

**MONTEREY BAY NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY
ADVISORY COUNCIL**

**Final Meeting Minutes
February 16, 2018
City of Santa Cruz Police Department
Santa Cruz, CA**

VOTING MEMBERS

Agriculture: Sarah Lopez	CA State Parks: absent
AMBAG: Kristen Petersen	Commercial Fishing: Kathy Fosmark
At Large: Dan Haifley	Conservation: Katherine O’Dea
At Large: Gary Hoffmann	Diving: Brian Nelson
At Large: PJ Webb	Education: Tucker Hirsch
Business & Industry: Tom Rowley	Harbors: Steve Scheiblauer
CA Coastal Commission: absent	Recreation: Gary Pezzi
CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife: Paul Reilly	Recreational Fishing: Rich Hughett
CA EPA: Maria de la Paz Carpio-Obeso	Research: Dr. John Hunt
CA Resources Agency: absent	Tourism: Mike Bekker

NON-VOTING MEMBERS

Channel Islands NMS: absent
 College: Clifton Herrmann
 Cordell Banks NMS: absent
 Elkhorn Slough NERR: absent
 Greater Farallones NMS: Karen Reyna
 Monterey Bay NMS: Paul Michel
 National Marine Fisheries Service: Dr. Steve Lindley
 U.S. Coast Guard: LCDR Jon Lane

Alternates present in audience:	Number of audience members 9:00 AM:
Cynthia Mathews – At-Large	5
Jim Moser – Commercial Fishing	
Keith Rootseart – Diving	Number of audience members 1:00 PM:
Jon Hill – Education	4
Bart Selby – Recreation	
Jose Montes – Recreational Fishing	
Dr. Steven Haddock – Research	
Mindy Maschmeyer – Tourism	

I. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND MEETING MINUTES

PJ Webb, Chair called the meeting to order and Secretary Brian Nelson attended to roll call.

Cynthia Mathews welcomed City of Santa Cruz Mayor David Terrazas. Mayor Terrazas has had a long-standing interest in marine and coastal protection. He also served on the board of Save Our Shores.

Mayor Terrazas welcomed the council to the City of Santa Cruz. He expressed his pride in attending the meeting and having the opportunity to meet the members of the council. He also mentioned how pleased he was to hear the diversity in constituencies represented by the AC members. The City of Santa Cruz has been very involved in their effort to protect the coast. On December 5, the city council took action to oppose the five-year lease of drilling off our coast. The city council unanimously supported the protection of this area. He welcomed the council to contact him if he can help in any way to support the council and protect the coastline. He expressed his commitment to learn today what the Advisory Council does and how he can get involved.

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

Approval of December 15, 2017 DRAFT Meeting Minutes

MOTION: Katherine O'Dea, Brian Nelson seconded.

(Vote: 17 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention)

II. STANDING ITEM: Superintendent Report

MBNMS staff is still working without a budget under a continuing resolution, planning for different budget scenarios.

The Research team is planning two deep-sea cruises later this year. The focus will be on seafloor mapping in the southern region. They will also work at Davidson Seamount. Currently lacking info on water quality. Acoustics work will occur on NOAA Ship *Bell M. Shamada*.

Monitoring is still happening at the Mud Creek slide. It is still considered an active slide.

Whalefest occurred a couple weeks ago. There was a great turnout with record number of attendees. The event included a symposium with great speakers.

The Resource Protection team is focused on desalination, primarily the CalAM EIR/EIS due out mid-March.

CSUMB is leading an effort for the Monterey Peninsula and the bay area to become a sustainable eco-tourism destination. Paul was asked to join the task force for this cause.

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

There was a question about the permit report format and not including all active permits. The permit report now reports on permits and authorizations issued during the two months between each AC meeting rather than all active permits.

There was a question about the recent sewage spill in Marina and MBNMS's involvement. The Central Coast Regional Water Quality Control Board and the California State Water Resources Control Board did the initial research. MBNMS's research and involvement is on top of that. MBNMS staff had to get approval to respond due to it occurring during a federal government shutdown. There was concern from AC members that notifications were not given to the public in a timely manner. Members of the public were getting into the water during peak times of the spill. It was mentioned an investigation is ongoing and a presentation at a future AC meeting was suggested.

III. INFORMATION ITEM: Review of Advisory Council member responsibilities

The Executive Committee, Chair PJ Webb, Vice-Chair Gary Pezzi and Secretary Brian Nelson, gave a presentation reviewing the AC member responsibilities and expectations. PJ noted the outstanding participation by MBNMS AC members in the AC meetings, working groups and sub-committees. She mentioned veteran AC members are a great resource for new members and encouraged there to be communication and support among members. She also mentioned AC members have the duty to

reach out to their constituencies. A great way to accomplish that is through newsletters, which Brian is great at doing.

Brian discussed the importance of AC members sharing information with their constituencies and bringing information from each constituency back to the AC. He expressed concern that some AC members may be giving their own opinion rather than representing their constituency. The constituency opinion is critical to the MBNMS Superintendent more so than an AC member's personal opinion. He recommended each AC member to take advantage of the Constant Contact subscription. Brian and Nichole Rodriguez, Advisory Council Coordinator can help.

Gary shared the goals and directives of the Advisory Council. He reviewed what is expected of the council as a group and individually. He expressed the importance of council members working together to have positive outcomes as a council. He also stressed the importance of being present for council meetings.

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

Dan Haifley thanked the Executive Committee for bringing this to the council. The AC has a unique role to communicate to each constituency. Communications need to be as factual as possible.

