

**MONTEREY BAY NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY
ADVISORY COUNCIL**

**Final Meeting Minutes
December 8, 2016
Casa Munras Garden Hotel & Spa
Andalucia I Room
Monterey, CA**

VOTING MEMBERS

Agriculture: absent	CA State Parks: Eric Abma
AMBAG: Ed Smith	Conservation: Katherine O'Dea
At Large: Gary Hoffmann	Diving: Brian Nelson
At Large: Dan Haifley	Education: Tucker Hirsch
At Large: PJ Webb	Commercial Fishing: Kathy Fosmark
Business & Industry: Al Budris	Harbors: Steve Scheiblaue
CA Coastal Commission: absent	Recreation: Gary Pezzi
CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife: Paul Reilly	Recreational Fishing: Rich Hughett
CA EPA: absent	Research: Dr. John Hunt
CA Resources Agency: absent	Tourism: Mike Bekker

NON-VOTING MEMBERS

Channel Islands NMS: absent
College: Clifton Herrmann
Cordell Banks NMS: absent
Elkhorn Slough NERR: absent
Greater Farallones NMS: Max Delaney
Monterey Bay NMS: Paul Michel
National Marine Fisheries Service: Dr. Steven Lindley
U.S. Coast Guard: LT Kip Hutchinson

Alternates present in audience:

Christina McGinnis – At-Large
Carol Maehr – At-Large
Tom Rowley – Business & Industry
Megan Rodenbeck – College
Jim Moser – Commercial Fishing
Letise LaFeir – Conservation
Dawn Hayes – Monterey Bay NMS
Bart Selby – Recreation
Jose Montes – Recreational Fishing

I. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND MEETING MINUTES

Chair PJ Webb called the meeting to order and Secretary Brian Nelson attended to roll call.

Clyde Roberson, Mayor of Monterey welcomed the Advisory Council to Monterey. He gave a brief overview of the sanctuary (date of establishment, ecological significance, species, etc.) and the importance of stewardship. He also mentioned a visit he had with students visiting from Japan. The students felt Monterey Bay was much cleaner than their waters which are inundated with plastic debris. He praised MBNMS and the Advisory Council for their work and stewardship to the sanctuary.

Ted Balestreri, Chairman and CEO of Cannery Row Company, also welcomed the Advisory Council. Mr. Balestreri previously served on MBNMS's Advisory Council and was recently appointed to the US Department of Commerce Travel and Tourism Advisory Board. He mentioned the importance of our oceans and the historical significance of Monterey Bay. He is working to support the nomination of MBNMS as part of a World Heritage site. He also mentioned the importance of the Advisory Council that serves as ambassadors for MBNMS.

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

Approval of October, 2016 DRAFT Meeting Minutes

MOTION: Dan Haifley, Steve Scheiblaue seconded.

(Vote: 14 in favor, 0 opposed, 2 abstentions)

Advisory Council Member Discussion

It was suggested public comment should be limited to what can fit on the public comment card. There should not be supplemental information included in the meeting minutes.

II. STANDING ITEM: Superintendent Report

MBNMS staff have been working on an issue discovered by students of Carmel High School. Golf balls from the golf course in Pebble Beach are ending up in the sanctuary. Sanctuary staff is working with Pebble Beach Company and Monterey Bay Aquarium to come up with a survey and response plan including where the golf balls might be, and initial and future clean up plans. Staff will be meeting with Pebble Beach Company next week to go over the plan.

MBNMS's Resource Protection team is working on Cal AM environmental review documents. A draft Environmental Impact Review will be available early 2017 for the proposed Cal Am desalination project.

September 18th, 2017 is the 25th anniversary of MBNMS being designated as a national marine sanctuary. There will be events throughout the year to celebrate the anniversary. Amity Wood will be coordinating the events. Celebration ideas can be sent to her.

The support letter for MBNMS's World Heritage site nomination can be revisited by the AC in February when Department of Interior opens a public comment period. The letter of support considered by the AC in October was a missed opportunity. In the future the AC needs to be very clear in how motions are articulated and AC members need to be prepared for discussion at meetings to avoid unnecessary abstentions in the voting process.

