

MONTEREY BAY NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY ADVISORY COUNCIL

FINAL
October 18, 2012
Cambria Veterans Memorial Building
Cambria, CA

The Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS) Advisory Council met on Thursday, October 18, 2012, in Cambria, California. Public categories and government agencies were present as indicated:

Agriculture: Kirk Schmidt	CA State Parks: Nick Franco
AMBAG: Lynn Robinson	Conservation: Geoff Shester
At Large: Margaret "PJ" Webb	Diving: Phil Sammet
At Large: Kortney Opshaug	Education: Simona Bartl-Absent
At Large: Dick Ely	Commercial Fishing: Kathy Fosmark
Business & Industry: Jim Weisenstein-Absent	Ports & Harbors: Steve Scheiblaue
CA Coastal Commission: Tami Grove-Absent	Recreation: Gary Pezzi
CA Dept. of Fish & Game: Christine Pattison	Recreational Fishing: Rich Hughett
CA EPA: Russ Jeffries	Research: Chris Harrold
CA Resources Agency: Amy Vierra - Absent	Tourism: Mike Bekker

The following non-voting members were present as indicated:

Monterey Bay NMS - Paul Michel
Gulf of the Farallones NMS – Maria Brown-Absent
Channel Islands NMS – Sara Hutto-Absent
National Marine Fisheries Service – Steve Lindley
US Coast Guard – LCDR Brad Soule - Absent

Alternates present in audience:

I. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND MEETING MINUTES

APPROVAL OF 8/16/12 DRAFT MEETING NOTES

The advisory council approved the August 16, 2012 meeting minutes with the following substantive changes:

Page 2 paragraph 2 * after Fish and Game-insert- reported that
Page 2 paragraph 4 * after Mike Bekker, Tourism-insert- announced
* after increase on- insert- water
Page 3 paragraph 2 * after superintendent-insert -reported that
Page 3 Paragraph 4 * delete-that however is needed to make that happen

MOTION: (Passed)

Motion to approve minutes was introduced by Steve Scheiblauber , seconded by Kathy Fosmark.
(Vote: 13 in favor, 0 opposed , 3 abstentions)

II. PUBLIC COMMENT FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

(per comment card)

Joe Racano: Ocean Outfall Group- Issue of interest-Otter tagging

Mary Webb:V.P. Greenspace, Cambria-Update on Cambria's desalination and drilling project from last year-denied by CA Coastal Commission Dec.11, 2011. Also possible new water alternatives being considered for Cambria, should include the elimination of San Simeon's ocean outfall in to Sanctuary waters.

III. ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS/AGENDA TOPICS/COMMENTS

Richard Hughett, Recreational Fishing - announced that he has worked with Peggy Stapp on water proof paper for the Marine Mammal brochure. The brochure lists all of the marine mammals within the sanctuary. It has been updated to include more than the last. Rich would like to distribute them onto the wharfs. He would like to continue to print these for distribution by Fish and Game and others as there is still funding for this.

Philip Sammet, Diving - reported the Blue Ocean film festival was a big hit and had great lectures. Brian Nelson put out a Diver National Marine Sanctuary survey. Hundreds of people have chimed in. Phil feels it is important to see what the diving public thinks about the sanctuary. He recommends we hear a presentation on this. The chamber of Pacific Grove needs help. It is not functioning because of funding issues. It has helped hundreds. There will be activities coming up for you to get involved.

Steve Scheiblauber, Harbors - shares praise for the Blue Ocean film festival. 500-700 people came out for the event. The City of Monterey has started the planning process for the Sustainability plan. They are sharing a grant with Morro Bay. The kick off meeting was September 24 and they will be having a second meeting in the next few weeks. Personal Motorized Water Craft will continue to be an issue for the Sanctuary.