Paul Michel also thanked the Executive Committee for the presentation. MBNMS is a "crown jewel" of ONMS. MBNMS deals with many issues (e.g., land-sea connections, desalination, coastal erosion, etc.) as well as having a large abundance of species. He stressed the importance of AC members being present for council meetings. The AC members are the conduit between the sanctuary and the public. He requested members to reach out to members that have not attended meetings recently or regularly.

IV. STANDING ITEM: MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS

Cynthia Mathews, At-Large alternate: a new visitor guide is out for Santa Cruz County. The guide features MBNMS throughout. In addition, the Sanctuary Exploration Center will be participating in more engagement and events on First Friday.

Dr. Steve Haddock, Research alternate: a bright bioluminescent red tide off Big Sur received national attention in the last few weeks. There was big interest from families and media members hoping to witness the event and find out if it was still going on. This might be a good opportunity for another channel of information on a Sanctuary or tourism web site. More general info here: <http://biolum.eemb.ucsb.edu/organism/redtide.html>

Bart Selby, Recreation alternate: recognized CDFW for including a section on recreational fishing and seabirds in the 2018-19 California Saltwater Sport Fishing Regulations guide.

Jose Montes, Recreational Fishing alternate: no new announcements

Keith Rootsart, Diving alternate: attended a Fish and Game Commission meeting in Sacramento March 6 petitioning to change regulations for removal of purple urchins. There were four parts to the petition: 1) allowing unlimited urchin take, 2) eliminating wonton waste restrictions on urchins. 3) Allowing take in the MPAs and 4) Allowing urchin take without a fishing license. Parts 2-4 were denied. Part 1 was partially granted to change regulations regarding urchins to be determined by staff recommendations at the Marine Resources Committee meeting on March 6.

Mindy Maschmeyer, Tourism alternate: no new announcements

Jim Moser, Commercial Fishing alternate: slow fishing right now. The north coast opened a couple weeks ago. There is a lot of crab but there are issues with pricing.

Sarah Lopez, Agriculture alternate: talked with Jimmy Dutra, Agriculture primary about the importance of the Agriculture seat being present at AC meetings. They will work together to ensure coverage at meetings.

Dan Haifley, At-Large primary: Global Waves Conference, Dream Inn Santa Cruz, March 4-7. Sponsored by Save The Waves, international experts of protecting surf spots and habitats. Register at savethewaves.org.

Comment on offshore oil plan until 8:59 PM March 9: regulations.gov, search BOEM, 0074, 2017.

O'Neill Sea Odyssey starts classes again on March 6.

Working on a book on west coast offshore oil and marine sanctuaries, coming end of the year.

Clifton Herrmann, College primary: Biggest challenge as the College representative for the AC is to educate college students on the sanctuary and the AC. Most students know what a sanctuary is, but not what it does. There is opportunity to enhance ocean literacy and student involvement.

Recently gave a presentation on the sanctuary and plankton sampling to the CSUMB marine biology class (BIO345).

Working to train volunteers (Cabrillo College, CSUMB, Sanctuary Exploration Center, PG Museum of Natural History, Santa Catalina School) to collect and analyze zooplankton and phytoplankton samples.

Hoping to enhance reporting of algal blooms within the sanctuary for more informed management.

Kathy Fosmark, Commercial Fishing primary: there is a salmon stamp committee meeting today. Renewal of permits occurs every year and is dependent on amount of fish caught the year before. In addition, a couple of Executive Orders were signed regarding oil drilling. We, as a council, need to be diligent on watching that. In the crab fishery, some California boats are fishing in Oregon. There were issues with pricing for crab and fishermen struck.

Tom Rowley, Business & Industry alternate: Appreciates the great minutes that are distributed, especially when primary and alternate reps switch off. It allows all members to stay informed. "Industry" includes relationship between Jobs and Housing with Agriculture and Hospitality (economies) impacting directly on the affordability of housing. The local water crisis also impacts on housing. The State Water Resources Control Board (SWRCB) has a Cease & Desist Order (CDO) mandating approval by the CPUC of the EIR / EIS for the MP Water Supply Project (MPWSP) by September 30 this year! Agriculture is also now facing moratoriums on new wells. Monterey Peninsula still needs a long-term sustainable water supply project. Water impacts on the ability of all cities and Monterey County to build new or affordable housing. Suggest continuing to work to educate elected officials on how important the sanctuary is... The Monterey Conference Center dedication was on Jan 31. It is a beautiful center and hopefully the AC can have a meeting there soon.

Paul Reilly, CDFW primary: The Department presented its 2018 Marine Life Management Act Master Plan to the Fish and Game Commission February 7. This is a guidance document for how we manage our fisheries under state jurisdiction and was approximately 2 and a half years in the making.

The northern California commercial Dungeness crab fishery in Mendocino, Humboldt and Del Norte counties opened on January 15, 2018. Director Charlton Bonham had delayed the season a total of three times after crab quality test results in November and December indicated that crab were not ready for harvesting. January 15 is the latest the Director can delay the season due to quality testing. In the Monterey area recreational crab effort was low with many of the pots having few crab. The crab that were kept were high quality.

Preliminary 2017 sport and commercial ocean salmon harvest estimates have been finalized for inclusion in the Department's Review of 2017 Ocean Salmon Fisheries document. The sport estimate is 61,616 Chinook salmon (176% of preseason forecast) harvested for the season, and the commercial estimate is 42,261 salmon (89% of preseason forecast).