Advisory Council Member Discussion

Some council members felt they did not receive enough information to make an informed decision to support the World Heritage site nomination. Other members felt it is the members' responsibility to do their own research once a topic is presented in order to provide information and advice to the

MBNMS Superintendent. It was suggested to form a subcommittee responsible for fact finding on World Heritage sites while remaining neutral in opinion. The subcommittee will present these facts at the February 2017 AC meeting.

A motion was made by Al Budris to set up a subcommittee tasked with putting together facts on World Heritage Site status to inform the AC.

Seconded by Katherine O'Dea.

Ed Smith made a friendly amendment to the motion for the subcommittee to fact find, bring the information back to the AC while still allowing time for stakeholders to provide feedback, then the entire AC will make recommendation to the MBNMS Superintendent.

Seconded by Gary Pezzi.

Motion: PASSED

(Vote: 16 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions)

The following AC members volunteered for the World Heritage Site fact finding subcommittee: Mike Bekker, Al Budris, Kathy Fosmark, Tucker Hirsch, Gary Hoffmann, Letise LaFeir, Steve Lindley, Carol Maehr, Katherine O'Dea, Steve Scheiblaue, Ed Smith, PJ Webb. The Chair for this subcommittee is Al Budris.

III. STANDING ITEM: MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS

Carol Maehr, At-Large alternate: no new announcements

Rich Hughett, Recreational Fishing primary: He was invited to attend the ONMS Recreational Fishing Summit in Washington, DC the week of December 12th. He will report on the summit at the next Advisory Council meeting.

John Hunt, Research primary: no new announcements

Steve Scheiblaue, Harbors primary: Dredging should happen in Monterey some time in December. Also working with Doug Smith from CSUMB regarding beach profiles. They are developing a study to determine how beach nourishment is doing over time.

Dan Haifley, At-Large primary: no new announcements

Gary Hoffmann, At-Large primary: no new announcements

Brian Nelson, Diving primary: Both Diving seats are up for review and re-appointment. Both Phil Sammet (Diving alternate) and Brian intend to reapply for another term with MBNMS's Advisory Council (AC). The AC Diving Newsletter was published for December 2016. The newsletter went out to 2,431 email addresses with a 28.8% open rate and a 12.3% click through rate. The next big dive event is May 6th and 7th at the Long Beach Scuba Show and Film Festival. Lastly, the Diving representatives are hoping to have a presentation on golf ball deterioration and in a synergistic manner work collaboratively to find holistic solutions to this growing concern at the February 2017 AC meeting.

Mike Bekker, Tourism primary: no new announcements

PJ Webb, At-Large primary: The first birth of the elephant seal season occurred. Concerned there will be elephant seal beta bulls at San Simeon Cove where 750,000 people come to visit. Currently gearing up for outreach with Elephant Seal Ambassadors docent volunteers.

Gary Pezzi, Recreation primary: no new announcements

Steve Lindley, NMFS primary: no new announcements

Katherine O'Dea, Conservation primary: no new announcements

Al Budris, Business & Industry primary: Unemployment in Monterey County is now under 10%. National rate of unemployment is 4%. There has been some healthy business growth. Shea Homes will be doing large developments in Seaside and Marina. They are committing one billion dollars over the next 10 years to build out Seaside and Marina. Al sits on the Economic Vitality Committee of MP Chamber of Commerce. The committee has identified the single most important need on the peninsula is workforce development. The largest commercial occupiers of commercial space on the peninsula is medical marijuana. There is a commercial lending space shortage right now because of it. CSUMB's collaboration with the country of Costa Rica for a sustainability symposium is intent on development of a sustainable hospitality program for all hotels on the peninsula to become greener and a showcase for world.

Ed Smith, AMBAG primary: AMBAG is comprised of elected voting members. The makeup of AMBAG will be changing. The conference center in Monterey is on schedule to open by April 1st.

Tucker Hirsch, Education primary: We have decided to dissolve the Sanctuary Education Panel (SEP). When it was first established, it supported the development of education programs for the Sanctuary. Now the education programs are doing well and have a dedicated staff and the SEP is not needed in that capacity. We will call on members of the educational community when/if we need to stand up an ad-hoc working group. Also, the Fishermen in the Classroom program and partnership with Real Good Fish is progressing. Real Good Fish has submitted a grant to the CA Coastal Commission, is working on one to submit to Monterey County F&W, and is even looking at one through USDA. The idea is that Real Good Fish runs the programs, with "in-kind" donations of services by the education staff at the Sanctuary. We bring many of the fishermen as well as the curriculum.