Geoff Shester, Conservation - announced the state of California, has designated the Pacific Leatherback Sea turtle as the California State Marine Reptile as AB1776 was signed by Governor Brown a few weeks ago. Oceana is looking at the opportunity for a sister sanctuary between a new MPA in Indonesia. Oceana, Center for Biological Diversity, and Shark Stewards- petitioned to list white sharks to be designated as an endangered species. Public comment on federal endangered species will be ending November 27. A California Fish and Game Commission forage policy draft was presented by Deb Wilson Vandenberg from the Department of Fish and Game and is up for final adoption on November 7 by the California Fish and Game Commission. The Oceana ROV crew has finished a report focused on the Monterey Bay Sanctuary in regards to the sea floor work

that was done back in 2010. This report is available at http://oceana.org/sites/default/files/reports/Monterey_Bay_Report.pdf

Steve Lindley, National Marine Fisheries - reported South West Fisheries Science Center has a Review team for the white shark to help resolve status of that species.

Lynn Robinson, AMBAG – announced that Mara Twomey is the new Executive Director of AMBAG and is a member of the audience. AMBAG recognizes and appreciates the partnership with the SAC. The Sanctuary Exploration Center is the talk of the town. Tourism is really hopping in Santa Cruz.

Kathy Fosmark, Commercial Fishing - announced that Dr. Karen Forney, a Marine Biologist, is working on a project in the area where the seismic testing could occur to seek the effects on marine mammals. Kathy feels the Sustainability project that Steve mentioned is a good one and will help Morro Bay. Fishermen were very concerned about the leatherback sea turtle being listed as the state marine reptile.

Nick Franco, CA State Parks - commented all state parks are still open despite state budget woes.

Gary Pezzi, Recreation – agreed with Lynn that Santa Cruz tourism is really happening. We need a lot of support to help what we are protecting.

Chris Harrold, Research - reported that the week of the Blue Ocean Film Festival was a very busy week for ocean organizations. A conference was held in regards to the Ocean in a high CO2 world. The American Academy of Science met in Monterey to share new developments using underwater breathing equipment. The Sea Otter exhibit is currently closed. It will open in time for Memorial Day. The restaurant at the Aquarium is also closed for remodeling and will reopen at the same time.

IV. SUPERINTENDENT REPORT

Paul Michel would like to add Phil and Brian's diver survey to the agenda for the next meeting. Another item Paul would like to schedule is the public feedback from the inspiring film *Ocean Frontiers* that was presented at the Blue Ocean Film Festival. The Sanctuary Exploration Center is doing fantastic with the number of attendees over 30,000. There are a lot of requests for events at the property. *Your Sanctuary* TV show is doing very well. The show was kicked off a year ago and the show is now televised in over 30 markets. Paul has been getting emails every week with requests from other locations. The YouTube channel is now seen in 100 countries all over the world. The Regional conference is being held this week in Sacramento for all local TV stations and Paul was asked to give the keynote speech. Additional funding is necessary to keep the show going. The Twentieth Anniversary of MBNMS has been fun and exciting. Paul got to meet some of the pioneers that started the sanctuary recently. We should look ahead where we want to be 20 years from now.

V. COASTAL DISCOVERY CENTER

Caroline Skinder, MBNMS Southern Region Program Coordinator, provided a powerpoint presentation on What's new in Education, Research and Resource Protection .

To view Ms. Skinder's powerpoint presentation, visit

http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/2012/121018/121018southern-mbnms_ppt.pdf

VI. PROPOSED SEISMIC SURVEY FOR PG&E AT DIABLO CANYON

Lisa Ballance, Director Protected Resources Division, NOAA Fisheries, SW Fisheries Science Center, provided a powerpoint presentation on Marine Mammal Research to provide a Scientific Framework for Understanding Impacts associated with the Diablo Canyon Seismic Testing.