The Department will host its annual Salmon Information Meeting on March 1, 2018 from 10:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. at the Sonoma County Water Agency office located at 404 Aviation Blvd. in Santa Rosa. The meeting will provide the latest information on California salmon stocks and the outlook for ocean salmon fisheries for the upcoming 2018 season. A panel of fishery managers, scientists, and industry representatives will be assembled to address questions and collect public input that will be used in developing a range of season alternatives for California salmon fisheries at the March 8-14, 2018 Pacific Fishery Management Council meeting in Rohnert Park.

To address a concern from one of our SAC members, the Department will have information in our 2018 sport fishing regulations booklet on what to do if an angler hooks a seabird.

LCDR Jon Lane, US Coast Guard alternate: there were two violations issued in December. One fishing for yelloweye rockfish, an overfished but recovering species, and another violation for fishing in the wrong area.

Steve Scheiblaue, Harbors primary: dredging has started in Santa Cruz Harbor. Moss Landing Harbor is getting ready to start. Steve has a consulting contract with Monterey and has been working on a project to make Monterey the homeport for the *Western Flyer* once the vessel is refitted. He is working with US Coast Guard to potentially build out an area of the US Coast Guard pier for it to be docked. This project is two years in the making.

Steve also had questions about which Management Plan Review Action Plans would be reviewed today. He specifically mentioned the Wildlife Disturbance Action Plan strategy addressing wildlife entanglement in fishing gear. Karen Grimmer explained the state Dungeness crab working group would like to weigh in on the language of that portion of the management plan. Reviewing that strategy will be postponed.

Dr. John Hunt, Research primary: no new announcements

Kristen Petersen, AMBAG primary: no new announcements

PJ Webb, At-Large primary: the Coastal Discovery Center has been doing a lot of outreach and education with school groups. There will be a fair on August 25, this is always a well-attended event. Working with One Cool Earth on watershed curriculum.

Lastly, many bachelor elephant seal bulls have been coming and going in the area. Some locals have started taking their dogs to the beach to attack the elephant seals and flushing them back into the water.

Maria de la Paz Carpio-Obeso, CA EPA: Water Quality Control Policy on the Use of Coastal and Estuarine Waters for Power Plant Cooling (Once-Through Cooling Policy) - The State Water Resources Control Board (State Water Board) Statewide Policy on the Use of Coastal and Estuarine Waters for Power Plant Cooling, also known as the Once-Through Cooling or OTC Policy, regulates the use of seawater for cooling purposes at the power plants in California. The OTC-Policy requires owners or operators of existing power plants to implement measures to mitigate interim impingement and entrainment impacts resulting from their cooling water intake structures. Final determinations and invoices covering once-through cooling from October 2015 through September 2016 were released in December 2017 through February 2018. Owners or operators of the power plants are providing the payments to the Ocean Protection Council and the California Coastal Conservancy to be used in mitigation projects to increase marine life associated with the State's Marine Protected Areas in the geographic region of the facility. The facilities under this cycle are Alamitos, Harbor, Haynes, Huntington Beach, Mandalay, Ormond, Redondo Beach, Scattergood and Encina generating stations. As well as, Diablo Canyon Nuclear Power Plant. The OPC is working on the different disbursement mechanisms and guidelines for identifying projects appropriate to receive OTC- interim mitigation funds. One of the mechanisms will be request for proposals/grant process.

Another activity under the OTC Policy is the report of the Statewide Advisory Committee on Cooling Water Intakes Structures (SACCWIS). The OTC Policy requires the SACCWIS to advise the State Water Board on whether the Policy's compliance schedule takes into account the reliability of California's electricity supply. Staff is gathering information from owners and operators of the power plants, to develop the 2018 SACCWIS Report. The next SACCWIS meeting is schedule on March 5, 2018 and information item for the Board meeting, on April 17, 2018. Currently, SACCWIS does not recommend any change on the compliance schedule in the OTC Policy for the other generating facilities.

Bacteria Provisions - The State Water Board is proposing a Bacteria Provisions and Water Quality Standards Variance Policy. The Bacteria Provisions, would apply to fresh, estuarine, and marine waters; include *Escherichia coli* (*E. coli*) as the indicator of pathogens in freshwater and enterococci as the indicator for estuarine waters and ocean waters; establish a risk protection level of 32 illnesses per 1,000 recreators; and include new bacteria water quality objectives for the protection of the water contact recreation (REC-1) beneficial use. The Bacteria Provisions also include several implementation approaches the State Water Board or the Regional Water Quality Control Boards (collectively, Water Boards) may utilize to achieve the bacteria water quality objectives or to reflect whether the REC-1 beneficial use is appropriately designated. The Bacteria Provisions provide that when the Water Boards develop a TMDL to achieve the bacteria water quality objectives, a reference system/anti-degradation approach or a natural source exclusion approach may be utilized to account for natural sources of bacteria. For more information please visit:

<http://www.waterboards.ca.gov/bacterialobjectives/>.

Gary Pezzi, Recreation primary: mentioned Surfrider's Blue Water Task Force, a volunteer-run program that tests water quality. Their findings are available here: <http://www.surfrider.org/blue-water-task-force>

Monterey Surfrider has a beach cleanup scheduled for February 25 at Seaside Beach and March 25 at Del Monte Beach at Casa Verde.

February 26 Dr. Henry Ruhl from CeNCOOS (Central and Northern California Ocean Observing System) will give a presentation at Pacific Grove Museum of Natural History about the science and technology used to monitor currents, temperature, tides and swell.