Eric Abma, CA State Parks alternate: no new announcements

Kip Hutchinson, US Coast Guard alternate: no new announcements

Kathy Fosmark, Commercial Fishing primary: There is no local domoic acid issue anymore. The crab pot retrieval program is now in place and going well. Some pots have already been returned. Fishermen do have to pay to get their pots back. The salmon fishery was slow this season. The albacore tuna fishery is mainly a northern fishery this season due to El Niño.

Clifton Herrmann, College primary: Constituent outreach - In order to more effectively represent the constituents of our seat, we have begun the process of building a communication framework within

CSUMB, with the ultimate goal of developing structure that allows inter-university communication regarding Sanctuary issues. Our efforts include reaching out to the CSUMB Marine Science Club to gain insight to methods that may facilitate effective communication. Recommendations include social media outlets and regular meetings on campus. We aim to develop a communication structure that can be passed on to future College seat SAC members.

Relevant achievements - In collaboration with the Sanctuary under Dr. James Lindholm with guidance from Dr. Andrew DeVogelaere, graduate students at CSUMB have recently completed a semester-long literature review of 1,186 peer-reviewed scientific articles taking place within MBNMS. This project included both spatial and focal topic-based analysis, and to our knowledge is the first study of this type to be conducted in a National Marine Sanctuary. The document is in its final editing stage, and will be submitted for publication in NOAA's Science Conservation Series.

Paul Reilly, CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife primary: An approximately 50-mile portion of the commercial Dungeness crab fishery between Point Reyes, Marin County and near Salt Point, Sonoma County, which has been closed due to elevated domoic acid levels, opened on Dec. 3 at the recommendation of state health agencies. However, the fishery will remain closed north of Salt Point to the Humboldt Bay entrance. The closed portions of the coast may open once testing by state agencies shows that the area is safe with regard to domoic acid levels.

Much of the local recreational fishing effort focused on Dungeness crab. The fishery opened in November.

No squid or sardine landings have occurred in the Monterey Bay area the past few months, but a little more than 1,000 metric tons of anchovies were landed.

When the Pacific Fishery Management Council (Council) meets in April they will likely recommend a 1-ton trip limit with 1 trip per day coast-wide for coastal pelagic species (sardine, mackerel, and anchovy) so a small-scale directed fishery can continue when the main fisheries are closed.

The Council has directed the appropriate committees to develop an integrated stock assessment and procedures for setting and updating an overfishing limit, an acceptable biological catch and a Minimum Stock Size Threshold for the central subpopulation of northern anchovy.

Of note, several juvenile giant seabass were caught by anglers in the Morro Bay area. This species is prohibited to retain. One fish was mistakenly landed. This is the first observation for this species north of Point Conception by our California Recreational Fisheries Survey samplers.

Jim Moser, Commercial Fishing alternate: Crab fishing is considerably slow south of Half Moon Bay. There are more rock crabs than Dungeness crabs right now. There has been a shift in the bottom species being caught.

Bart Selby, Recreation alternate: no new announcements

Letise LaFeir, Conservation alternate: Pleased that Proposition 67 passed. Thanked the AC for supporting the proposition that Monterey Bay Aquarium and MBNMS's Conservation Working Group helped put together. Monterey Bay Aquarium hosted a plastic pollution symposium.

Katherine O'Dea, Conservation primary, gave a presentation. California Legislation is back in session. February may be Letise's last AC meeting as she is moving down south.

Megan Rodenbeck, College alternate: no new announcements

Jose Montes, Recreational Fishing alternate: Agreed there has not been a presence of Dungeness crab lately and has not been able to reach the daily catch limit this season.

Advisory Council Member Discussion

There was concern the Sanctuary Education Panel (SEP) was being dissolved. It was explained the SEP did not have any specific tasks at this time to work on and did not want to have meetings without having a goal. Former SEP members and AC members will be called together for their input and expertise when there are specific items needing to be addressed. The amount of education and outreach currently being done will not reduce in any way. This model is utilized at CINMS.

