

**MONTEREY BAY NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY
ADVISORY COUNCIL**

Final Meeting Minutes

June 17, 2016

Monterey Peninsula College, Monterey

VOTING MEMBERS

Agriculture: Kirk Schmidt	CA State Parks: absent
AMBAG: absent	Conservation: Katherine O’Dea
At Large: Dan Haifley	Diving: Brian Nelson
At Large: Gary Hoffmann	Education: Tucker Hirsch
At Large: PJ Webb	Commercial Fishing: Kathy Fosmark
Business & Industry: Al Budris	Harbors: Steve Scheiblaue
CA Coastal Commission: Tami Grove	Recreation: Gary Pezzi
CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife: Paul Reilly	Recreational Fishing: Rich Hughett
CA EPA: absent	Research: John Hunt
CA Natural Resources Agency: Cyndi Dawson	Tourism: Mike Bekker

NON-VOTING MEMBERS

College: Clifton Herrmann
Channel Islands NMS: absent
Cordell Banks NMS: absent
Elkhorn Slough NERR: Dave Feliz
Greater Farallones NMS: absent
Monterey Bay NMS: Paul Michel
National Marine Fisheries Service: Steven Lindley
U.S. Coast Guard: absent

Alternates present in audience:

Jimmy Dutra: Agriculture
Carol Maehr: At-Large
Christina McGinnis: At-Large
Tom Rowley: Business/Industry
Megan Rodenbeck: College
Bart Selby: Recreation
Jose Montes: Recreational Fishing
Steven Haddock: Research
Dawn Hayes: Monterey Bay NMS

I. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND MEETING MINUTES

PJ Webb called the meeting to order and Secretary Dan Haifley attended to roll call.

Kevin Raskoff, Chair of the Monterey Peninsula College (MPC) Biology Department, welcomed the MBNMS Advisory Council to MPC. MPC is one of 113 community colleges in California. There

are over 2.3 million students enrolled in the California community college system. MPC's principle mission focuses on supporting students pursuing transfer, career training, basic skills and lifelong learning opportunities. The majority of biology students are looking to transfer to a university for further education. All of the classes he teaches integrate MBNMS whether it is examining the rocky intertidal, sandy intertidal, slough or watershed. Some of the MPC student projects in MBNMS include water quality studies, intertidal sampling and work on local sand dunes.

Nine new members were sworn in: Jimmy Dutra – Agriculture alternate, Carol Maehr - At-Large alternate, Al Budris - Business/Industry primary, Tom Rowley - Business/Industry alternate, Clifton Herrmann - College primary, Megan Rodenbeck – College alternate, Katherine O'Dea – Conservation primary, Jose Montes – Recreational Fishing alternate, Steven Haddock – Research alternate.

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

Approval of April 21, 2016 DRAFT Meeting Minutes

MOTION: Brian Nelson, Gary Pezzi seconded.

(Vote: 10 in favor, 0 opposed, 6 abstentions)

II. STANDING ITEM: SUPERINTENDENT'S REPORT

ONMS received the AC's letter regarding the CEMEX sand mine. MBNMS Staff is waiting for the opinion from legal staff and will share that information as soon as possible.

Paul attended the GFNMS AC's meeting in May. He reported on the proposed list of workshops, working groups and topics for staff to address during the MBNMS Management Plan Review (MPR) process. The GFNMS AC would like to send representatives to attend MBNMS MPR workshops. This will allow them to update the GFNMS AC on issues involving the MBNMS northern management area.

Paul attended a meeting put on by the State of California and Bureau of Ocean Energy Management (BOEM). The purpose was to initiate a state and federal task force to look at an offshore wind energy proposal. Trident Winds is looking to purchase lease for construction of wind farms off Morro Bay. The proposed footprint runs along MBNMS in the southern region. This task force is the first step in a multi-year process for consideration. State of California policy is very aggressive in establishing renewable energies. In 2008, California consisted of 12% renewable energies. Today, it consists of 25% renewable energies and in 2030 the goal is to be at 50% renewable energies.