Katherine O’Dea, Conservation primary: February 3 Save Our Shores did a grassroots protest on oil and drilling. Over a thousand people turned out including community leaders from across Santa Cruz County.

Working with local Monterey Oceana office to get resolutions passed on the use of straws. “STRAWS” will be screened on February 28 at the Sanctuary Exploration Center. Tickets are free but reservations are required. February 23 is National Skip the Straw Day.

Mike Bekker, Tourism primary: Monterey Conference Center is open. A state conference will be hosted there in March. He noted local governments raise taxes this time of year and mentioned MBNMS should get on the donation list of AT&T Pebble Beach Pro-Am.

Rich Hughett, Recreational Fishing primary: the first Recreational Fishing Newsletter is out. It was sent to 98 email addresses with a 54% open rate and 12% click rate. The newsletter will be distributed every three months. He suggested AC members to send him anything recreational fishing related to be included in the newsletter. While attending the Recreational Fishing Summit, he discovered no other representative was creating a newsletter. He received compliments from Bill Douros and John Armor for the newsletter. Fishing Happens Here postcard is out.

Gary Hoffmann, At-Large primary: actively promoting whale watching occurs year round. The boardwalk in Cambria gives tourists close access to elephant seals. Monterey Chapter of American Cetacean Society meets the last Thursday of every month. They have speakers on different topics. Visit www.acsmb.org to find out more information and to get on their mailing list. For the month of January and February, Marine Life Studies is receiving the 5-cent bag credit donation in Monterey.

Tucker Hirsch, Education primary: Monterey Bay Environmental Educators is having its first meetings of 2018. Will be splitting some or all of the 2018 meetings to divide between and focus specifically on Monterey and Santa Cruz counties. Monterey County Office of Education's Next Generation Science Standards (NGSS) Collaborative Network is continuing to grow and meet. Supporting teachers with the NGSS and Environmental Principles and Concepts and connecting schools with Environmental Education Providers. Save Our Shores (SOS) will be working with Pajaro Valley Unified School District (PVUSD) to aid and support them in their new science tracks. SOS will likely be co-hosting three adult, Spanish education programs focused on marine science and conservation for the parents of Latino students in PVUSD, North Monterey County Unified School District (NMCUSD) and Santa Cruz City Schools. These are pilot programs and very much still in the works. Event: Screening of “STRAWS” at the SEC on February 28. Limited seats, so reserve your free tickets ASAP on Save Our Shores website or Facebook page. Panel discussion will follow the film.

Brian Nelson, Diving primary: presentations for Silicon Valley Dive Club and Blue Endeavors Dive Club are coming up in May. Scuba Show in Long Beach will be May 6-7. The Diving Equipment and Marketing Association Show in Las Vegas will be November 14-17. The Monterey Shootout, a photography competition is scheduled for August 9-12. Earth Day is April 22 this year and there will be a cleanup off Del Monte Beach.

Dr. Steve Lindley, NMFS primary: UCSC's Seymour Center will be hosting a "Science Sunday" panel discussion on June 17 on California salmon. The event will include release of new artwork by Ray Troll, developed in collaboration with NMFS and MBNMS staff, depicting the salmon life cycle and its connections to iconic California landscapes, music by Ray and his band, a panel discussion with Ray, salmon scientists and fishers, and perhaps food trucks.

V. PUBLIC COMMENT FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Christian Zajac, Commercial Fisherman: Concerns about changing designation regarding rights of crabbers in Monterey Bay.

VI. ACTION ITEM: Comment letter for a draft proposed program for Outer Continental Shelf oil and gas lease sales

PJ Webb introduced the letter and gave some background information. The letter is in response to the request for comments on the Draft Proposed Five-Year Outer Continental Shelf Offshore Oil and Gas Leasing Program for 2019 through 2024, proposed by the Bureau of Ocean Energy Management. The Advisory Council opposes the inclusion of any portion of the Pacific Coast Outer Continental Shelf Planning Areas in the draft proposal because the proposed offshore drilling plan threatens several National Marine Sanctuaries and the entire California coastal economy.

A motion was made by Rich Hughett to send the letter with the added changes.
Seconded by Steve Scheiblauber.

MOTION: PASSED

(Vote: 15 in favor, 0 opposed, 2 abstentions)

VII. STANDING ITEM: WORKING GROUP UPDATES

Conservation Working Group: the Conservation Working Group (CWG) had the first meeting of the year on January 25. Worked on the survey sent to CWG members late 2017. Reviewed the topics of interest that came up from the survey (e.g., plastic pollution, climate change, focus on specific species, wildlife disturbance.) Next meeting scheduled for February 22.

Research Activity Panel: the Research Activity Panel (RAP) met on January 12, 2018, at the Monterey Bay Aquarium Research Institute in Moss Landing.

Steve Haddock described recent research in his lab, including deep pelagic food webs, bioluminescence capability, genomes of jellies, and the upcoming Deep Sea Biology Symposium (Sept 9-14, 2018; dsbs2018.org).

John Ryan provided an update on Soundscape project at MARS cable.

Seaberry Nachbar (ONMS) presented the Ocean Guardian School Program and provided two examples of video interviews of scientists for K-12 students. She requested feedback and interest from RAP in recruiting scientists doing interesting field work for the students to interview.

Steve Lonhart (MBNMS) provided an overview of the Mud Creek slide and black abalone relocation efforts, similar to what Paul presented to the AC in December. Steve also provided a brief overview of renovations to the SIMoN website as another MBNMS contribution to long-term monitoring and public information systems. The website is found at <https://sanctuarysimon.org>

The next RAP meeting is scheduled for March 9 at the Moss Landing Marine Laboratories, and all Advisory Council members are encouraged to attend.