IV: PUBLIC COMMENT FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Mary Ciesinski – Environmental Center of San Luis Obispo County
Chumash Heritage National Marine Sanctuary (CHNMS) - support of CHNMS

Nan J. Cole – Sierra Club Santa Lucia Chapter
Chumash Heritage National Marine Sanctuary - start the designation process

Mandy Davis – private citizen
Chumash Heritage National Marine Sanctuary

Alex Weber and Jack Johnston – Carmel High School students
Golf balls in the marine environment - our findings in the marine ecosystems and proposal for further marine golf ball clean ups in a variety of locations that have not been explored. YouTube video:
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OVsj1pmhiJE>

V: ADVISORY COUNCIL 2017 CALENDAR

Nichole Rodriguez proposed the 2017 Advisory Council calendar. She pointed out there will be a total of six meetings in 2017. The February 17th meeting will be in Moss Landing. Topics include SAC recruitment process, Management Plan Review workshop on marine debris, Management Plan Review working group recommendations, fact finding results from the World Heritage Site Subcommittee and golf balls in MBNMS. The April 21st meeting will be in Santa Cruz. Topics include Management Plan Review workshop on beach nourishment, Management Plan Review staff update on the Agriculture Water Quality Alliance, Watsonville Wetlands and the Recreational Fishing Summit. The June 16th meeting will be in Cambria. Topics include an update on desalination in MBNMS. The August 16th meeting will be in Half Moon Bay. This will be a joint meeting with GFNMS. The October 20th meeting will be in Salinas. Topics include an overview of the draft MBNMS Management Plan. The December 15th meeting will be in Monterey. Topics include setting the 2018 AC meeting schedule and drafting an AC 2018 work plan.

MOTION: Dan Haifley, John Hunt seconded.

(Vote: 16 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions)

VI. INFORMATION ITEM: Advisory Council Recruitment

Kristen Hart gave a brief presentation on the AC member terms ending in February 2017. All members with terms ending in February 2017 will need to reapply if they would like to keep their seat. Terms ending include: At-Large (primary and alternate), Diving (primary and alternate), Education (alternate), Tourism (primary and alternate). Recruitment is scheduled to begin on

February 1st and run through February 28th. A nomination committee will be established among AC members whose terms are not ending in February 2017.

VII: Greater Farallones Superintendent's Report

Beyond the Golden Gate Symposium (BGG) – The BGG was held at the Romberg Tiburon Center in Tiburon last Thursday. The event was such a success that it sold out and we had to turn away people. GFNMS co-hosted this event with Science staff from Cordell Bank NMS, as well as Point Reyes National Seashore, Bodega Marine Lab, San Francisco (SF) State University, the NOAA Sentinel Site Collaborative, the Greater Farallones Association, Point Blue, and SF Bay National Estuarine Research Reserve. Over 160 researchers and resource managers attended this meeting which provided a ton of rapid-fire oral presentations giving attendees a quick synopsis of current and planned research and monitoring projects throughout the region. Twenty-two project posters were also presented during an evening reception. A broad range of disciplines were represented at the symposium, including geography and mapping, ecology of habitats, oceanographic processes, influences on productivity, sediment and marine debris transport, coastal erosion, predator-prey relationships, planning for climate change impacts, and resource management issues, status and trends. The Proceedings and PDFs of the presentations and posters can be found at <http://www.sfbaynerr.org/goldengate2016/>. For more information contact Jan.Roletto@noaa.gov.

Ocean Climate Initiative – GFNMS staff that have been working on our Ocean Climate Initiative just completed a Climate Action Plan in November. The OCI was started in 2008 and prior to that the effects of climate change on our sanctuaries coasts and ocean resources was not well understood. The Climate Action Plan is the result of a 2-year process to characterize climate impacts and vulnerabilities to Sanctuary resources along the North-central California coast and ocean and to develop management strategies to respond to and decrease those vulnerabilities, ultimately enhancing resource resilience to climate impacts. The Plan represents the culmination of a GFNMS Sanctuary Advisory Council planning process that resulted in the development of 78 adaptation strategy recommendations for the region's management agencies to take to enhance coastal habitat resilience. The Plan presents the final adaptation strategies from these recommendations that GFNMS would like to pursue, including a few additional strategies proposed and finalized by staff. To learn more about the vulnerability assessment that provided the informational foundation for this work, see <http://sanctuaries.noaa.gov/science/conservation/vulnerability-assessment-gfnms.html>. To learn more about the working group process that informed this Plan, refer to the Council's final Climate-Smart Adaptation Report: <http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/climate/pdf/Climate-SmartAdaptationReport.pdf>.