Get Into Your Sanctuary day will be happening on June 25th at Sanctuary Exploration Center in Santa Cruz. Vendors will be present and giving demonstrations of various recreational activities such as kayaking, surfing and diving that allow visitors to take advantage of what the sanctuary has to offer. There will also be multiple presentations that will connect live to an offshore deep sea exploration mission.

Advisory Council Member Discussion

Q: Is BOEM its own entity?

A: BOEM is part of the Department of Interior.

Q: How much energy would this proposed wind farm create?

A: It's all public information you can find online.

Q: Would the devices be tethered and not anchored?

A: It depends on the different requirements for various oceanic conditions whether it would be tethered or anchored.

Q: How far offshore would this wind farm be?

A: About 30 miles offshore.

Q: Is the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission involved in this process?

A: No.

Q: Is MBNMS the lead agency on the CEMEX issue?

A: There are many agencies involved. California Coastal Commission is taking the lead on the state side.

III. ACTION ITEM: NOMINATIONS AND ELECTIONS OF EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

PJ Webb took nominations for Council Chair. PJ was the sole nominee and was confirmed as Council Chair. PJ took nominations for Council Vice-Chair. Gary Pezzi was the sole nominee and was confirmed as Council Vice-Chair. PJ took nominations for Council Secretary. Brian Nelson was the sole nominee and was confirmed as Council Secretary.

IV. PUBLIC COMMENT FOR ITEMS NOT ON AGENDA

Rex Keyes – Elkhorn Yacht Club

There is an abundance of sealife to see two to three miles outside entrance of Moss Landing Harbor.

V. INFORMATION ITEM: SEDIMENT MANAGEMENT PLAN COUNCIL WORKSHOP

Karen Grimmer gave a presentation on the implementation of Sediment Management Plans in MBNMS. She discussed the MBNMS 2008 Coastal Armoring Action Plan, two Coastal Regional Sediment Management Plans and a MBNMS supported report on the evaluation of erosion mitigation. The goal of the MBNMS 2008 Coastal Armoring Action Plan was to reduce expansion of hard coastal armoring in coastal areas near MBNMS through proactive regional planning, project tracking and comprehensive permit analysis and compliance. Key strategies included developing and implementing a regional approach to coastal armoring and pursuing a pilot program for coastal armoring alternatives. The two Coastal Regional Sediment Management Plans (CRSMP), completed in partnership with US Army Corps of Engineers, included Southern Monterey Bay CRSMP, 2008 and Santa Cruz Littoral Cell CSRMP, 2015. Objectives for the CRSMPs included being region specific, consistency with CSMW goals, development by local/regional stakeholders and focus on implementation. Karen touched on Beach Erosion Concern Areas (BECAs) as well as the CEMEX sand mine. Lastly, MBNMS supported the 2012 report “*Evaluation of Erosion Mitigation Alternatives for Southern Monterey Bay.*” This report assessed various erosion mitigation measures used to address coastal hazards in southern Monterey Bay. Some key recommendations from the report included: cessation of sand mining from the beach, consider beach nourishment, relocate regional sewage infrastructure.

Public comment

Steve McGrath – San Mateo County Harbor District

- Recognize the restrictions in the management plan, but these restrictions did not necessarily anticipate the scope and extent of climate change and sea level rise. The management plan

should be revised to include flexibility, within parameters to be determined, to allow for common sense/creative solutions to emerging situations.

- SMCHD currently dealing with effects of shoaling – moorings moving to west, and about to lose access to eastern most boat launch ramps.
- Removal of breakwater not an option; there is a desire/need to preserve/protect access to the coast, to protect and preserve commercial/recreational fishing and boating.

Rex Keyes – surfing

Instead of armoring to protect sand beach, create an artificial reef below the waterline to absorb the force of a wave before it hits a sandy beach.

After lunch, one more new member was sworn in: Christina McGinnis – At-Large alternate.