Announcements:

The Deep Sea Biology Symposium will be held at the Monterey Conference Center Sept 9 – 13, 2018. Approximately 500 scientists from around the world will present research on deep sea ecosystems. Early registration ends March 30.

The Ed Ricketts Memorial Lecture will be given April 10, 2018, at 7:00 p.m. at the Moss Landing Marine Laboratories. The Lecture was created to honor scientists who have exhibited exemplary work throughout their career and advanced the state of knowledge in the field of marine science. This year's recipient and lecturer is Dr. Steven Haddock, Senior Scientist at MBARI and an Adjunct Professor at the University of California, Santa Cruz. His work on deep sea jellies is fascinating and his lectures feature excellent photographs of unusual and exceptionally beautiful creatures.

<https://montereybay.noaa.gov/research/ricketts.html#2018>

Recreation and Tourism Working Group: the working group met on February 7. Paul Michel gave a presentation on CSUMB's Ecotourism program, a sustainable hospitality program. Costa Rica delegation visited and Monterey Bay business leaders visited Costa Rica. Paul Michel will be a part of the working group looking into the Monterey Peninsula becoming a sustainable eco-tourism destination.

The Recreation and Tourism Newsletter is out. There are 614 business owners and business managers on list the newsletter email list now.

VIII. STANDING ITEM: GFNMS SUPERINTENDENT'S REPORT

GFNMS Updates

Sanctuary Activities in San Mateo and SF Area

Conservation Science Update

Working with staff from Partnership for Interdisciplinary Studies of Coastal Ocean (PISCO), Multi-Agency Rocky Intertidal Network (MARINe), and Point Blue Conservation Science, sanctuary conservation science staff will be revamping our rocky intertidal monitoring plots on Southeast Farallon Island this winter. Several historic plots were converted to target important intertidal algae and invertebrate species, which will assess climate change and are good indicator species of impacts from oil pollution and vessel groundings.

Whale Trail Project Update

Staff from Greater Farallones and Cordell Bank sanctuaries met with the director of the Whale Trail Project to discuss how the trail might be implemented in Northern California. The Whale Trail is being developed by a core team of partners including NOAA Fisheries, Washington Dept. of Fish and Wildlife (WDFW), Seattle Aquarium, Olympic Coast National Marine Sanctuary, and the Whale Museum. There are more than 50 sites on the Whale Trail so far which include interpretive signs to show which marine mammals are likely to be observed there, and when. Through the current signs alone, the Whale Trail will reach over 25 million people each year. The director envisions five to seven additional locations in GFNMS where interpretive signs can be placed to increase education about whales and the sanctuaries for coastal visitors. Several of these signs will be situated on coastal bluffs overlooking the marine sanctuaries.

Farallones Fall Camp

The Farallones Fall Camp, the first in a series of new mini-camps by the Greater Farallones Association and Sanctuary education staff, launched during Thanksgiving week, November 20 through 22. Field based mini-camps provide children with experiences to connect with their national marine sanctuaries and increase their ocean literacy through exploration and discovery. The winter break mini-camp wrapped up last month from January 3 to 5.

Misc. Education Updates

- The Oceans After School education program in San Francisco has received funding for three more years.
- The School Programs we host at our GFNMS visitor center in San Francisco have been booked up through the entire year.
- GFNMS will host an upcoming Albatross Soiree at the Randall Museum in SF on April 28.

Vessel Speed Reduction Update

We have seen increasing levels of cooperation with our Vessel Speed Reduction (VSR) requests thanks in part to a detailed report card program where we communicate with shipping industry on their vessels' level of cooperation during transits within the VSR season. Sanctuary staff, in collaboration with USCG and NMFS, completed a preliminary analysis of the ~3000 transits during the 2017 voluntary Vessel Speed Reduction (VSR). 36% of all transits were in full cooperation transiting at 10knots or less. In the three years, we have been managing the VSR program, commitment from commercial vessels has increased from 19% to 36% while transiting in traffic lanes during whale season.

Mavericks Surf Contest

The World Surf League is the new contest organizer. They have all their permits in place at this point but are still waiting for the right surf conditions to hold the contest. The contest window closes earlier this year (February 28 instead of March 31) so time is winding down.

GFNMS Coastal Resilience Action Plan

GFNMS is undertaking the development of a GFNMS Coastal Resilience Action Plan this year which will look to develop specific tasks related to sediment management, coastal resilience and climate adaptation from Sonoma down to San Mateo.

Advisory Council Updates

Kelp Working Group

GFNMS Advisory Council has formed a working group to try and address the collapse of bull kelp stands occurring along the north coast. The collapse has been observed along hundreds of miles of coastline from San Francisco to Oregon.

Sonoma-Marin Coastal Regional Sediment Management

The GFNMS Advisory Council has completed a Draft Sonoma-Marin Coastal Regional Sediment Management Report. The report was developed with input from a working group, consisting of scientists, landowners, local stakeholders and agency representatives to develop coastal sediment management recommendations for the Sonoma and Marin County outer coasts. These recommendations were then reviewed by a Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) composed of local, state, and federal agency representatives. The Advisory Council has forwarded the report to the Sanctuary Superintendent with a request to share the report with the Coastal Sediment Management Workgroup (CSMW) to inform a CRSMP and the statewide Sediment Management Master Plan.