Microplastics Trawl – San Francisco Estuary Institute is working with 5 Gyres – plans to conduct three trawls over the next year or so outside the golden gate in GNFMS, northern MBNMS, and CBNMS, during both wet and dry seasons. Goal is to start to characterize and quantify microplastics in the marine environment, and specifically the extent and severity to which outflow from SF bay is loading microplastics into sanctuary waters. SFEI published their first paper on this topic for SF Bay last year.

Education events – Sanctuary Explorations Program is planning a tide pooling event this coming Sunday December 11th at pillar point in Half Moon Bay. Contact Sarah Heintzelman at GFNMS for more info. Contact: sarah.heintzelman@noaa.gov.

Mavericks Surf Competition – The NOAA permit has been issued for the annual Mavericks surf contest in Half Moon Bay. The permit was issued to Titans of Mavericks LLC. GFNMS staff needs to confirm whether the organizers have received their USCG Marine Events Permit (MEP) yet; the NOAA permit is only valid once the MEP is issued. The contest organizers have also obtained their CA Coastal Commission (CCC) permit after a public hearing and vote was held on November 6. The CCC is requiring the contest include a women's heat for the first time ever this seasons. Once they have all permits in place, the contest "window" is open until March 31st. The actual contest date will be determined approximately 48-72 hours ahead of time.

Emergency Response Incidents – A 528-foot-long dry dock sank on October 26th approximately 1 nautical mile inside the western boundary of the northern portion of MBNMS (due west of San Gregorio Beach). NOAA Office of Law Enforcement has opened an enforcement case and is working with GFNMS staff as the lead and MBNMS supporting to gather more information on the incident including the design and dimensions of the dry dock, the exact location where it sank, and insurance/liability issues. GFNMS will be working on a plan shortly to try and locate it using a deep sea ROV.

On November 27th a panga carrying a large quantity of marijuana grounded at Año Nuevo State Beach in San Mateo County in the northern portion of MBNMS. The Homeland Security Investigations (HSI) agency apprehended three suspects on board and additional people waiting on shore with a vehicle to pick up the contraband and also seized the marijuana. USCG removed all the fuel tanks and also took two outboard engines and batteries. Because the panga is involved in a criminal investigation, HSI also took possession of the vessel for evidence. They hired a contractor to remove it on December 5th using an excavator to tow it to the north end of the beach and load it on a flatbed trailer.

Advisory Council Member Discussion

A question was raised about jet skis going too fast within Pillar Point Harbor. Max explained MBNMS/GFNMS does not have jurisdiction within the harbor.

VIII: ACTION ITEM: Letter to encourage enhancement of enforcement services

PJ Webb introduced the letter and gave some background information. The enforcement discussion panel, a group of AC members representing each region of the national marine sanctuaries, decided to write a system-wide letter, in lieu of one that was site or region-specific, in order to (1.) call attention to the enforcement themes shared by every site across the system; and, (2.) capitalize on the expediency of timing a letter with the change to a new administration in early 2017. The letter recognizes the importance of enforcement in sanctuaries and monuments and focuses on what each actor, from the incoming NOAA Administrator to advisory councils, can do to improve and augment enforcement across the national marine sanctuary system.

Dayna Matthews, Enforcement Coordinator with NOAA Office of Law Enforcement discussed the difference between guidelines and regulations. MBNMS has guidelines, not regulations, which does not allow law enforcement to step in. He mentioned OLE's appreciation of Advisory Councils' interest in supporting enforcement.

Advisory Council Member Discussion

There was discussion to clarify the overall intention of the letter of support. All Advisory Council Chairs would like to sign and send the same letter in order to send a consistent message about enforcement in sanctuaries.