VII. ACTION ITEM: MANAGEMENT PLAN REVIEW UPDATE

Dawn Hayes gave a presentation on the MPR process schedule changes. She also reviewed the MPR issue topics and which input method they were assigned by the AC. The following MPR issues will be addressed through a council workshop: Sediment Management Plans implementation, beach nourishment, marine debris (non-entanglement), urban run-off, whale entanglement, climate (followed by outside workshop). Outside workshops will address: climate change, outreach on wildlife disturbance, harmful algal blooms. MBMNS Staff will address: artificial reefs, boundary changes, citizen science, desalination implementation, outreach on marine occurrences, Regional WQ Monitoring coordination, original Management Plan (MP) elements. Based on AC recommendations, two working groups will be formed to address the two wildlife disturbance issues: approach issues with whales, acoustic impacts.

Advisory Council Member Discussion

Discussion followed to clarify the MP clearance process and the goals of council workshops. The AC was reminded the MP should focus on what MBNMS can do to address certain issues, not how the issue should be addressed as a whole. The MP can also direct staff to explore certain issues.

The AC was also informed there will not be a working group for MPWCs. 1) The current subcommittee needs to make recommendations on the issue of voluntary safety. 2) Adding new MPWC zones has been looked at extensively. There is not strong interest in adding new zones considering the major concerns with wildlife disturbance.

The following AC members volunteered for the Wildlife Disturbance – approach issues Working Group: Kathy Fosmark, Dan Haifley, Tucker Hirsch, Gary Hoffmann, Christina McGinnis, Paul Reilly, Steve Scheiblauber, PJ Webb. The Chair for this working group is Gary Hoffmann and Vice Chair is Christina McGinnis.

The following AC members volunteered for the Wildlife Disturbance – acoustic issues Working Group: Mike Bekker, Clifton Herrmann, Gary Hoffmann, Rich Hughett, Carol Maehr, Katherine O’Dea, Bart Selby, PJ Webb. The Chair for this working group is Bart Selby.

VI. STANDING ITEM: MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS

Dayna Mathews, NOAA Office of Law Enforcement (OLE): OLE completed recruitment announcements for 59 law enforcement officers nationwide. Nine of those positions will be on the west coast and three of those stationed in California. Review of applications was just completed. They are in the process of establishing a certification list which is what OLE will use to hire the law enforcement officers.

Steve Haddock, Research alternate:

There will be a meeting at the Marina airport on June 28 and 29 organized by University-National Oceanographic Laboratory System (UNOLS) Scientific Committee for Oceanographic Aircraft Research (SCOAR). It will discuss research applications of unmanned aerial vehicles for studying marine environments nationally.

Activities in the Sanctuary Ecologically Significant Areas

1. Mapping AUV operations in SESA #6 (off Santa Cruz); new 1m resolution map
2. MiniROV operations in SESA #6 looking at rare and rebuilding species
3. Two research cruises on the Western Flyer with ROV dives visited Sur Ridge SESA #11. One by Jim Barry with Andrew DeVogelaere and one by Steve Haddock's lab

Tami Grove, California Coastal Commission primary: no new announcements

Clifton Herrmann, College primary: no new announcements

Al Budris, Business/Industry primary: no new announcements

Katherine O'Dea, Conservation primary: Participated in a special showing of climate change documentary *Time to Choose* by filmmaker Charles Ferguson at Osio Theater in Monterey and recommends other members to see the movie. Save Our Shores has coordinated their annual holiday relief campaigns on July 4th and 5th. There will be beach clean ups on the 5th. Visit www.saveourshores.org for more information.

Mike Bekker, Tourism primary: no new announcements

Gary Pezzi, Recreation primary: no new announcements

Kirk Schmidt, Agriculture primary: Pure Water issue – the take of water from Tembladera Slough in a reclamation ditch which reduces the amount of fresh water coming into Moss Landing Harbor is proceeding. Desalination issue - There is mitigation for water being taken out of a 180 foot aquifer which was agreed to in a settlement. A portion of the desalination water will be given as mitigation to Castroville to use as drinking water in lieu of pumping more water out of the aquifer

Gary Hoffmann, At-Large primary: There is a summary of 2016 whale entanglement incidents that will be emailed out to the council. The number of reported whale entanglements for Monterey Bay was 25: 12 were confirmed, 2 successfully disentangled, 1 possible self-release, 1 partially disentangled by fisherman. This data was provided by NMFS. A letter was sent by CDFW to Dungeness crab vessel permit holders to help them understand how they can reduce whale entanglement with their gear. CDFW also provided a best practices guide for the fishermen. The Dungeness crab fishery is a major cause of entanglements.