To view Ms. Ballance's powerpoint presentation, visit

http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/2012/121018/121018diablo_ppt.pdf

Public Comment: (per comment cards)

- Joey Racano: Ocean Outfall Group
Interest-Seismic Testing
- Mary Webb: V.P. Greenspace, Cambria
Interest-Seismic Testing- oppose project. There are too many issues not addressed, inconsistencies between the State land, EIR and Federal EIS, need for project in question resulting actions from project are nebulous.
- Jeannine Jacobs:
PG&E will not upgrade their plant despite its findings. We must honor our marine life and fishing industry by prohibiting this test method
- Jim Webb: Cambria fishing Club, Cambria, CA
PG&E Seismic Imaging Project-Express opposition to high energy testing plans in Estero Bay as proposed by PG&E. significant and unavoidable impacts to marine life will occur. Mitigation and monitoring only document behavioral responses to the acoustic disturbance.
- Julie Tacker: Concerned citizen
PG&E project-no project alternative is the superior alternative. Risks outweigh the "perceived" benefits.
- Hunter Kilpatrick: Central Coast Director, CA Gray Whale Coalition
Proposed Seismic survey- Incomplete EA has led to incomplete EIAR & IHA. Asking SAC to issue formal statement against proposed tests as documented.
- Carol Georg: Surfrider Foundation
Seismic Testing-Surfrider Foundation is against the proposed seismic testing to danger to public & ecosystem of ocean.
- Marty Brown: Pacific Wildlife Care
Seismic Testing-Do not allow 3-D seismic testing.
- Mandy Davis: C.O.A.S.T. (Citizens opposing Acoustic Seismic Testing) Alliance
PG&E Seismic Testing-into of C.O.A.S.T and relevant info for re-issuing a statement pertinent to the issue.
- Richard E.E. Sadowski: C.O.A.S.T. Alliance
Proposed PG&E Seismic Testing

- Marla Jo Bruton: C.O.A.S.T. Alliance
C.O.A.S.T Alliance position on PG&E proposed project is that there are no amount of mitigation measures that would justify the proposed PG& E project receiving permission to conduct this irrefutably BAD project.
- Tina Dickson: Resident of Cambria, local enviro activist
I am opposed to PG&E's proposed seismic testing for Diablo Canyon Nuclear Facility. I believe that such testing would have extreme harmful impacts to our marine habitat. It is imperative that our agencies, and the public fight to protect the ocean's creatures, not to allow testing procedures that would harm them in devastating ways. The proposed testing would be an aberration to the precious population of our ocean habitat.
- Valerie Bentz: Cambria Citizen & Professor
Seismic Testing-There is a "Catch-22" involved. Agencies such as State Park, can't comment until know parameters-this won't happen until it is approved! Also, there is a slippage in language the testing will not make us safer!
- Eric Greening:
PG&E Seismic Testing-opposed to project, State lands overriding considerations. Flawed and would set terrible precedent for unlimited law breaking Endangered Species Act, Marine Mammal Protection Act, etc.
- Crystal Baker: Coastal Band of the Chumash Nation
PG&E seismic testing-protection and preserving Marine Life & Cultural resources.
- Stephen Benavides: Recreational Abalone Advisory Committee (DFG)
Seismic Testing
- Susan Belany:
Seismic study - not knowing the impact is not a reason to begin seismic testing.
- Jeff Hellman:
Sea Life

VII. LUNCH

VIII. WORKING GROUP UPDATES

Conservation Working Group (CWG) – Geoff Shester

The CWG met October 5 in Moss Landing. A number of folks attended the meeting in addition to the working group. The CWG discussed next steps for the Forage white paper. They recommend the package of the Forage Species white paper, along with the comments from Steve Scheiblaue and Dr. Parrish, be forwarded to the Superintendent. They are not asking for approval from the SAC at this time and recommend drafting a resolution at the December SAC meeting. The working group had a presentation from MBNMS staff on Ecologically Significant Areas. The CWG supports the release of the SESA draft document for the SAC and public review. The CWG invites all other SAC member to participate in the working group. They will do a much better job informing the SAC of upcoming meetings.