A motion was made by Rich Hughett to approve the letter as it was submitted.
Seconded by Gary Hoffmann.

Motion: PASSED

(Vote: 15 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions)

IX: ACTION ITEM: Letter of support for state-funded research vessel

Jim Harvey, Director of Moss Landing Marine Laboratories (MLML), introduced the letter and discussed the importance of the proposed research vessel to be operated jointly by MLML and Scripps Institution of Oceanography (SIO). Recently, the Research Vessel *Point Sur*, owned by the National Science Foundation (NSF) and operated by MLML, was sold. SIO is also retiring two of their vessels. With the loss of these vessels, there will be no regional class research vessel (RCRV) operating in the University-National Oceanographic Laboratory System fleet off California. The proposed RCRV will be designed, built and operated by MLML and SIO in partnership with San Jose State University and the California State University system. The design and construction of the RCRV will be about \$20 million. Maintenance and operation costs will be shared by MLML and SIO.

Advisory Council Member Discussion

There was discussion to clarify the timeline of the process to obtain the vessel as well as why vessels were sold or retired before a new vessel became available. It will take six to seven years to obtain the vessel. The Office of Management and Budget directed NSF to sell the Research Vessel *Point Sur*.

A motion was made by Dan Haifley to approve sending this letter of support.
Seconded by Rich Hughett.

Motion: PASSED

(Vote: 14 in favor, 0 opposed, 2 abstentions)

X: INFORMATION ITEM: Management Plan Review update

Dawn Hayes gave a brief update on MBNMS's Management Plan Review (MPR). Staff updates, AC workshops and information items will continue through June 2017. The two wildlife disturbance working groups continue to meet and will make recommendations at the February 2017 AC meeting along with the Motorized Personal Watercraft Subcommittee. Staff updates scheduled for future AC meetings include marine debris, Agriculture Water Quality Alliance (AWQA) and sediment management. Updates yet to be scheduled include Regional Water Quality network, wildlife outreach and outreach on marine events. Dawn also reviewed the MPR timeline which included the draft Management Plan (MP) presented to the AC for input in October 2017, the draft MP submitted to ONM Headquarters for review in December 2017, public comment period on the draft MP between March and May 2018 and the final MP issues in 2019.

XI: INFORMATION ITEM: Management Plan Review Workshop – Urban Runoff

Jeff Condit with Monterey Regional Stormwater Management Program (MRSWMP) gave a presentation on the connection between stormwater, urban runoff and water quality. Stormwater flows directly to local waterways and most often is not treated. Pollution in stormwater can

negatively impact waterways and receiving water bodies. Stormwater is regulated under acts such as the Porter-Cologne Water Quality Act of 1969 and the Clean Water Act Amended of 1987. MRSWMP is a local response program focused on mitigating pollution, investigating and enforcing regulations, educating and inspecting businesses, good housekeeping processes, community engagement and stormwater sampling. Next steps for MRSWMP include a trash amendment, Stormwater Resource Plan and Areas of Special Biological Significance Compliance Plans.

Dane Hardin with Applied Marine Sciences gave a presentation on the Central Coast Regional Monitoring Program and Areas of Special Biological Significance (ASBS). ASBS's are State Water Quality Protection Areas. There are thirty-four areas designated by the State Water Resources Control Board and all prohibit discharge of waste without an exemption. The Central Coast Regional Monitoring Program conducts water quality testing at various outfalls, reference sites and background sites between southern Marin County and southern Monterey County. Samples are taken before and after a storm at the various outfalls and sites. Between 2013 and 2016 higher concentrations of every tested trace metal except silver were found in the northern reference sites. Every tested trace metal, total suspended solids and urea had higher average pre-storm concentrations at the northern ASBS sites. According to their findings, marine biological resources are not obviously affected by ASBS storm discharges but are potentially affected by some trace metals and pesticides. Dane recommended MBNMS to create a cohesive regional water quality monitoring program that addresses cost-effectively tracking trends and determining cause and solution for water quality problems.

