddleboards will be allowed to enter the parade!

Moss Landing Harbor District - working through the very lengthy and complicated permitting process for maintenance dredging of berthing areas. Much of the marina was inundated with sediment from the 2017 atmospheric river storm events.

A new sanitary sewer pump out facility was installed to replace a prior pump. All of the Harbors work hard to make sure that free-to-use sewer and bilge pump-out facilities are reliable to ensure that boaters can maintain environmentally safe boating practices.

Monterey Harbor - working to support locally caught and marketed sustainable fish. The City of Monterey is purchasing federal fishing rights for lease to local fishermen and women and is currently undergoing a competitive process to award building leases at the municipal wharf for fish buyers who will land and market local, sustainably caught fish.

Monterey's lighted boat parade will be on the first Sunday of December along Monterey's Harbor and Canary Row Waterfronts.

Katherine O'Dea, Conservation primary: Save Our Shores recently elected two new board members, one being Dan Haifley. Tucker Hirsch announced she is leaving Save Our Shores. Save Our Shores will be hosting a holiday open house on December 12<sup>th</sup>.

Kathy Fosmark, Commercial Fishing primary: fishermen are concerned about access to fishing areas in regards to wind energy proposals. The three areas of interest (Diablo Canyon, Piedras Blancas and Humbolt) are all prime fishing areas.

Sarah Lopez, Agriculture alternate: ag order update (the water quality regulations on farms from Clean Water Act) is progressing towards 2020 renewal date. Regional water board staff are going to present their ideas as an informational item to the state water board on Nov 8 and 9. Surface water monitoring requirements should be similar to what is currently in place but groundwater will be ramped up due to high amount of nitrate contamination in aquifers around the central coast. Difficult because board is basing what they want on large acreage almond farms. Here on the central coast farms can have multiple crops in a 20-30 acre area. Rotation of crops across same acreage. Could be onerous reporting requirements for central coast farmers. Mentioned the state water board is looking into charging growers an extra half million dollars for not having coalition. Also, noted she's never seen people in decade ask so many questions about how pesticides move off of crops/land

Bart Selby, Recreation alternate: gave a quick presentation on issue of pelicans and fishing gear. Pelicans entangled in fishing gear is preventable. Would like to see more focus on addressing this issue with recreational fishermen. Would like to see educational materials for fishermen and for the sanctuary to work with cities/counties. For more information:

<https://nmsmontereybay.blob.core.windows.net/montereybay-prod/media/sac/2018/181019/181019pelicans-ppt.pdf>

Dr. Steve Haddock, Research alternate: MBARI hydrophone live recordings and highlights

<https://www.mbari.org/deep-sea-sound-recordings-live-stream/>

Science information on the Ocean Cleanup project:

<http://www.deepseanews.com/tag/the-ocean-cleanup/>

<http://www.southernfriedscience.com/i-asked-15-ocean-plastic-pollution-experts-about-the-ocean-cleanup-project-and-they-have-concerns/>

Keith Rootsart, Diving alternate: Reefcheck has two more weeks of diving. This year seeing much more bull kelp. Last year there was much more giant kelp. Very happy to be starting up the urchin experiment. Looking for help with the project from graduate students and divers. Also looking for resources for equipment.

#### **X. Standing Item: Working Group updates**

Conservation Working Group (CWG): no update

Research Activity Panel (RAP): The Research Activity Panel met on September 7 at the Elkhorn Slough National Estuarine Research Reserve. Kerstin Wasson hosted the meeting and presented an update on research at the Slough, including: native oyster restoration, water quality monitoring and enhancement projects, the restoration of Hester Marsh and the Slough's designation as "a wetland of international importance" under the Ramsar Convention on Wetlands.

The RAP welcomed its newest member, Nadine Golden, Assistant Director of the USGS Pacific Coastal and Marine Science Center in Santa Cruz.

Recent passage of State Legislation related to trawl areas in Monterey Bay came as a surprise to RAP members who were deeply involved in the issue. We discussed the need for legislative updates to keep the AC and RAP informed of future Legislative actions affecting the sanctuary.

We discussed the need to monitor the cumulative effects of climate change-related factors, such as ocean acidification, hypoxia and elevated temperature, with the stressors currently tracked in the sanctuary Condition Reports, such as those affecting water quality, habitat and living resources. RAP members are communicating with the Ocean Protection Council to look for cooperative opportunities with the OPC's Ocean Acidification and Marine Protected Area (MPA) monitoring programs.

We received a presentation from RAP member Brian Owens of Cal Fish and Wildlife on the new process for evaluating and issuing scientific collecting permits. Sara Worden of CDFW presented the draft MPA Monitoring Action Plan. Baseline MPA monitoring has been completed and long-term monitoring is the subject of the draft plan. The public comment period on the MPA Monitoring Plan closed in August.

The November 2 RAP meeting will include a presentation on aquaculture at Moss Landing Marine Labs and an extensive discussion of ocean acoustics with RAP members Brandon Southall and Jeremy Goldbogen, joined by John Ryan from MBARI and John Josephs and Tetyana Margolina of the Naval Postgraduate School.

Sanctuary Tourism and Recreation Working Group (STAR): The STAR met on October 9<sup>th</sup>. They reviewed the upcoming Recreation and Tourism newsletter and discussed setting up a training for Constant Contact.

The ONMS West Coast Regional (WCR) Recreation & Tourism group is discussing the Blue Star Program and the possibility of starting a WCR effort to implement a similar program. The Blue Star is diving based while the Friends to the Sanctuary (FTTS) is land and business based (broader audience). The WCR Recreation & Tourism group would like to hear from the STAR committee about the FTTS program as a sanctuary recognition program and has invited Brian to present at the November meeting. The FTTS program will take MBNMS staff time to create and run (create program process, written materials, marketing materials, educational materials, work with CSUMB students and administer on-going program). Blue Star program has three staff who spend 50% of their time administering this program. This does not include the time it takes to develop a program. The STAR discussed the need for more staff time to support the FTTS program.

Bart and Brian are seeing on the water kayak/wildlife interaction issues and feel that the kayakers (tours/rentals/private boats) are the biggest threat- especially otters and birds.

PJ would like to have best practices handed to on-the-water businesses. To go out spearfishing with tourists, guides have to have a *guide license* to go out, a bond etc. to take photographs. Kayak tours guides should have guide license. STAR members were referred to the Fish and Wildlife guide license program. <https://www.wildlife.ca.gov/licensing/guide>

Meeting adjourned at 4:30 PM