Research Activities Panel (RAP) – Chris Harrold

In aftermath of review of the CWG's Forage Species white paper, Chris commented we need a better process. The Channel Islands writes papers and does not go through the review process that we do. Channel Islands will not provide us with a good model of what we need to do to figure out our own procedure for the working group. Chris asked if we can clarify what the working group is supposed to do. What are the mutual expectations? We would like to get some advice from the SAC for a better process. Paul announced the staff is going to work on clarifying the issue for the SAC and set this up for a discussion on the next agenda.

IX. FORAGE SPECIES-REVISED CONSERVATION WORKING GROUP WHITE PAPER

Discussion - The SAC agreed the Forage Species white paper should be acknowledged. Forage species is an important and relevant issue. They also agreed that it was a tremendous effort from the CWG to write the paper. Several expressed concern with support for the white paper. Steve Scheiblaue, Harbors, submitted comments on the paper. Geoff Shester wanted to see an organic effort instead of just the working group putting this out there and the CWG would like to see a resolution. Steve Scheiblaue made a motion to develop a letter to the Fish and Game Commission and Pacific Fisheries Management Council, thanking them for the management actions they have taken in regards to forage species.

Kathy Fosmark seconded the motion and stated the Sanctuary should rely on development by use of appropriate fishery management. Geoff Shester sought to amend the motion to also convene a subcommittee that would craft a resolution based on the general importance of forage species. Russ Jeffries stated the Geoff could not amend the motion and Chair Schmidt did not allow Geoff to propose an amendment to the main motion. Geoff raised concerns with the violation of Roberts' Rules of Order. Motion passed to write a letter.

Motion: (Passed)

Motion to write a letter introduced by Steve Scheiblaue, seconded by Kathy Fosmark
(Vote: 14 in favor, 1 Opposed, 1 Abstention)

Public comment-(per comment card)

Richard Parrish - retired Fisheries Biologist
Forage fish - discussion of Federal Fishery Management

X. WEST COAST SANCTUARY ADVISORY COUNCIL CHAIRS MEETING

Kirk reported on the SAC chairs meeting and conference call with ONMS and other SAC chairs. The topic was "Campaign of Engagement." The meeting was to encourage more tourism engagement in Sanctuaries. Kirk commented we have already done many things to help tourism and we have received kudos for our work. Each sanctuary gave a presentation of what they are doing and their issues. Universally, there is an overwhelming need to make ocean acidification a topic of concern with the public. A list of actions was developed. Kirk felt the most significant point of the meeting was learning from successes and mistakes instead of reinventing the wheel.

The December Summit SAC Chairs meeting will be held in Santa Cruz. It will be great to show off the Sanctuary Exploration Center.

Paul felt the campaign objective is about explaining to the public, the value of sanctuaries. One of the ultimate goals (per the NMSA) is to create more National Marine Sanctuaries.

There is a list of 19 West Coast Priorities. We need to build some of these top priorities into our calendar on what we can do next year. Paul went through the list and explained the 19 priorities. Paul felt some are more attainable than others. Paul wants to create a feedback mechanism for the SAC and to bring this back at the next meeting. The SAC felt some of the priorities would be much more costly than others to accomplish.

XI. MARINE LIFE PROTECTION ACT UPDATE

Christine Pattison, California Department of Game and Fish, provided a powerpoint presentation on the Marine Life Protection Act. To view Ms. Pattison's presentation, visit http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/2012/121018/121018mlpa_ppt.pdf

Public Comment-(per comment cards)

Jim Webb - Cambria Fishing Club

MLPA update - Note the five year anniversary of implementation along the central coast.

Predictions of economic collapse in local fisheries have proven to be unfounded. Increases in local tourism for elephant seal viewing are well documented. After five years, something to celebrate!

XII. ADVISORY COUNCIL CALENDAR REVIEW

delayed until the next meeting

XIII. ADJOURN

Submitted by Jackie Sommers, Sanctuary Advisory Council Coordinator.
was adjourned at 4:35PM

Meeting