Bridget Hoover, MBNMS staff member, gave a presentation on the current MBNMS Water Quality Protection Program action plan that addresses urban runoff. Before Municipal Separate Storm Sewer System (MS4) permits through the Regional Water Quality Control Board (RWQCB) were required, the urban runoff action plan included strategies such as public education, technical training, regional urban runoff management, sediment/erosion, storm drain inspections, structural/non-structural controls and CEQA additions. Bridget discussed MBNMS's involvement in addressing urban runoff since the initiation of MS4 permits. She talked about MBNMS's role in First Flush, Urban Watch in Pacific Grove, ASBS monitoring assistance, illicit discharge detection monitoring, best management practices (BMP) effectiveness monitoring, emergency response and technical advisory committees. The MPR proposes to have one water quality action plan that addresses the following strategies: outreach and education, facilitate coordination of regional efforts, better understand land and sea connections, effectiveness of BMP's and communicate and promote water quality status and trends.

Advisory Council Member Discussion

Paul Michel asked the Advisory Council if there is anything MBNMS staff should do differently moving forward in the updated management plan. It was suggested for staff to create a cohesive regional water quality monitoring program and offered the AC to help facilitate that. Bridget Hoover mentioned the Research Activity Panel is already looking into this and a large amount of work has already been done with multiple cities on this topic.

XII: Working Group Updates

Wildlife disturbance - approach issues: Received input from the whale watching industry at the last meeting. The working group is scheduled to have a follow up meeting on December 20th. Working group members will focus on developing recommendations to bring to the AC.

Wildlife disturbance – ocean noise: There have been five meetings with presentations from six acoustic experts. The working group is still working on finalizing recommendations to the AC. They will probably recommend more research. The hydrophone in the bay has recorded 2,800 seal bombs going off in one year.

Motorized Personal Watercraft Subcommittee (MPWC): no new announcements

GFNMS Overflight Working Group: The working group, consisting of pilots and biologists, are trying to agree on overflight zones for aircraft in San Mateo County through Sonoma County with special emphasis on Devil's Slide Rock. There have been 700-1,000 volunteer hours on this topic over 2016. The working group should be making recommendations in February.

Conservation Working Group (CWG): Last month the working group talked about the World Heritage Site nomination. Last week the working group focused on non-point source marine debris. They will prepare to give recommendations during the marine debris workshop at the February AC meeting.

Sanctuary Education Panel (SEP): no new announcements

Research Activity Panel (RAP) – The Research Activity Panel met on 4 November at the Elkhorn Slough National Estuarine Research Reserve. Kerstin Wasson, the ESNERR Research Coordinator, hosted the meeting and presented an update on research and conservation activities around the Slough.

The RAP continued its work on the Management Plan update, particularly focusing on Action Plans related to research and long-term monitoring. These are complex topics involving a number of sanctuary partners, and they continue to generate constructive discussions and new approaches. One focus of this RAP Management Plan effort is on enhancing the effectiveness of MBNMS partnerships. Along these lines we are happy to announce that the National Oceanographic Partnership Program, established by Congress in 1997, awarded their 2016 Excellence in Partnering Award to the National Marine Sanctuaries as Sentinel Sites for a Demonstration Marine Biodiversity Observation Network. MBNMS Research Coordinator Andrew DeVogelaere, scientists from MBARI and other members of the RAP devoted time and expertise to this effort. This is a commitment to cooperation we hope to build on.

The RAP has some retirements and new members. Dr. Churchill Grimes, retired Director of the NOAA Fisheries Santa Cruz Laboratory, and Dr. Steve Ramp of Soliton Ocean Services and CenCOOS are both moving to the east coast and retiring from the RAP. We thank them both for many years of excellent advice. In response, the RAP membership has been shuffled a bit and three new members have joined. New RAP members are:

- Ross Clark, Central Coast Wetlands Group Director, as primary member for the Estuarine Environment;
- Dr. Kerry Nickols, CSUMB Assistant Professor of Natural Sciences, as primary member for the Nearshore Environment; and
- Brian Owens, CDFW Marine Region Environmental Scientist, as alternate member for Fisheries.

Recreation and Tourism Subcommittee (RATS) – The RATS Newsletter has been published for December 2016. The newsletter went out to 588 email addresses with a 7.5% click through rate. RATS meetings will restart after the first of the year with Lisa Uttal and/or Amity Wood from MBNMS staff.

Meeting adjourned at 4:19 PM