Dan Haifley, At-Large primary: O'Neill Sea Odyssey 20th anniversary is September 17th. For more information visit <http://oso20th.org>

Brian Nelson, Diving primary:

Newsletter complete and sent to 2,404 contacts on list 6/14/2016.

State of California Parks Department – State Waters reefing projects. – Staff has been researching this element.

Get into your Sanctuary photographic event – Diver call out.

PJ Webb, At-Large primary:

The Coastal Discovery Center held its annual lecture series in Cambria to full capacity crowds. The topics covered included feeding behavior of Northern Elephant Seals, El Nino and La Nina meteorologist presentation, Condor-Cambria connection with update on the newly released Cambria flock, Southern Sea Otter biologist presentation.

“Get into Your Sanctuary Day” will be another kayaking in the San Simeon Cove with business and chamber community invited to get into our Sanctuary on Saturday September 25th.

Snapshot Day was another citizen-science success although some inland sites had no water in the creeks. This is a one day commitment with a separate training day. It is a fun adventure. Think about volunteering in your area!

Tucker Hirsch, Education primary:

The Offset Project is hosting a whale watching brunch with snacks and champagne. It would be a great "special" whale watching trip if you have folks in town or have it on your bucket list to attend. 6/26 10:00-2:00.

If you're curious about the weird row boats that were in the harbor lot at the end of May, those were the boats for Great Pacific Race. Rowing teams of 2 or 4 that are headed for HI. They left Monterey June 4 and have about 15,000 miles left to go!

There is a new magazine launching with a focus on sustainable living on the central coast. Its first issue is in development and should be out in September. This could be a place for information about the Sanctuary, events, etc.

I have been seeing a lot of people smoking on the pier on Wharf II lately. Mostly in the early mornings - they are locals fishing off the pier (and even a city employee). Is there anything sanctuary can do to crack down on this?

Cyndi Dawson, CA Natural Resources Agency primary: Safe Guarding Implementation Plan – this plan being currently updated. Agencies look to this plan as policy guidance. Harmful Algal Blooms (HAB) Working Group – At the last Ocean Protection Council (OPC) meeting, OPC directed staff to convene a HAB task force. MPA Monitoring Program – CNRA received an ongoing baseline allotment of \$2.5 million of general fund money. It is paying for intertidal and subtidal data collection for 2 years in North Central, Central and South Coast regions. It will be led by UCSC. UCSC will present a suite of options to DFW to select site along coast for long-term monitoring. OPC and DFW has partnered with UC Davis to fund three postdoctoral scholars that will be co-mentored between DFW and UC Davis. One of those scholars will be leading the work on completing the statewide action plan for monitoring in close collaboration with experts, scientist and communities across the coast.

Paul Reilly, CDFW primary: The last remaining stretch of coast opened to the Dungeness crab recreational fishery on May 19 and to the commercial fishery on May 26. The recreational season will close July 30 in Humboldt, Del Norte, and Mendocino counties, and on June 30 in all other counties. The commercial season will close July 15 in Humboldt, Del Norte, and Mendocino counties, and on June 30 in all other counties.

Next week the Pacific Fishery Management Council will meet and adopt recommendations for sport and commercial fishing regulation changes for 2017-18.