GFNMS SAC Seeking Applicants to Fill Vacancies

The GFNMS Advisory Council is seeking applicants for nine (9) vacancies. The application deadline is March 30, 2018 and openings are listed on the GFNMS website.

CURRENT VACANCIES (9):

Community-at-large San Francisco/San Mateo (Alternate), Community-at-large Marin/Sonoma (Primary), Community-at-large Marin/Sonoma (Alternate), Conservation (Primary), Conservation (Alternate), Research (Primary), Research (Alternate), Maritime Activities/Recreation (Primary), Maritime Activities/Recreation (Alternate)

IX. INFORMATION ITEM: SAC Chair Summit

PJ gave a presentation on the Advisory Council Chair Summit she attended in January. At the summit, ONMS Director John Armor talked about the Acting Director of NOAA Timothy Gallaudet who seems very committed to sanctuaries. For NOAA, weather sustainability/use of resources are top priorities. The goal is to move coastal economies forward through recreational fishing, whale watching, wildlife viewing and diving.

ONMS wants focus on promoting sanctuaries as destinations and welcoming visitors, enhancing sustainable tourism capacity within sanctuaries and managing visitor use while maintaining habitat/resource value. This was debated as there are natural tensions between encouraging more visitation and balancing the impacts of that visitation. Each sanctuary is different and some are overcrowded and facing negative impacts. There was discussion on how to tackle this issue. Flower Garden Banks NMS is looking into a visitation permit program free permit but would provide information on vessels, type, activity and species sighted. Greater Farallones NMS is developing a virtual story map and tour web/phone application that would attract tourism and increase awareness. An interesting topic during the summit was invasive species. Lionfish have become a tremendous problem. Gray's Reef, Florida Keys, Flower Garden Banks and Monitor NMS's have been encouraging people to catch and eat them and are starting to have restaurants serve lionfish. At the summit, PJ shared MBNMS AC newsletters with other AC Chairs. They were very impressed with this kind of outreach.

Lastly, concerns were shared from the Research Activity Panel (RAP) about the waning investment in research/monitoring. It would be helpful to the RAP to know what kind of research and monitoring information would be the most helpful to the sanctuaries for making management decisions. Sound in the sea is becoming increasingly important, including permitting of sound-related research and ocean noise.

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

A question was asked if Blue Economy was specific to activities within sanctuary. PJ believed that was the case. The perceived goal was to encourage users and determine how many users there are. There was a comment the economy would be just as strong without the sanctuary existing. PJ stated the sanctuaries gives added value and are special places.

X. INFORMATION ITEM: Advisory Council 2018 Work Plan

Nichole Rodriguez presented the draft Advisory Council 2018 Work Plan. She reviewed the process for creating the work plan which consisted of the AC providing potential topics at the December 2017 AC meeting, the Executive Committee reviewing and ranking the topics then convening to discuss the topics. Topics were chosen with an AC objective/outcome in mind and were assigned to a meeting month with the meeting location in mind.

The Advisory Council offered a couple edits to the work plan (see following page)

DRAFT 2018 MBNMS Advisory Council Work Plan			
Month	Topic	Presentation by ? (suggested)	Potential actions
April	Kelp and sea urchins, disappearing kelp forest	Cynthia Catton, CDFW	Potential resolution
April	Ocean acidification – cumulative impacts	a panel with Hopkins, MBARI, CINMS	Potential letter to Air Resources Board
June	Acoustics	a panel discussion	Potential letter to CDFW - concerns about proper use of seal bombs
June	Adapting to sea level rise and managing retreat - a synopsis of local communities LCP's	AMBAG	
August	Recycling, marine debris and microfibers	a panel with TBD	Letter to AMBAG
August	Pilot project on light touch gear	James Lindholm	Informational
October	“Friends of the Sanctuary” program (proposed draft, CSUMB report)	Brian Nelson	Comments/feedback from SAC
October	Agriculture monitoring programs and nitrate runoff, eutrophication and groundwater	AWQA	Informational, potential commendation
December	WCR priorities	Bill Douros	Informational
December	Beach monitoring after CEMEX closure	Moss Landing Marine Labs & Andrew DeVogelaere	Informational
December	2019 calendar & work plan topics	Nichole Rodriguez	Informational

XI. INFORMATION ITEM: Review of MBNMS Management Plan Review Draft Action Plans

Prior to the meeting, AC members were sent the draft Action Plans and associated strategies for review. AC members were then asked to pick ten of the total eighty-four strategies they would most like to discuss at this meeting. The results from their rankings helped staff determine which action plans and strategies would need more discussion. For each action plan, the action plan lead gave a brief description of the plan and took questions on each strategy.

Resource Protection Action Plan

Goal: Maintain and improve protection of wildlife within the sanctuary by evaluating and remediating adverse impacts from human activities.

Strategy RP2

Steve S: be careful on how you do those surveys

John H: question about collaboration with HQ, some happens on site but HQ does some.

Karen G: it’s a collaboration

John H: when considering the value of sanctuary there needs to be a clear distinction between the value of the geographic place or value enhanced by the sanctuary. A difficult thing to tease out.

PJ W: value of the environmental services to be considered

Karen G: the survey is very detailed ex: how many whales to make a trip worthwhile?

John H: non-market valuations

Karen G: the value of seeing whales

Strategy RP3

Steve S: the sanctuary already has considerable authority over the permits that are issued. Troubles me that notion of societal tradeoffs (bycatch, desal) is missing from this strategy. Would like to see some mention of the valuation of these tradeoffs.