On May 9 the California Fish and Game Commission announced the hiring of Valerie Termini to serve as its Executive Director. Ms. Termini comes from California Ocean Protection Council staff where she has served as the fisheries policy advisor and as interim Executive Director. Valerie is also a former representative for the Natural Resources Agency on the AC

On May 6 the two vacant Fish and Game Commission seats were filled by Russell Burns, 55, of Napa, and Peter Silva, 63, of Chula Vista. Burns has been business manager at Operating Engineers Local Union 3 since 2006, Silva has been president and chief executive officer at Silva-Silva International since 2011. He served as assistant administrator for water at the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency from 2009 to 2011, senior policy advisor at the Metropolitan Water District of Southern California from 2005 to 2009 and vice chair at the State Water Resources Control Board from 2000 to 2005.

John Hunt, Research primary: Bridget Hoover, Water Quality Protection Program (WQPP) Director held a meeting for the WQPP committee this month. There was good discussion on what should be included in the MPR WQPP action plans. The discussion resulted in good recommendations for the action plans.

Rich Hughett, Recreational Fishing primary: no new announcements

Steve Lindley, NMFS primary: no new announcements

Dave Feliz, Elkhorn Slough NERR: The Tidal Wetland Project held a stakeholder meeting to review the Parsons Sill Project and monitoring efforts, five years after the underwater speed bump was constructed. Feedback was overall positive; recommendations focused on continuing sediment addition projects and better understanding of eutrophication in the slough over raising the height of the sill.

Researchers Dr. Brent Hughes (Research Fellow at the University of California at Santa Cruz-Long Marine Lab) Charlie Endris (ESNERR GIS Specialist), and Kat Beheshti (UC Santa Cruz PhD candidate) completed the first phase of an investigation into the potential effects of sea otters on the success of eelgrass restoration efforts in Elkhorn Slough. Hughes et al. transplanted eelgrass into different areas of the main channel and monitored its health over the course of 1 year. Overall, they measured an average increase in restoration area of 320% and also found that sea otter foraging density (a diet of primarily crabs which feed on algal consumers) predicted early restoration success of eelgrass when effects of eutrophication and consumers can be most critical. These results emphasize the need for incorporating food-web structure into restoration design.

Reserve staff have been preparing for an upcoming grazing project, due to begin July 1. Staff and volunteers have been busy finishing fences on Reserve pastures, collecting plant data to use as part of a before-after-control-impact study, and creating vegetation maps so they can track changes in shrubs and large weeds over time.

Reserve staff together with USFWS surveyed the freshwater wetlands of the Elkhorn Slough Reserve, which are much deeper and more extensive this year than in the past due to rain fall and

improvement implemented by staff. The surveys detected three listed species: Santa Cruz Long-Toed Salamander larvae in one pond, California Tiger Salamander (CTS) larvae in two ponds, and a small adult California Red-Legged Frog in still another pond. CTS were first found on the Reserve last year, and this year they were discovered in two ponds that had not been known to be CTS habitat in the past.

On April 13, the California Coastal Commission found no substantial issue with our eucalyptus removal project. Our coastal development permit is good to go and we will be able to proceed with the removal of 13 acres of eucalyptus trees (~1300 trees) on the Reserve. They will be replaced with Coast Live Oaks.

The Reserve Manager attended a meeting regarding sea otter disturbance (by humans) in the Elkhorn Slough. This has become a significant issue documented by a camera mounted near the harbor mouth. Various ideas were discussed including developing an enforcement detail, closing a beach, fencing off a sea otter loafing area, and buoying off a portion of the harbor where a raft of male otters frequently congregates.

Steve Scheiblauber, Harbors primary: Attended the chain of command ceremony for USCG at the station in Monterey. The outgoing commander had great things to say about sanctuary and the incoming commander is pleased to be in Monterey.

VIII. STANDING ITEM: WORKING GROUP REPORTS

Research Activity Panel (RAP)

John Hunt started by inviting all Advisory Council members to the RAP meetings, which are held on alternate months from the AC meetings. Meeting times and locations are posted on the Advisory Council website. We generally start with a presentation by the host institution, and there is so much fascinating science going on here that these presentations are excellent.

Last month Francisco Chavez of the Monterey Bay Aquarium Research Institute described some of the world class marine research and engineering being done in the sanctuary by MBARI staff. The list included:

- A description of the world's longest time series of marine CO₂ concentrations;
- Visualizations of how the 2015-16 warm water blob and El Nino slowed the local rate of CO₂ increase;
- Advances in wave gliders and other autonomous vehicles that collect data much more efficiently than shipboard surveys;
- The Marine Biodiversity Observation Network that uses advanced environmental DNA analyses to assess biodiversity;
- Interactive web-based tools to display information from MBARIs research;
- Autonomous platforms for water column imaging;
- Integrated time series of MBARI oceanographic data;
- Development of a floating coastal profiling device;
- Wave power harvesting for instruments;
- Sur Ridge Studies (MBARI/MBNMS): corals; mapping; feeding; POC
- Ocean Imaging Project: 2016
- Biodiversity and Bio-optics of Zooplankton

- Lots more.

Here's an announcement that the OCEANS 16 conference will be held at the Portola/Marriott Hotel and Golden State Theater in Monterey, this September 19-23. This event is sponsored by the Marine Technology Society and Oceanic Engineering Society and features hundreds of technical and entertaining presentations and exhibits. For more information see:

<http://www.oceans16mstsieemonterey.org/>

Unfortunately the Sanctuary Currents Symposium will not be held this year. For over 20 years this has been an annual event for researchers, educators, students, and the public to learn about current research being conducted in the Sanctuary. About 300 people usually attended, including dozens of high school students. The Rickett's Award lecture, which was the keynote of this event, will still take place this fall, though the details of the date, venue, etc., are still being worked out.

At our last RAP meeting we honored James Lindholm, who did an exceptional job as RAP chair, and installed our new chair (John Hunt) and vice-chair (Steve Haddock). We will work hard to follow in James' footsteps.

Concurrent with the Management Plan update, the RAP has been particularly focused over the past few meetings discussing recommendations to strengthen long-term monitoring of sanctuary resources. The RAP feels strongly that, as business guru Peter F. Drucker said, "You cannot manage something that is not measured." We will be talking more with Paul and PJ about ways to enhance the gathering and use monitoring data for sanctuary management.

Erica Burton writes detailed summaries of all RAP meetings, and these are posted on the MBNMS website.

Advisory Council Member Discussion

There was discussion about the Sanctuary Symposium not continuing in the future. The event was coordinated mainly by James Lindholm and the IfAME program at CSUMB and it was becoming a difficult task.

Sanctuary Education Panel (SEP)

We had our first SEP meeting on 5/25. It should have been a complete fiasco! Lisa Uttal was all set to give an overview on Sanctuary education programs (with input from Carolyn Skinder) and ended up having to do so remotely due to a family emergency. Thanks to her and Amity's perseverance, they managed through technical difficulties. Then, Amity had some family hiccups herself, and couldn't be there for the MBEE or SEP meeting, and both were held at her COE site and she was the host. Lastly, there was construction on the road where the meeting was held, and caused a massive traffic delay. It took people over an hour to get from the SEC across Highway 1 to COE. Despite this, we had over 12 folks show up, some of whom were new and all seemed pretty eager to be a part of SEP. I need to figure out how to manage the contact list and information now.

We also had our first, full group Fishermen in the Classroom (FIC) meeting, including Rich and Kathy. While we are still figuring out, there seems to be some potential funding sources to get FIC up and running again, but nothing is set in stone.

Advisory Council Member Discussion

There was discussion to clarify the funding requirements and opportunities for the Fishermen in the Classroom program.

Recreation and Tourism Subcommittee (RATS)

- 1) Newsletter completed and sent to 572 contacts on list 5/27/2016
- 2) Need more emails from business owners to better community activity awareness
- 3) Get into your Sanctuary event promo around the area.
- 4) Would like to see flyers at every business – Awareness campaign
- 5) “Friends of the Sanctuary” Program AC discussion agenda date should be set with funding ideas
- 6) Nice to see ONMS Newsletter now online. Should be attached to MBNMS Facebook page as well as Conservation Working Group: no updates

GFNMS Overflight Working Group

The next meeting will be held in July.

Meeting adjourned at 2:52