Karen G: the example you're giving is in RP4, looking at other permit programs, RP4 looks at our permit programs. RP3 looks at other agencies' permit programs.

Tom R: you may minimize but you'll still have some impact. You have the option to either totally mitigate or minimize an impact. There's a range. Unless you offer a range for how you minimize impacts.

Kathy F: does sanctuary have a handle on the necessary info to make a decision on what's going to minimize impacts?

Karen G: this captures what MBNMS is *already* doing in current permit programs. This is stating what our current program is. Not changing or adding anything.

Dawn H: the plan reflects what we're currently doing and where we want to be going.

Kathy F: what is a soundscape?

Karen G: an area in sanctuary that has sound travelling through it, an expression of sound.

Paul R: This can be interpreted as you are reviewing projects, plans and permits and they are designed to minimize impacts to resources. Is that a correct interpretation?

Karen G: we can work on that interpretation, revise the language.

Strategy RP4

Steve S: question about the word enhance...

Karen G: enhance means the cumulative impacts of our permits, would like to have a spatial understanding of where those permits are occurring. There will be overlap of where permits occur. We would like to understand that better.

Tom R: improve would be a better term

Strategy RP7

Dawn H: interpretation helps with the level of compliance with disturbance issues – interpretative enforcement

Minimize impacts on resources – update language

Strategy RP10

Dan H: call Scott?

Karen G: yep

Steve S: brief presentation on plan would be great. Does the plan address oil spill response...

Karen G: maybe add presentation to 2018 meeting?

Scott K: OSPR and USCG manage oil spills, we assess impacts in sanctuary

Dan H: this would be worth a presentation at a future SAC meeting => oil spill response program

Tom R: Ensure that emergency response planning for coastal shipwrecks along the coast or in the waters of the MBNMS include iron-clad (mandatory) provisions for adequate physical security as a prevention (deterrent) for vandalism and potential fuel leaks. Mandatory provisions for adequate security – “information and planning” needed

Scott K: this strategy is about what we would do, how we would respond internally to an oil spill, not what the greater plan is overall.

Strategy RP11

No comments

Climate Change Action Plan

Goal: Address Coastal Resilience, Climate Adaptation and Ocean Acidification through capacity building and collaborative partnerships

Strategy CC 1 and 2

Sarah L: 1 is more about sanctuary operations – would it be helpful to have clarification in there that this is not the sanctuary trying to take on reducing greenhouse gases?

Karen G: the activities under that strategy explain that

Strategy CC4

Tom R: more related to coastal erosion, normal wave action isn't climate change

Karen G: focus of this AP is projects that can restore natural sources of sediment and areas of beaches, a subset of coastal management options to provide more of a buffer. This will be a cross referenced AP.

Strategy CC5

Katherine O: will you limit what is going to happen?

Karen G: we are the ancillary group to the work others are already doing. Purely tracking and sharing info.

John H: acknowledge Greater Farallones on their work on CC2

Marine Debris Action Plan

Goal: Assess and reduce the amount of marine debris in or entering Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary

Strategy MD2

Tom R: we need to lobby our local elected officials to address marine debris

Dawn H: we can inform but we can't lobby, not as a SAC but as individuals you can

Steve S: are these policies embracing the use of products other than plastics?

Karen G: that's where the education part comes into this AP...what are the alternatives to plastics.

Strategy MD1

John H: assess scope, scale and effects of marine debris?

Steve H: can there be some language about it being single use plastic rather than other plastics?

Elkhorn Slough Action Plan

Goal: Improve water quality, habitat, and living resources in Elkhorn Slough which has consistently shown poor scores in the MBNMS Condition Report

(<https://sanctuaries.noaa.gov/science/condition/monterey-bay-2015/>).

Tom R: support an evaluation of ongoing preservation and rehab programs. Has there been a comprehensive look at what is and isn't working?

Lisa U: MBNMS's condition report did that. Very comprehensive.

Bart S: lots of data but don't see the tangible stuff.

Lisa U: the socioeconomic stuff is your interest?

Bart S: wildlife disturbance specifically

Dawn H: wildlife disturbance is captured in the Wildlife Disturbance AP.

Bart S: there are no restrooms in the slough. People have to go miles to locate a restroom.

Lisa U: the AP doesn't really include the human impacts

Bart S: it is a great place...if it were managed.

Lisa U: is Team OCEAN collecting data?

Dawn H: they do collect data on disturbance.

Dan H: Elkhorn Slough compared to 40 years ago is a great improvement. Funding is a big issue.

ESF has put a lot of effort into that area. The harbor and erosion is an issue. They need support to continue the work/improvement.

Kathy F: heard Elkhorn Slough Foundation holdings were going to expand

Lisa U: a land acquisition, ESF and ESNERR will be monitoring that

Strategy ES2

Sarah L: where agriculture contributes to stressors, what's the main strategy?

Lisa U: AWQA, through partnerships and collaborations. Some strategies outlined in Water Quality AP. And citizen science programs throughout the year (Snapshot Day).

John H: sanctuary had successful program of contacting boat owners/live-aboards

Dawn H: that was Save Our Shores

John H: is live-aboards discharge still an issue?

Karen G: the harbors are trying to work on that issue.

Gary H: what's not addressed is a plan for managing the human interaction with wildlife and the slough itself. Developing restroom options...planning for allowing the experience in the slough without disturbing animals.

Lisa U: human impacts can be better defined in the AP. Need to develop viewing guidelines and outreach materials.

Dawn H: further characterize the issue

Mike B: is Moss Landing actually a town/township?

Lisa U: Moss Landing isn't technically a town. Many people (private landowners, local, state and fed government, etc.) collaborate to manage the area

Katherine O: strategies 2 and 3 have very powerful and direct wording. But activities have passive language. Are the activities actually going to reduce and improve?

Dan H: I disagree

Katherine O: promote and encourage? Language, more active language

Sarah L: fine line since MBNMS doesn't have a regulatory role, passive may be better since AWQA has good working terms with ag industry

Emerging Issues Action Plan

Goal: Develop a system to identify, track and appropriately respond to emerging issues presenting potential threats to Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary resources.

Dawn H: how we want to identify and track issues that aren't on our radar yet

John H: issue of how to juggle prioritization emerging issues with existing issues. How do things not get "de-prioritized"? Need some proactive way to prioritize emerging issues. Should address public relations issue – if there's a new issue you may have to give a statement to the press of why you are now not focusing on another issue.

Dawn H: emerging issues are larger scale, not a hot topic.

Wildlife Disturbance Action Plan

Goal: Maintain and improve protection of wildlife within the sanctuary by evaluating and remediating adverse impacts from human activities.

Keith R: whale-watching boats seem to go straight for seal rookery as they leave Monterey harbor. Does sanctuary have any input?

Scott K: didn't get any public comment on this. Do you see them actually get flushed into the water by the boats?

Keith R: they're sleeping there.

Dan H: for strategy 1, we had a working group chaired by Gary Hoffmann. Is the outcome of that working group being monitored? The outcome of whale watching operators working on a best practices guide.

Karen G: etiquette guidelines for whales is being developed, then distribute and assess for 4-6 months.

Steve H: would like to see relative measure of impact level – rank of "biggest bang for your buck"

Scott K: biggest is prevention. Best programs are BayNet and Team OCEAN for face-to-face interaction, outreach and education.

Steve S: I was only aware of a couple hundred comments coming in through public comment but you mentioned there being thousands. Are there comments that I missed somewhere?

Scott K: There were written comments and verbal comments. Comments have also come in since 2008. Public input is come from many places: the SAC, public at-large, other agencies, etc.)

Steve S: support activity 1.7

Steve H: what types of disturbances affect the most animals in the most ways?

Scott K: individual approaches to animals, cumulative, incremental approaches/impacts

Steve H: those impacts are worse than a tanker?

Scott K: yes, as far as addressing the user group. A tanker is one organized user group (a shipping company). The public/tourists is far more difficult to address.

Gary P: is there consideration for defining the zones in 1.7?

Scott K: it's just to determine what their use is. Do we need to maintain those buoys if they aren't really being used for the zones?

Steve S: WD-4 – seal bomb issue...probably going to get more public comment at April meeting on this

Karen G: SESA's included in Marine Spatial Planning (MSP) AP. Up for discussion.

Bart S: at June SAC meeting we adopted ocean noise recommendations and we have yet to convene a WG.

Steve S: Activity 4.2 - where is your authority in harbors? (pile driving in a harbor)

Dawn H: we don't have authority in the harbors.

Tucker H: but that doesn't mean you can't work with the harbor because of potential issues

WD7-8 are tabled until approx. April

Coastal Erosion & Sediment Management Action Plan

Goal: Reduce human caused coastal erosion and collaborate with local, state and federal agencies to address and restore sediment balance throughout MBNMS.

Steve S: could Harbors have a meeting with sanctuary staff about this AP then bring back to SAC? We have a lot of questions.

Karen G: Yep, good approach.

Tom R: coastal wave action still responsible for loosening sediments. Following up on CEMEX site – land mgmt. plan for CEMEX from Salinas River to Monterey Harbor, not just right at the CEMEX plant.

Karen G: monitoring that entire area is included.

Katherine O: “reduce coastal armoring” language? Is that reduce existing armoring or removal?

Karen G: looking at compliance of existing permits, maintaining existing. Looking to minimize additional armoring.

Maritime Heritage Action Plan

Goal: Identify, protect and raise awareness of the cultural, historical and archaeological resources in MBNMS.

Tom R: Monterey City Council supported underwater dive sites e.g., sinking ships

Dawn H: that's under a different AP – Marine Spatial Planning

Steve S: is there a definition of submerged archeological resources? Where would I find that? Specifically, what makes it an “archeological resource”? A certain number of years?

Dawn H: would have to look at ONMS website, will include definitions in intro to AP: cultural resources, maritime resources, historic resources.

Dan H: who's doing the inventory?

Dawn H: Bob Schwimmer

John H: are there any more vessels like the Montebello that could potentially be an issue?

Dawn H: not to our knowledge in Monterey Bay.

Kathy F: concern about removal of nuclear waste dumped by military. Can it be removed or cemented in?

Karen Reyna: There has been a lot of research done. No concerted effort in removal because of the risk.

Keith R: Too risky to bring up.

Brian N: best way to contain it is under water and under pressure. It's also been monitored for years.

Education, Outreach and Communication Action Plan

Goal: Increase protection of sanctuary resources by building greater public understanding, engagement, and stewardship in our highly diverse coastal communities.

Tom R: no exhibit at MBA that highlights MBNMS

Amity W: MBA is very supportive of MBNMS, but their focus is not educating visitors about the sanctuary.

John H: are these strategies prioritized in any way? How will metrics be developed to evaluate effectiveness?

Amity W: some of that is already developed...

Meeting adjourned at 4:29 PM